



STATE OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211

## Notice of Decision

Decision Date: April 22, 2016

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]  
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000005818



Dear [REDACTED],

On March 17, 2016, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's March 4, 2016 eligibility determination.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:  
NY State of Health Appeals  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211
- Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the NY State of Health Account ID at the top of this notice.

### Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

This page intentionally left blank.



STATE OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211

## Decision

Decision Date: April 22, 2016

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]  
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000005818



## Issues

The issues presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health are:

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were eligible to receive up to \$254.00 per month in advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC), effective April 1, 2016?

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were eligible for cost-sharing reductions (CSR), effective April 1, 2016?

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were not eligible for Essential Plan coverage, effective April 1, 2016?

## Procedural History

On December 29, 2015, NY State of Health (NYSOH) received your updated application for health insurance. That day, a preliminary eligibility determination was prepared with regard to the last application, stating that you were eligible for the Essential Plan, effective February 1, 2016.

Also on December 29, 2015, you contacted NYSOH's Account Review Unit and requested an appeal of that preliminary eligibility determination.

On December 30, 2015, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination stating that you were eligible for the Essential Plan, effective February 1, 2016.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Also on December 30, 2015, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice confirming your enrollment in Essential Plan coverage, effective February 1, 2016.

On March 4, 2016, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination which stated that you were eligible for APTC of up to \$254.00 per month, effective April 1, 2016, and eligible for CSR if you enrolled in a silver level qualifying health plan, effective April 1, 2016. That same notice stated that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan because, in order to be eligible for the Essential Plan, you must not be eligible to enroll in other coverage, and have an annual income below \$23,540.00.

On March 17, 2016, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. During the hearing, the issue on appeal was amended to include the March 4, 2016 eligibility determination notice, in place of the December 30, 2015 eligibility determination that found you eligible for the Essential Plan. This March 4, 2016 notice stated that you were eligible for APTC of up to \$254.00 per month, and eligible for CSR, effective April 1, 2016. The record was developed during the hearing and closed at the end of the hearing.

## **Findings of Fact**

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) You testified that you expect to file your 2016 taxes with a tax filing status of single. You will claim no dependents on that tax return.
- 2) You are seeking insurance for yourself.
- 3) You testified that you are appealing because you want to be eligible for the Essential Plan, as you feel that the cost of coverage with the level of APTC and CSR you were found eligible for is not affordable.
- 4) The application that was submitted on March 3, 2016 listed annual household income of \$24,000.00, consisting entirely of earned income. You testified that this amount was correct.
- 5) You testified that you have regular expenses such as rent.
- 6) Your application states that you will not be taking any deductions on your 2016 tax return, and your testimony confirmed this.
- 7) Your application states that you live in Nassau County.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

## **Applicable Law and Regulations**

### Advance Payments of Premium Tax Credit

Advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC) are generally available to a person who is eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan (QHP) and (1) expects to have a household income between 138% and 400% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL), (2) expects to file a tax return and claim a personal exemption deduction for a person who meets the eligibility requirements to enroll in a QHP, and (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market (see 45 CFR § 155.305(f), 42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)).

The maximum amount of APTC that can be authorized equals:

- 1) the cost of the health insurance premium for the taxpayer's coverage family in the second lowest cost silver plan offered through NY State of Health in the county where the taxpayer resides

*minus*

- 2) the taxpayer's expected contribution amount

(see 26 USC § 36B, 26 CFR § 1.36B-3).

The taxpayer's expected contribution amount is the amount that the taxpayer is expected to spend on health insurance premiums. The expected contribution for 2016 is set by federal law at 2.03% to 9.66% of household income (26 USC § 36B(b)(3)(A), 26 CFR § 1.36B-3T(g)(1), IRS Rev. Proc. 2014-37, IRS Rev. Proc. 2014-62).

In an analysis of APTC eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR §§ 155.300(a), 155.305(f)(1)(i)). On the date of your application, that was the 2015 FPL, which is \$11,770.00 for a one-person household (80 Fed. Reg. 3236, 3237).

For annual household income in the range of at least 200% but less than 250% of the 2015 FPL, the expected contribution is between 6.41 % and 8.18% of the household income (26 CFR § 1.36B-3T(g)(1), 45 CFR § 155.300(a), IRS Rev. Proc. 2014-37, IRS Rev. Proc. 2014-62).

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

## Cost-Sharing Reductions

Cost-sharing reductions (CSR) are available to a person who (1) is eligible to enroll in a QHP through NYSOH, (2) meets the requirements to receive APTC, (3) is expected to have an annual household income that does not exceed 250% of the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested, and (4) is enrolled in a silver-level QHP (45 CFR § 155.300(a), 45 CFR § 155.305(g)(1)).

## Essential Plan

NYSOH must generally determine an applicant eligible for the Essential Plan, a basic health plan, if the person is (1) a resident of New York State, (2) expects to have a household income between 138% and 200% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL) or, in the case of an individual who is a lawfully present non-citizen who is ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus as a result of their immigration status, has a household income that is between 0% and 200% of the FPL, (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market, (4) is 64 years old or younger, (5) is a citizen or a lawfully present non-citizen, and (6) is not incarcerated (see 42 CFR § 600.305, 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4), 45 CFR § 155.305(e), N.Y. Soc. Serv. Law § 369-gg(3), 42 USC § 18051).

In an analysis of Essential Plan eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL for the first day of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). On the date of your application, that was the 2015 FPL, which is \$11,770.00 for a one-person household (80 Fed. Reg. 3236, 3237).

## **Legal Analysis**

The first issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were eligible for an APTC of up to \$254.00 per month, effective April 1, 2016.

The application that was submitted on March 3, 2016 listed an annual household income of \$24,000.00, and the eligibility determination relied upon that information. You testified to having expenses such as rent, however, NYSOH determines your eligibility for financial assistance based on your modified adjusted gross income, and rent and everyday expenses are not considered when calculating this figure.

You are in a one-person household. You expect to file your 2016 income taxes as single and will claim zero dependents on that tax return.

You reside in Nassau County, where the second lowest cost silver plan available for an individual subscriber through NYSOH costs \$385.23 per month.

An annual income of \$24,000.00 is 203.91% of the 2015 FPL for one-person household. At 203.91% of the FPL, the expected contribution to the cost of the health insurance premium is 6.55% of income, or \$131.00 per month.

The maximum amount of APTC that can be approved equals the cost of the second lowest cost silver plan available through NYSOH for an individual subscriber in your county (\$385.23 per month) minus your expected contribution (\$131.00 per month), which equals \$254.23 per month. Therefore, rounding to the nearest dollar, NYSOH correctly determined you to be eligible for up to \$254.00 per month in APTC.

The second issue under review is whether you were properly found eligible for CSRs. CSRs are available to a person who has a household income no greater than 250% of the FPL. Since a household income of \$24,000.00 is 203.91% of the applicable FPL, NYSOH correctly found you to be eligible for CSR if you enroll in a silver level plan.

The third issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan, effective April 1, 2016.

The Essential Plan is provided through NYSOH to individuals who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income (MAGI) that is between 138% and 200% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was \$11,770.00 for a one-person household. Since an annual household income of \$24,000.00 is 203.91% of the 2015 FPL, NYSOH properly found you to be not eligible for the Essential Plan.

Since the March 4, 2016 eligibility determination properly stated that, based on the information you provided, you were eligible for up to \$254.00 per month in APTC effective April 1, 2016, eligible for CSR effective April 1, 2016, and not eligible for the Essential Plan, it is correct and is AFFIRMED.

## **Decision**

The March 4, 2016 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

**Effective Date of this Decision:** April 22, 2016

## **How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility**

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

You remain eligible for up to \$254.00 in APTC, effective April 1, 2016.

You are eligible for cost-sharing reductions if you enroll in a silver level QHP, effective April 1, 2016.

You are not eligible for the Essential Plan as of your March 3, 2016 application.

### **If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)**

This Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to U.S. Department of Health and Human Services or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months after the date of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. This must be done within 30 days of the date of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

### **If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):**

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:  
NY State of Health Appeals  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211
- By fax: 1-855-900-5557

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).



## **Summary**

The March 4, 2016 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

You remain eligible for up to \$254.00 in APTC, effective April 1, 2016.

You are eligible for cost-sharing reductions if you enroll in a silver level QHP, effective April 1, 2016.

You are not eligible for the Essential Plan as of your March 3, 2016 application.

## **Legal Authority**

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

**A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:**

