

STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Notice of Decision

Decision Date: May 9, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID:

Appeal Identification Number: AP00000014002



Dear ,

On March 24, 2017, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's November 30, 2016 eligibility determination.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the NY State of Health Account ID at the top of this notice.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.



STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Decision

Decision Date: May 9, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID:

Appeal Identification Number: AP00000014002



Issues

The issues presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health are:

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were eligible to receive up to \$277.00 per month in advance payments of the premium tax credit, effective January 1, 2017?

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were eligible for costsharing reductions?

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan?

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were not eligible for Medicaid?

Procedural History

On October 24, 2016, NY State of Health (NYSOH) received your updated application for financial assistance with health insurance.

On October 25, 2016, NYSOH issued a notice stating that the income information in your application did not match federal and state data sources. This notice further directed you to submit proof of your income by November 8, 2016, and proof of your citizenship status by January 22, 2017.

On October 31, 2016, you uploaded two documents to your NYSOH account.

On November 10, 2016, NYSOH verified and validated your citizenship document, but invalidated the income document you uploaded on October 31, 2016.

On November 11, 2016, NYSOH issued a notice stating that the documentation that you uploaded to your account did not confirm the information in your application. This notice further directed you to submit more income documentation by November 23, 2016.

On November 14, 2016, you uploaded additional income documentation to your NYSOH account.

On November 28, 2016, NYOSH verified and validated the income documentation you uploaded on November 14, 2016.

On November 29, 2016, NYOSH updated your income information and ran a new application.

On November 30, 2016, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility determination stating that you were eligible to receive up to \$277.00 in advanced premium tax credits (APTC) and eligible to receive cost-sharing reductions if you enrolled in a silver level qualified health plan, effective January 1, 2017. That notice also stated that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan or Medicaid because your income was over the allowable income limits for those programs.

On December 14, 2016, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed the eligibility determination insofar as you were not found eligible for the Essential Plan or Medicaid.

On March 24, 2017, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and held open to April 7, 2017, to allow you to submit supporting documents.

As of April 7, 2017, the Appeals Unit did not receive any additional documents from you and no new documents were viewable in your NYSOH account.

On April 26, 2017, the Appeals Unit received a six-page document from you. One of the pages was a confirmation that the fax machine was busy on April 7, 2017 when you attempted to fax the documents. Since you provided sufficient proof that you tried to submit additional documentation before the close of the record, the Hearing Officer will allow them into the record. The requested documentation was incorporated into the record as Appellant's Exhibit #1, and the record was closed that day.

Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) You are seeking insurance for yourself.
- 2) You testified that you expect to file your 2017 taxes with a tax filing status of single. You will claim no dependents on that tax return.
- 3) The application that was submitted on October 24, 2016 listed an annual household income of \$15,600.00, consisting of income you earn from your employment.
- 4) On October 31, 2016, you uploaded your U.S. Passport and one biweekly paystub dated October 19, 2016 to your NYOSH account.
- 5) On November 10, 2016, NYSOH invalidated your biweekly paystub because it did not reflect a month's worth of income.
- 6) On November 14, 2016, you uploaded two biweekly paystubs to your account dated October 19, 2016 and November 2, 2016.
- 7) On November 29, 2016, NYSOH validated your paystubs. NYSOH updated your annual household income from \$15,600.00 to \$27,978.86 and a new application was run.
- 8) You provided documentation that your monthly income for November 2016 was \$3,365.97.
- 9) Your application states that you will not be taking any deductions on your 2017 tax return.
- 10) Your application states that you live in Bronx County.
- 11) You testified that you think your living expenses should be deducted from your household income.
- 12) You further testified that you would like to be found eligible for the Essential Plan or Medicaid because you cannot afford your health insurance premium after you pay your living expenses.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

Applicable Law and Regulations

Advance Payments of Premium Tax Credit

Advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC) are generally available to a person who is eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan (QHP) and (1) expects to have a household income between 138% and 400% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL), (2) expects to file a tax return and claim a personal exemption deduction for a person who meets the eligibility requirements to enroll in a QHP, and (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market (see 45 CFR § 155.305(f), 42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)).

The maximum amount of APTC that can be authorized equals:

1) the cost of the health insurance premium for the taxpayer's coverage family in the second lowest cost silver plan offered through NY State of Health in the county where the taxpayer resides

minus

2) the taxpayer's expected contribution amount

(see 26 USC § 36B, 26 CFR § 1.36B-3).

The taxpayer's expected contribution amount is the amount that the taxpayer is expected to spend on health insurance premiums. The expected contribution for 2017 is set by federal law at 2.04% to 9.69% of household income (26 USC § 36B(b)(3)(A), 26 CFR § 1.36B-3T(g)(1), IRS Rev. Proc.2016-24).

In an analysis of APTC eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR §§ 155.300(a), 155.305(f)(1)(i)). On the date of your application, that was the 2016 FPL, which is \$11,880.00 for a one -person household (81 Federal Register 4036).

For annual household income in the range of at least 200% but less than 250% of the 2016 FPL, the expected contribution for 2017 is between 6.43% and 8.21% of the household income (26 CFR § 1.36B-3T(g)(1), 45 CFR § 155.300(a), IRS Rev. Proc. 2016-24).

People who use the APTC to help pay health insurance premiums must file a federal tax return and reconcile their expected income (stated on NYSOH application) with their actual income (stated on their federal income tax return). Those who take less tax credit in advance than they claim on the tax return may get the rest of it as an income tax refund or have their tax bill reduced. Those

who take more tax credit in advance than they can claim on their tax return will owe the difference as additional income taxes (26 CFR § 1.36B-4).

Cost-Sharing Reductions

Cost-sharing reductions (CSR) are available to a person who (1) is eligible to enroll in a QHP through NYSOH, (2) meets the requirements to receive APTC, (3) is expected to have an annual household income that does not exceed 250% of the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested, and (4) is enrolled in a silver-level QHP (45 CFR § 155.300(a), 45 CFR § 155.305(g)(1)).

Essential Plan

NYSOH must generally determine an applicant eligible for the Essential Plan, a basic health plan, if the person is (1) a resident of New York State, (2) expects to have a household income between 138% and 200% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL) or, in the case of an individual who is a lawfully present noncitizen who is ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus as a result of their immigration status, has a household income that is between 0% and 200% of the FPL, (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market, (4) is 64 years old or younger, (5) is a citizen or a lawfully present non-citizen, and (6) is not incarcerated (see 42 CFR § 600.305, 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4), 45 CFR § 155.305(e), NY Social Services Law § 369-gg(3), 42 USC § 18051).

In an analysis of Essential Plan eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL in effect on the first day of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). On the date of your application, that was the 2016 FPL, which is \$11,880.00 for a one-person household (81 Fed. Reg. 4036.).

A person who has a household income that is at or below 150% of the FPL has a \$0.00 premium contribution (New York's Basic Health Plan Blueprint, p. 21, as approved January 2016; see https://www.medicaid.gov/basic-health-program.html).

A person who has a household income greater than 150% of the FPL or below 200% of the FPL has a \$20.00 per month premium contribution (New York's Basic Health Plan Blueprint, as approved January 2016).

The Essential Plan is considered minimum essential coverage therefore, a person who is eligible for the Essential Plan is not eligible for any premium tax credit because they are eligible for minimum essential coverage through the individual market (see 26 CFR § 1.36B-2(c)(1), 26 USC § 5000A(f)(1)(C)).

Medicaid

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults who: (1) are age 19 or older and under age 65, (2) are not pregnant, (3) are not entitled to or enrolled for Medicare benefits under part A or B of title XVIII of the Act, (4) are not otherwise eligible for and enrolled for mandatory coverage under a State's Medicaid State plan in accordance with subpart B of this part, and (5) have a household modified adjusted gross income (MAGI) that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size (42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)), NY Social Services Law § 366(1)(b)).

In an analysis of Medicaid eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL "for the applicable budget period used to determine an individual's eligibility" (42 CFR § 435.4). On the date of your application, that was the 2016 FPL, which is \$11,880.00 for a one-person household (81 Fed. Reg. 4036).

Financial eligibility for Medicaid for applicants who are not currently receiving Medicaid benefits is based on current monthly household income and family size (42 CFR § 435.603(h)(1); State Plan Amendment (SPA) 13-0055-MM3, as approved March 19, 2014).

Modified Adjusted Gross Income

NYSOH bases its eligibility determinations on modified adjusted gross income as defined in the federal tax code (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). The term "modified adjusted gross income" means adjusted gross income increased by (1) any income that was excluded under 26 USC § 911 for United States citizens or residents living abroad, (2) tax-exempt interest received or accrued, and (3) Social Security benefits that were excluded from gross income under 26 USC § 86 (see 26 USC § 36B(d)(2)(B), 26 CFR § 1.36B-1(e)(2)).

"Adjusted gross income" means, in the case of an individual taxpayer, gross federal taxable income minus certain specific deductions, such as expenses reimbursed by an employer, losses from sale or exchange of property, losses from premature withdrawal of finds from time savings accounts, deductions attributable to royalties, and certain retirement savings (26 USC § 62(a)). Living expenses, such as rent and utilities are not an allowable deduction in computing adjusted gross income.

Affordability Exemption

Under some circumstances, a person may receive an exemption from paying a penalty for not purchasing health insurance coverage. Such an exemption may be granted if that person can show that he or she experienced a financial hardship or has domestic circumstances that (1) caused an unexpected increase in essential expenses that prevented that person from obtaining health coverage

under a QHP; (2) would have caused the person to experience serious deprivation of food, shelter, clothing, or other necessities, as a result of the expense of purchasing health coverage under a QHP; or (3) prevented that person from obtaining coverage under a QHP (45 CFR § 155.605(a), (g)).

NYSOH has deferred to the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) on the matter of hardship exemptions (see 45 CFR § 155.505(c)).

Legal Analysis

The first issue is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were eligible for an APTC of up to \$277.00 per month.

For individuals whose income is needed to calculate eligibility, NYOSH must request data that will allow NYOSH to verify the individuals household income.

If NYOSH cannot verify the income information required to determine eligibility, it must attempt to resolve the inconsistency by giving the applicant the opportunity to submit satisfactory documentary evidence.

On October 24, 2016, NYOSH received your updated application for financial assistance with health insurance.

On October 25, 2016, NYSOH issued a notice stating that the information in your application did not match federal and state data sources. This notice further directed you to submit income documentation by November 8, 2016.

On October 31, 2016, you uploaded one biweekly paystub dated October 19, 2016 to your NYSOH account.

On November 10, 2016, NYSOH invalidated the October 19, 2016 paystub because it did not reflect a month's worth of income. As a result, on November 11, 2016, NYSOH issued a notice stating that the documentation that you uploaded to your account did not confirm the information in your application. This notice further directed you to submit more income documentation by November 23, 2016.

On November 14, 2016, you uploaded two biweekly paystubs dated October 19, 2016 and November 2, 2016 to your NYOSH account. The October 19, 2016 had a gross pay of \$1092.13, and the November 2, 2016 paystub had a gross pay of \$1060.09.

On November 28, 2016, NYOSH verified and validated the income documentation you uploaded on November 14, 2016. NYSOH subsequently

updated your annual household income amount from \$15,600.00 to \$27,978.86 based on the pay stubs submitted and a new application was submitted.

The application that was submitted on November 29, 2016 listed an annual household income of \$27,978.86 and the eligibility determination relied upon that information.

During the hearing, you testified that the income amount in your application was too high. However, you submitted paystubs which show your gross annual income amount as of November 30, 2016 was \$28,809.39 and you testified that you expect your annual income for 2017 to be about the same.

You also asked that your current expenses, which include rent, electricity, and other living expenses, be considered when calculating your annual household income.

Since the Internal Revenue Service rules do not allow living expenses such as rent, utilities, cable, and phone to be deducted from the calculation of your adjusted gross income, they cannot be deducted when the NYSOH computes your modified adjusted gross income for APTC purposes. Therefore, NYSOH correctly determined your household income to be \$27,978.86.

You are in a one-person household. You expect to file your 2017 income taxes as single and will claim no dependents on that tax return.

You reside in Bronx County, where the second lowest cost silver plan available for an individual through NYSOH costs \$456.46 per month.

An annual income of \$27,978.86 is 235.51% of the 2016 FPL for a one-person household. At 235.51% of the FPL, the expected contribution to the cost of the health insurance premium is 7.69% of income, or \$179.30 per month.

The maximum amount of APTC that can be approved equals the cost of the second lowest cost silver plan available through NYSOH for an individual in your county (\$456.46 per month) minus your expected contribution (\$179.30 per month), which equals \$277.16 per month. Therefore, rounding to the nearest dollar, NYSOH correctly determined you to be eligible for up to \$277.00 per month in APTC.

The second issue is whether you were properly found eligible for cost-sharing reductions.

Cost-sharing reductions are available to a person who has a household income no greater than 250% of the FPL. Since a household income of \$27,979.00 is 235.51% of the applicable FPL, NYSOH correctly found you to be eligible for cost sharing reductions.

The third issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were ineligible for the Essential Plan.

The Essential Plan is provided through NYSOH to individuals who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is between 138% and 200% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was \$11,880.00 for a one-person household. Since an annual household income of \$27,979.00 is 235.51% of the 2016 FPL, NYSOH properly found you ineligible for the Essential Plan.

The fourth issue is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were ineligible for Medicaid.

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults between the ages of 19 and 65 who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was \$11,880.00 for a one-person household. Since \$27,979.00 is 235.51% of the 2016 FPL, NYSOH properly found you to be ineligible for Medicaid on an expected annual income basis, using the information provided in your application.

However, financial eligibility for Medicaid for applicants who are not currently receiving Medicaid benefits is based on current monthly household income and family size.

To be eligible for Medicaid, you would need to meet the non-financial criteria and have an income no greater than 138% of the FPL, which is \$1,367.00 per month for a one-person household.

You submitted documentation that shows in November 2016 you received \$3,365.97.

Since the documentation you provided shows that you earned \$3,365.97 in November 2016, you do not qualify for Medicaid based on your monthly income as of the date of your November 29, 2016 application.

Since the November 30, 2016 eligibility determination properly stated that, based on the information you provided, you were eligible for up to \$277.00 per month in APTC, eligible for cost-sharing reductions, ineligible for the Essential Plan and ineligible for Medicaid, it is correct and is AFFIRMED.

You testified that you cannot afford to pay for health insurance even with subsidies, which may qualify you for an exemption. If you wish to be considered for a hardship exemption, which would exempt you from paying a penalty for not

having health insurance during 2017, you can check the Federal Marketplace website (www.healthcare.gov) for direction.

Decision

The November 30, 2016 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

Effective Date of this Decision: May 9, 2017

How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

You remain eligible for up to \$277.00 in APTC.

You were properly determined eligible for cost-sharing reductions.

You were properly determined ineligible for the Essential Plan.

You were properly determined ineligible for Medicaid.

If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

This Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

Health Insurance Marketplace Attn: Appeals 465 Industrial Blvd. London, KY 40750-0061

• By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

• By fax: 1-855-900-5557

Summary

The November 30, 2016 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

You remain eligible for up to \$277.00 in APTC.

You were properly determined eligible for cost-sharing reductions.

You were properly determined ineligible for the Essential Plan.

You were properly determined ineligible for Medicaid.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:



Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

Español (Spanish)

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。 如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助,請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件,请打电话至 **1-855-355-5777**。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

한국어 (Korean)

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

(Arabic)العربية

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 5777-355-455-1. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجانًا.

□□□□□ (Bengali)

Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्त्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई निःशुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छों।

Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

Twi (Twi)

Krataa yi yε tow krataa a ho hia. Sε wo hia εho nkyerεkyerεmu a, yε srε wo, frε 1-855-355-5777. yEbEtumi ama wo obi a ɔkyerε kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

اردو(Urdu<u>)</u>

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم5777-355-485-1 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

אידיש (Yiddish)

טיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך	דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארש געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.