



STATE OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211

## Notice of Decision

Decision Date: July 19, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]  
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000016260

[REDACTED]

Dear [REDACTED]

On June 12, 2017, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's verbal denial of a special enrollment period.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:  
NY State of Health Appeals  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211
- Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the Account ID at the top of this notice.

### Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

This page intentionally left blank.



STATE OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211

## Decision

Decision Date: July 19, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]  
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000016260

[REDACTED]

## Issue

The issue presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health is:

Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly determine that you did not qualify to enroll in a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period?

## Procedural History

On November 3, 2016, NYSOH received your application for health insurance.

On November 4, 2016, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were eligible to receive up to \$105.00 in advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC), effective January 1, 2017, for a limited time.

On December 13, 2016, NYSOH issued a modification of this eligibility determination notice, stating that you were not eligible to receive APTC, effective January 1, 2017.

You selected a qualified health plan, and your enrollment became effective January 1, 2017.

On February 27, 2017, you attempted to change your enrollment to a different qualified health plan, but NYSOH's customer service representative refused to allow you to do so.

On that same date, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed NYSOH's refusal to allow you to change your enrollment outside of the open enrollment period.

On February 28, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice to confirm your appeal request from the previous day. That notice stated that the reason for your appeal was "denial of Special Enrollment Period (SEP)."

On June 12, 2017, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and held open up until June 26, 2017, to allow you to submit supporting documents.

The documents were subsequently received, and the record was closed.

## **Findings of Fact**

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) You testified that you are appealing the refusal of NYSOH to allow you to change your enrollment outside of the open enrollment period.
- 2) On November 3, 2016, you submitted an application for health insurance, and were subsequently enrolled in a health plan that would begin coverage on January 1, 2017.
- 3) On February 27, 2017, you attempted to change your enrollment to a different qualified health plan, but NYSOH's customer service representative refused to allow you to do so.
- 4) You testified that you lost prior health insurance coverage, which you had obtained outside of NYSOH, effective December 31, 2016, because that carrier would not be offering individual coverage any more. Because your prior health plan had advised you that it would no longer cover you after December 31, 2016, you contacted NYSOH before your coverage ended to get health insurance for the upcoming year. The representative who assisted you assured you that your doctor would accept the plan. However, you later learned that no doctor you could find would accept that plan.
- 5) You testified that on February 27, 2017, you called NYSOH to change your plan, and were told that you would not be able to change your plan.
- 6) On June 21, 2017, the Appeals Unit of NYSOH received your documentation from your former health plan, showing that your coverage ended on December 31, 2016.

- 7) NYSOH failed to issue a formal denial of your request to change your plan or any request for a special enrollment period.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

## **Applicable Law and Regulations**

### De Novo Review

NYSOH Appeals Unit must review each appeal de novo and “consider all relevant facts and evidence adduced during the appeals process” (45 CFR § 155.535(f)). “De novo review means a review of an appeal without deference to prior decisions in the case” (45 CFR § 155.500).

### Enrollment in a Qualified Health Plan

NYSOH must provide annual open enrollment periods during which time qualified individuals may enroll in a qualified health plan and enrollees may change qualified health plans (45 CFR § 155.410(a)(1)).

For the benefit year beginning on January 1, 2017, the annual open enrollment period began on November 1, 2016, and extended through January 31, 2017 (45 CFR § 155.410(e)(2)).

### Special Enrollment Periods

After each open enrollment period ends, NYSOH provides special enrollment periods to qualified individuals. During a special enrollment period, a qualified individual may enroll in a qualified health plan, and an enrollee may change their enrollment to another plan. This is generally permitted when one of the following triggering events occur:

- (1) The qualified individual or his or her dependent either:
  - (i) Loses minimum essential coverage.
  - (ii) Is enrolled in any non-calendar year group health plan or individual health insurance coverage, even if the qualified individual or his or her dependent has the option to renew such coverage.
  - (iii) Loses pregnancy-related coverage.

(iv) Loses medically needy coverage as described under section 1902(a)(10)(C) of the Social Security Act only once per calendar year.

(2)(i) The qualified individual gains a dependent or becomes a dependent through marriage, birth, adoption, placement for adoption, or placement in foster care, or through a child support order or other court order.

(ii) the enrollee loses a dependent or is no longer considered a dependent through divorce or legal separation as defined by State law in the State in which the divorce or legal separation occurs, or if the enrollee, or his or her dependent, dies.

(3) The qualified individual, or his or her dependent, becomes newly eligible for enrollment in a qualified health plan because he or she gains citizenship, status as a national, or lawful presence, or is no longer incarcerated.

(4) The qualified individual's or his or her dependent's, enrollment or non-enrollment in a qualified health plan is unintentional, inadvertent, or erroneous and is the result of the error, misrepresentation, misconduct, or inaction of an officer, employee, or agent of NYSOH, its instrumentalities, or a non-NYSOH entity providing enrollment assistance or conducting enrollment activities.

(5) The enrollee or, his or her dependent adequately demonstrates to NYSOH that the qualified health plan in which he or she is enrolled substantially violated a material provision of its contract in relation to the enrollee;

(6) The enrollee or enrollee's dependent is newly eligible or ineligible for advance payments of the premium tax credit, or change in eligibility for cost-sharing reductions.

(7) The qualified individual or enrollee, or his or her dependent, gains access to new qualified health plan as a result of a permanent move and either—

(i) Had minimum essential coverage for one or more days during the 60 days preceding the date of the permanent move, or

(ii) Was living outside of the United States or in a United States territory at the time of the permanent move;

(8) The qualified individual or dependent who gains or maintains status as an Indian may enroll in a qualified health plan or change from one plan to another, once per month.

(9) The qualified individual or enrollee, or his or her dependent, demonstrates to the Exchange, in accordance with guidelines issued by HHS, that the individual meets other exceptional circumstances as the Exchange may provide;

(10) A qualified individual or enrollee—

(i) Is a victim of domestic abuse or spousal abandonment, including a dependent or unmarried victim within a household, is enrolled in minimum essential coverage and seeks to enroll in coverage separate from the perpetrator of the abuse or abandonment; or

(ii) Is a dependent of a victim of domestic abuse or spousal abandonment, on the same application as the victim, may enroll in coverage at the same time as the victim;

(11) A qualified individual or dependent—

(i) Applies for coverage through NYSOH during the annual open enrollment period or due to a qualifying event, is assessed as potentially eligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus and is determined ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus either after open enrollment has ended or more than 60 days after the qualifying event; or

(ii) Applies for coverage at their Local Department of Social Services or Human Resources Administration during the annual open enrollment period, and is determined ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus after open enrollment has ended;

(12) The qualified individual or enrollee, or his or her dependent, adequately demonstrates to NYSOH that a material error related to plan benefits, service area, or premium influenced the qualified individual's or enrollee's decision to purchase a qualified health plan; or

(13) At the option of NYSOH, the qualified individual provides satisfactory documentary evidence to verify his or her eligibility for an insurance affordability program or enrollment following termination of enrollment due to a failure to verify such status within 90 days. NYSOH has not elected to adopt this subsection at this time.

(45 CFR § 155.420(d)).

Generally, if a triggering life event occurs, the qualified individual or enrollee has 60 days from the date of a triggering event to select a qualified health plan, or to change enrollment to a different plan (45 CFR § 155.420(c)(1)).

## **Legal Analysis**

The issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you did not qualify to change your enrollment to a different qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period.

Although, the record does not contain either a denial of your request to change plans, or a notice regarding a special enrollment period, this lack does not prevent the Appeals Unit from reaching the merits of the case or constitute material error. Under 45 CFR § 155.505(b), you are as entitled to appeal NYSOH's failure to timely issue a notice of eligibility determination as you are to appeal an adverse notice of eligibility determination.

Your credible testimony, along with the February 28, 2017 appeal confirmation notice stating that the reason for your appeal was "denial of SEP," permits an inference that NYSOH did deny your request to change your enrollment and or denied you a special enrollment request.

Since the Appeals Unit review of NYSOH determinations is performed on a de novo basis, no deference would have been granted to the eligibility determination notice had it been issued.

When a triggering life event occurs, the qualified individual has 60 days from the date of that event to select a qualified health plan.

Your coverage outside of NYSOH ended on December 31, 2016, through no fault of your own. On February 27, 2017, you contacted NYSOH to change your enrollment, which NYSOH refused to allow you to do.

You were entitled to a 60-day special enrollment period in which to enroll in a plan or to change your enrollment, by virtue of your loss of coverage effective December 31, 2016.

Because 60 days from December 31, 2016 was March 1, 2017, you would have qualified to select a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period until March 1, 2017.

The credible evidence of record indicates that you requested to change your enrollment on February 27, 2017, prior to the expiration of the special enrollment



period you were entitled to. It was error on the part of NYSOH not to allow you to do so.

Therefore, NYSOH's verbal determination that you did not qualify to change your enrollment outside of the open enrollment period for 2017 is incorrect.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to assist you in selecting a qualified health plan. You have 60 days from the date of this decision to select a plan.

You may choose to enroll into a qualified health plan effective as early as April 1, 2017, because NYSOH improperly failed to process your application, and had your application been processed on February 27, 2017, your new coverage would have been effective on that date. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll in a plan from this time forward.

## **Decision**

NYSOH's verbal determination that you were not eligible to change your enrollment as of February 27, 2017 was incorrect.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to assist you in selecting a qualified health plan. You may choose to enroll into a qualified health plan as early as April 1, 2017, because NYSOH improperly failed to process your application, and had your application been processed on February 27, 2017, your new coverage would have been effective on that date. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll in a plan from this time forward.

**Effective Date of this Decision:** July 19, 2017

## **How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility**

NYSOH improperly denied your request to change your enrollment.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to allow you to change your coverage.

You will be responsible for any premium payments for any months you are enrolled into coverage.

## **If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)**

This Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:  
Health Insurance Marketplace  
Attn: Appeals  
465 Industrial Blvd.  
London, KY 40750-0061
- By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

## **If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):**

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:  
NY State of Health Appeals  
P.O. Box 11729

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Albany, NY 12211

- By fax: 1-855-900-5557

## **Summary**

NYSOH's verbal determination that you were not eligible to change your enrollment as of February 27, 2017 was incorrect.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to assist you in selecting a qualified health plan. You may choose to enroll into a qualified health plan as early as April 1, 2017, because NYSOH improperly failed to process your application, and had your application been processed on February 27, 2017, your new coverage would have been effective on that date. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll in a plan from this time forward.

NYSOH improperly denied your request to change your enrollment.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to allow you to change your coverage.

You will be responsible for any premium payments for any months you are enrolled into coverage.

## **Legal Authority**

We are issuing this determination in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

**A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:**



## Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

### Español (Spanish)

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

### 中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助，請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

### Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

### 中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件，请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

### Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

### 한국어 (Korean)

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

### Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

### العربية (Arabic)

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 1-855-355-5777. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجانًا.

### বাংলা (Bengali)

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

### **Français (French)**

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

### **हिंदी (Hindi)**

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

### **日本語 (Japanese)**

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

### **नेपाली (Nepali)**

यो एउटा महत्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई निःशुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

### **Polski (Polish)**

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

### **Twi (Twi)**

Krataa yi ye tow krataa a ho hia. Se wo hia eho nkyerekyeremu a, ye sre wo, fre 1-855-355-5777. ye b etumi ama wo obi a okyer e kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

### **(Urdu) اردو**

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم 1-855-355-5777 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

### **Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)**

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

### **אידיש (Yiddish)**

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמענטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).