



STATE OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211

## Notice of Decision

Decision Date: July 24, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]  
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000017742

[REDACTED]

Dear [REDACTED],

On July 19, 2017, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's March 19, 2017 eligibility determination notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:  
NY State of Health Appeals  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211
- Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the Account ID at the top of this notice.

### Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

This page intentionally left blank.



STATE OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211

## Decision

Decision Date: July 24, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]  
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000017742



## Issue

The issue presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health is:

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you and your spouse's eligibility for advance payments of the premium tax credit ended effective April 1, 2017?

## Procedural History

On December 13, 2016, NY State of Health (NYSOH) issued a notice of eligibility determination stating that you and your spouse were eligible to receive up to \$596.00 in advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC), for a limited time, effective January 1, 2017. The notice further directed you to provide documentation confirming your income before March 12, 2017.

Also on December 13, 2016, NYSOH issued a notice confirming your and your spouse's enrollment in qualified health plan with APTC, effective January 1, 2017.

No income documentation was received by March 12, 2017.

On March 19, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you and your spouse were newly eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost. The notice stated that you were not eligible to receive APTC because NYSOH did not receive the income documentation needed to verify the income listed in your application. This eligibility was effective May 1, 2017.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Also on March 19, 2017, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice stating that you and your spouse were enrolled in a qualified health plan with \$0.00 of APTC applied to your premium.

On March 27, 2017, NYSOH received your updated application for financial assistance with health insurance. Also on this date, you uploaded one document to your NYSOH account.

On March 28, 2017, NYOSH issued a notice stating that the income information that was entered into your application did not match what NYSOH received from state and federal data sources, and that more information was needed to confirm the information in your account. This notice further directed you to submit household income documentation by April 11, 2017.

On March 29, 2017, NYSOH received your updated application for financial assistance.

On March 30, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice stating that the income information that was entered into your application did not match what NYSOH received from state and federal data sources, and that more information was needed to confirm the information in your account. This notice further directed you to submit household income documentation by April 11, 2017.

On April 3, 2017, NYSOH verified the income documentation you submitted on March 27, 2017, and an updated application was submitted on your household's behalf.

On April 4, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility determination stating that you and your spouse were eligible to receive up to \$517.00 per month in APTC, effective May 1, 2017.

On April 5, 2017, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed the termination of your APTC for the month of April 2017.

On April 6, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice confirming your and your spouse's enrollment in qualified health plan with APTC, effective May 1, 2017.

On July 19, 2017, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and the record was closed at the end of the hearing.

## **Findings of Fact**

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

- 1) You testified, and your NYSOH account confirms, that you receive all of your notices from NYSOH by electronic mail.
- 2) You testified that you do not recall receiving any electronic alerts notifying you of any notice in your NYSOH account stating that your eligibility was only conditional and that you needed to provide documentation of your income.
- 3) You testified that had you known you needed to submit documentation, you would have submitted the documentation needed by the due date.
- 4) You testified that you did not know that you needed to submit documentation of your income until you received a premium bill in the mail from your and your spouse's qualified health plan for the month of April 2017 and there was no premium subsidy deducted.
- 5) Your NYSOH account indicates that on March 18, 2017 your application was run and you and your spouse were found no longer eligible for APTC.
- 6) You submitted income documentation to NYSOH on March 27, 2017.
- 7) You and your spouse were found eligible for APTC of up to \$517.00 per month, effective May 1, 2017.
- 8) You testified that you are seeking reinstatement of your and your spouse's APTC as of April 1, 2017.
- 9) You testified that you paid the full premium amount due to your and your spouse's qualified health plan for the month of April 2017, and are looking to have your and your spouse's APTC retroactively applied so that you can receive some of that money back in a refund.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

## **Applicable Law and Regulations**

### Verification of Eligibility for Advance Payments of the Premium Tax Credit

APTC are generally available to a person who is eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan and (1) expects to have a household income between 138% and 400% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL), (2) expects to file a tax return and claim a personal exemption deduction for a person who meets the eligibility requirements to enroll in a qualified health plan, and (3) is not otherwise eligible

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market (see 45 CFR § 155.305(f), 42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)).

An applicant is required to attest to their household's projected annual income for purposes of determining their eligibility for APTC (45 CFR § 155.320(c)(3)(ii)(B)). For all individual's whose household income is needed, NYSOH must request tax return data from the Secretary of the Treasury and data regarding Social Security benefits from the Commissioner of Social Security in order to confirm that the information the applicant is attesting to is accurate (45 CFR § 155.320(c)(1)(i); 45 CFR § 155.320(c)(3)(ii)(A)).

If income data is unavailable, or if an applicant's attestation is not reasonably compatible with the income data NYSOH obtains, NYSOH must request additional information from the applicant in order to resolve the inconsistency (45 CFR § 155.320 (c)(3)(iii), (iv)).

NYSOH must provide the applicant with notice of the inconsistency in their account and 90 days to provide satisfactory documentary evidence to resolve the inconsistency (45 CFR § 155.315 (f)(2)). If NYSOH remains unable to verify the attestation of the applicant, NYSOH must redetermine the applicant's eligibility based on the information available from the data sources unless the applicant demonstrates that they are unable to provide the required documentation (45 CFR § 155.315(f)(2), (g)).

Upon making an eligibility redetermination, NYSOH must notify the applicant and implement any changes in eligibility to APTC effective as of the first day of the month following the date of the notice (45 § 155.310(f), 45 CFR § 155.330(e), (f)(1)(i)).

### Electronic Notices

Applicants may choose to receive notices and information from NYSOH by either electronic or regular mail. If the individual elect's electronic communications, NYSOH must send an email or other electronic communication alerting the individual when a notice has been posted to his or her account and send a notice by regular mail within three business days if the electronic communication cannot be delivered (45 CFR § 155.230(d); 42 CFR § 435.918(b)(4), (5)).

## **Legal Analysis**

The issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that your and your spouse's eligibility for APTC ended effective April 1, 2017.

An individual requesting financial assistance to help pay for the cost of coverage provided through NYSOH is required to attest to his or her household's projected annual income. For individuals seeking APTC, NYSOH must request income data from federal data sources in order to verify an individual's income attestation.

If NYSOH cannot verify an individual's attestation, it must provide the individual with notice of the inconsistency and provide a period of 90 days from the date notice is received to resolve the inconsistency.

In the eligibility determination issued on December 13, 2016, you were advised that your and your spouse's eligibility for APTC was only conditional, and that you needed to confirm your household's income before March 12, 2017.

The record reflects that NYSOH did not receive the requested income documentation before the deadline.

However, you testified that you elected to receive alerts regarding notices from NYSOH electronically. You credibly testified that you do not recall receiving any electronic alert regarding the eligibility determination notice, which directed you that your eligibility was only conditional and that you needed to submit documentation to confirm your income. You further testified that you did become aware of the document when you called to see why your and your spouse's APTC had been terminated, but that if you had received the alert prior to when you called in March 2017 than you would have submitted the necessary information by the due date.

There is also no evidence in your account documenting that any email alert was sent to you regarding the need to submit documentation, or that the notice was later sent to you by regular mail.

Therefore, it is concluded that NYSOH did not give you the proper notice that you needed to submit documentation of your income in order to confirm your eligibility for APTC.

Since you were not made aware of and did not receive proper notice that there was an inconsistency in your NYSOH account, the March 19, 2017 eligibility determination stating that you and your spouse were eligible for a full price qualified health plan, are no longer eligible for APTC because you failed to submit documentation is **RESCINDED**.

Your case is **RETURNED** to NYSOH to reinstate your APTC as of April 1, 2017.

## **Decision**

The March 19, 2017 notice of eligibility determination is RESCINDED.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to reinstate your APTC as of April 1, 2017.

**Effective Date of this Decision:** July 24, 2017

## **How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility**

NYSOH erred in terminating your APTC effective April 1, 2017, without the proper notice.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to reinstate your APTC as of April 1, 2017.

## **If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)**

This Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

Health Insurance Marketplace  
Attn: Appeals  
465 Industrial Blvd.  
London, KY 40750-0061

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).



- By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

### **If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):**

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:  
NY State of Health Appeals  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211
- By fax: 1-855-900-5557

### **Summary**

The March 19, 2017 notice of eligibility determination is RESCINDED.

NYSOH erred in terminating your APTC effective April 1, 2017, without the proper notice.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to reinstate your APTC as of April 1, 2017.

### **Legal Authority**

We are issuing this determination in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

**A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:**



## Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

### Español (Spanish)

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

### 中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助，請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

### Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

### 中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件，请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您提供相应语种的口译服务。

### Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

### 한국어 (Korean)

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

### Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

### العربية (Arabic)

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 1-855-355-5777. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجاناً.

### বাংলা (Bengali)

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

## **Français (French)**

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

## **हिंदी (Hindi)**

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

## **日本語 (Japanese)**

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

## **नेपाली (Nepali)**

यो एउटा महत्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई निःशुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

## **Polski (Polish)**

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

## **Twi (Twi)**

Krataa yi ye tow krataa a ho hia. Se wo hia eho nkyerekyeremu a, ye sre wo, fre 1-855-355-5777. ye&etumi ama wo obi a okyerE kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

## **(Urdu) اردو**

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم 1-855-355-5777 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

## **Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)**

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

## **אידיש (Yiddish)**

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).