STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

Notice of Decision

Decision Date: September 18, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [redacted]
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000018673

[redacted]

Dear [redacted],

On August 14, 2017, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's May 5, 2017 eligibility determination notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:

  NY State of Health Appeals
  P.O. Box 11729
  Albany, NY 12211

- Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the Account ID at the top of this notice.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

This page intentionally left blank.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

Decision

Decision Date: September 18, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [redacted]
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000018673

[redacted]

Issues

The issues presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health are:

> Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly determine that you were not eligible for advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC) and cost-sharing reductions, effective June 1, 2017?
>
> Did NYSOH properly determine that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan?
>
> Did NYSOH properly determine that you were not eligible for Medicaid?

Procedural History

On January 20, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were eligible to enroll in the Essential Plan for a limited, effective March 1, 2017. Your eligibility was contingent on your submitting documentation of your income prior to April 19, 2017.

Also on January 20, 2017, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice stating that you were enrolled in the Essential Plan as of March 1, 2017.

On April 26, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were newly eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost, effective June 1, 2017. You were not eligible for APTC, cost-sharing reductions, Essential Plan, or Medicaid because NYSOH did not receive the income documentation needed to verify the income listed in your application.

Also on April 26, 2017, NYSOH issued a disenrollment notice stating that your coverage in the Essential Plan would end May 31, 2017 because you were no longer eligible to enroll in the Essential Plan.

On May 4, 2017, you submitted an updated application for financial assistance with health insurance. That day, a preliminary eligibility determination was prepared stating that you were eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost, effective June 1, 2017.

Also on May 4, 2017, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed your ineligibility for financial assistance, effective June 1, 2017.

On May 5, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice, stating that you were eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost, effective June 1, 2017. The notice stated that you were ineligible for financial assistance because APTC payments were made to your insurance company to reduce your premium costs in a prior year and NYSOH could not tell if you filed a federal tax return for that year. That notice also stated that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan or Medicaid because you did not meet the income limits or other eligibility standards for those programs.

On May 10, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were eligible for the Essential Plan, effective June 1, 2017, because your request for Aid to Continue had been granted.

Also on May 10, 2017, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice stating that you were enrolled in the Essential Plan, effective June 1, 2017.

On August 14, 2017, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and held open up to August 22, 2017 to allow you time to submit tax transcripts from the IRS.

Also on August 14, 2017, you faxed form [redacted] Request for Transcript of Tax Return, to NYSOH. It was entered into the record as Appellants Exhibit #1.

No further documentation was received and the record was closed on August 22, 2017.

Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

1) The record reflects that you expect to file your 2017 taxes with a tax filing status of single. You will claim no dependents on that tax return.

2) You submitted an application to NYSOH for financial assistance on May 4, 2017.

3) You testified that someone at [redacted] electronically filed a tax return on your behalf in 2015.

4) You testified that you do not know when your tax returns were filed, but that you did not require an extension.

5) You testified that you have always filed your taxes.

6) The record shows you have not submitted a copy of your 2015 or 2016 IRS tax transcript to NYSOH.

7) Your NYSOH account reflects that APTC was paid on your behalf in 2015.

8) You testified that you are seeking financial assistance as of June 1, 2017.

9) You testified that you receive $1,400.00 per month in Social Security benefits. You submitted Form SSA-1099 which states that in 2016, you received $16,812.00.

10) You testified that you earn $11.00 an hour with part-time employment, and submitted three paystubs:
    a. dated January 3, 2017 for a gross $187.00
    b. dated January 10, 2017 for a gross $220.00
    c. dated January 17, 2017 for a gross $319.00

11) The application that was submitted on May 4, 2017 listed an annual household income of $25,776.00, consisting of $8,976.00 you earn from your employment and $16,800.00 you receive in Social Security benefits.

12) Your application states that you will not be taking any deductions on your 2017 tax return.

13) On August 14, 2017, you submitted a copy of form [redacted] Request for Transcript of Tax Return.

14) You reside in [redacted].

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

Applicable Law and Regulations

Verification of Eligibility for Advance Payments of the Premium Tax Credit

APTC are generally available to a person who is eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan and (1) expects to have a household income between 138% and 400% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL), (2) expects to file a tax return and claim a personal exemption deduction for a person who meets the eligibility requirements to enroll in a qualified health plan, and (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market (*see* 45 CFR § 155.305(f), 42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)).

NYSOH may not determine a tax filer eligible for APTC if APTC was paid on the tax filer's behalf in a previous year, and a tax return was not filed for that previous year (45 CFR §155.305(f)(4)).

An applicant is required to attest to their household's projected annual income for purposes of determining their eligibility for APTC (45 CFR § 155.320(c)(3)(ii)(B)). For all individuals, whose household income is needed, NYSOH must request tax return data from the Secretary of the Treasury and data regarding Social Security benefits from the Commissioner of Social Security to confirm that the information the applicant is attesting to is accurate (45 CFR § 155.320(c)(1)(i); 45 CFR § 155.320(c)(3)(ii)(A)).

If income data is unavailable, or if an applicant's attestation is not reasonably compatible with the income data NYSOH obtains, NYSOH must request additional information from the applicant to resolve the inconsistency (45 CFR § 155.320 (c)(3)(iii), (iv)).

NYSOH must provide the applicant with notice of the inconsistency in their account and 90 days to provide satisfactory documentary evidence to resolve the inconsistency (45 CFR § 155.315 (f)(2)). If NYSOH remains unable to verify the attestation of the applicant, NYSOH must redetermine the applicant's eligibility based on the information available from the data sources unless the applicant demonstrates that they are unable to provide the required documentation (45 CFR § 155.315(f)(2), (g)).

Upon making an eligibility redetermination, NYSOH must notify the applicant and implement any changes in eligibility to APTC effective as of the first day of the month following the date of the notice (45 § 155.310(f), 45 CFR § 155.330(e), (f)(1)(i)).

<u>Cost-Sharing Reductions</u>

Cost-sharing reductions (CSR) are available to a person who (1) is eligible to enroll in a QHP through NYSOH, (2) meets the requirements to receive APTC, (3) is expected to have an annual household income that does not exceed 250% of the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested, and (4) is enrolled in a silver-level QHP (45 CFR § 155.300(a), 45 CFR § 155.305(g)(1)).

Essential Plan

NYSOH must generally determine an applicant eligible for the Essential Plan, a basic health plan, if the person is (1) a resident of New York State, (2) expects to have a household income between 138% and 200% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL) or, in the case of an individual who is a lawfully present non-citizen who is ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus as a result of their immigration status, has a household income that is between 0% and 200% of the FPL, (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market, (4) is 64 years old or younger, (5) is a citizen or a lawfully present non-citizen, and (6) is not incarcerated (*see* 42 CFR § 600.305, 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4), 45 CFR § 155.305(e), NY Social Services Law § 369-gg(3), 42 USC § 18051).

In an analysis of Essential Plan eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL in effect on the first day of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). On the date of your application, that was the 2016 FPL, which is $11,880.00 for a one-person household (81 Fed. Reg. 4036.).

A person who has a household income that is at or below 150% of the FPL has a $0.00 premium contribution (New York's Basic Health Plan Blueprint, p. 21, as approved January 2016; see https://www.medicaid.gov/basic-health-program/basic-health-program.html).

A person who has a household income greater than 150% of the FPL or below 200% of the FPL has a $20.00 per month premium contribution (New York's Basic Health Plan Blueprint, as approved January 2016).

The Essential Plan is considered minimum essential coverage therefore, a person who is eligible for the Essential Plan is not eligible for any premium tax credit because they are eligible for minimum essential coverage through the individual market (*see* 26 CFR § 1.36B-2(c)(1), 26 USC § 5000A(f)(1)(C)).

Medicaid

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults who: (1) are age 19 or older and under age 65, (2) are not pregnant, (3) are not entitled to or enrolled for Medicare benefits under part A or B of title XVIII of the Act, (4) are not otherwise eligible for and enrolled for mandatory coverage under a State's Medicaid State plan in accordance with subpart B of this part, and (5) have a household modified adjusted gross income (MAGI) that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size (42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)), NY Social Services Law § 366(1)(b)).

In an analysis of Medicaid eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL "for the applicable budget period used to determine an individual's eligibility" (42 CFR § 435.4).

On the date of your application, that was the 2017 FPL, which is $12,060.00 for a one-person household (82 Fed. Reg. 8831).

Financial eligibility for Medicaid for applicants who are not currently receiving Medicaid benefits is based on current monthly household income and family size (42 CFR § 435.603(h)(1); State Plan Amendment (SPA) 13-0055-MM3, as approved March 19, 2014).

Legal Analysis

The first issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were not eligible for APTC or cost-sharing reductions, effective June 1, 2017.

On May 4, 2017, NYSOH received your application for financial assistance. On May 5, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility determination stating that you were eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost through NYSOH, effective June 1, 2017, and ineligible to receive APTC or cost-sharing reductions. This was because APTC was paid to your health insurance company on your behalf in a prior year and NYSOH could not ascertain if a federal tax return was filed for that year.

You testified that your accountant electronically filed a tax return on your behalf in 2015. You testified that you do not know when your 2015 return was filed, but that you did not request an extension. You further testified that you have always filed your taxes.

At the time of your May 4, 2017 application, NYSOH had not received information from the IRS that your household's tax return for 2015 had been properly filed and reconciled. If NYSOH is unable to obtain information that a prior year's tax return has been filed, NYSOH may not determine a tax filer eligible for APTC, if APTC was paid on the tax filer's behalf in a previous year.

Although NYSOH received a copy of your Request for Transcript of Tax Return form, signed August 14, 2017, NYSOH did not receive a copy of your IRS tax transcript. Thus, NYSOH is unable to determine whether you qualified for APTC and cost sharing reductions at the time of your application. The Hearing Officer left the record open for fifteen days to allow you time to submit this documentation. As of the close of the record on August 22, 2017, the Appeals Unit had not received copies of your tax transcript as requested.

Since you have not provided sufficient documentation to prove that you timely filed your tax returns, we must assume that at the time of your May 4, 2017 application the data sources NYSOH relied on to make its determination were correct and that you had not in fact filed your 2015 tax return.

Therefore, NYSOH's determination that you were not eligible for APTC or cost-sharing reductions because APTC was paid to your health insurance company on your behalf in

a prior year and NYSOH could not ascertain if a federal tax return was filed for that year is AFFIRMED.

The second issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan.

The application that was submitted on May 4, 2017 listed an annual household income of $25,776.00 and the eligibility determination relied upon that information.

You are in a one-person household. You expect to file your 2017 income taxes as single and will claim no dependents on that tax return.

The Essential Plan is provided through NYSOH to individuals who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is between 138% and 200% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was $11,880.00 for a one-person household. Since an annual household income of $25,776.00 is 216.97% of the 2016 FPL, NYSOH properly found you to be not eligible for the Essential Plan.

The third issue is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were not eligible for Medicaid.

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults between the ages of 19 and 65 who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was $12,060.00 for a one-person household. Since $25,776.00 is 213.73% of the 2017 FPL, NYSOH properly found you to be not eligible for Medicaid on an expected annual income basis, using the information provided in your application.

However, financial eligibility for Medicaid for applicants who are not currently receiving Medicaid benefits is based on current monthly household income and family size.

You testified, and the record reflects, that you receive $1,400.00 each month in Social Security benefits in addition to your part time employment earnings.

To be eligible for Medicaid, you would need to meet the non-financial criteria and have an income no greater than 138% of the FPL, which is $1,387.00 per month. Since the record reflects that you earn no less than $1,400.00 each month, you do not qualify for Medicaid on the basis of monthly income.

Since the May 5, 2017 eligibility determination notice properly stated that you were not eligible for financial assistance based on the information provided, it is correct and is AFFIRMED.

Decision

The May 5, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

Effective Date of this Decision: September 18, 2017

How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

You are not eligible for APTC or CSR effective June 1, 2017.

You are not eligible for the Essential Plan.

You are not eligible for Medicaid.

If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

This Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

  Health Insurance Marketplace
  Attn: Appeals
  465 Industrial Blvd.
  London, KY 40750-0061

- By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:

  NY State of Health Appeals
  P.O. Box 11729
  Albany, NY 12211
- By fax: 1-855-900-5557

Summary

The May 5, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

You are not eligible for APTC or CSR effective June 1, 2017.

You are not eligible for the Essential Plan.

You are not eligible for Medicaid.

Legal Authority

We are issuing this determination in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:

[redacted]

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

Español (Spanish)

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。 如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助，請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件，请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

한국어 (Korean)

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

العربية (Arabic)

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 1-855-355-5777. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجانًا.

বাংলা (Bengali)

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्त्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई निःशुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

Twi (Twi)

Krataa yi yɛ tow krataa a ho hia. Sɛ wo hia ɛho nkyerɛkyerɛmu a, yɛ srɛ wo, frɛ 1-855-355-5777. yƐbƐtumi ama wo obi a ɔkyerƐ kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

اردو (Urdu)

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم1-855-355-5777 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

אידיש (Yiddish)

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).