STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

Notice of Decision

Decision Date: September 15, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [redacted]
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000018821

[redacted]

Dear [redacted]

On August 22, 2017, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's May 10, 2017 eligibility determination.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:

  NY State of Health Appeals
  P.O. Box 11729
  Albany, NY 12211

- Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the NY State of Health Account ID at the top of this notice.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

This page intentionally left blank.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

Decision

Decision Date: September 15, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [redacted]
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000018821

[redacted]

Issues

The issues presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health are:

> Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly determine that you were eligible to receive up to $154.00 per month in advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC), effective June 1, 2017?
>
> Did NYSOH properly determine you were not eligible for cost-sharing reductions?
>
> Did NYSOH properly determine you were not eligible for the Essential Plan?
>
> Did NYSOH properly determine that you were not eligible for Medicaid?

Procedural History

On May 9, 2017, you updated your application for financial assistance. That day, a preliminary eligibility determination was prepared stating that you were eligible to receive up to $154.00 per month in APTC, effective June 1, 2017.

Also on May 9, 2017, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed, insofar as you were not eligible for a higher level of financial assistance. You also requested Aid to Continue, pending the outcome of your appeal.

On May 10, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility determination, based on the May 9, 2017 application, stating that you were eligible to receive up to $154.00 per month in APTC, effective June 1, 2017. That notice also stated that you were not eligible for cost-sharing reductions, the Essential Plan, or Medicaid because your income was over the allowable income limits for those programs.

On May 16, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility determination stating that you were eligible to enroll in the Essential Plan for a limited time, effective May 1, 2017. This was because your request for Aid to Continue pending the outcome of your appeal was granted.

Also on May 16, 2017, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice, confirming your enrollment in an Essential Plan, beginning June 1, 2017. This was because your request for Aid to Continue pending the outcome of your appeal was granted.

On August 22, 2017, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and held open through September 12 ,2017 to allow you to submit supporting documentation.

On September 8, 2017, you faxed a three-page document to NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record is now closed.

Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

1) The application that was submitted on May 9, 2017 stated that you expected to file your 2017 tax return with a tax filing status of single, and to claim no dependents.

2) At the hearing, you testified that you now expect to file your tax return as head of household with qualifying individual, and to claim your mother as a dependent.

3) You testified that your mother is recently retired and only receives $200.00 per month in retirement income, so you are helping her with her rent and other expenses.

4) You are seeking insurance for yourself only.

5) The application that was submitted on May 9, 2017 listed annual household income of $37,440.00, consisting of income you earn from employment. You testified that this amount was correct.

6) You testified that you earn $18.00 an hour and work 40 hours per week, but that you do not get paid when you miss work. You testified that you are paid biweekly.

7) You testified that you sometimes work overtime, and that you earn time and a half for any overtime hours that you work.

8) You testified that you cannot afford to pay the premiums for a qualified health plan, even with the tax credit you were found eligible for.

9) Your application states that you will not be taking any deductions on your 2017 tax return, and you testified that this is correct.

10) Your application states that you live in [redacted].

11) You testified that you need to have health insurance because you recently had major surgery and require follow-up care.

12) After the hearing, you faxed a three-page document to the Appeals Unit consisting of the following:

    a. A paystub dated 8/22/2017 for gross taxable earnings of $1,696.75;
    b. A paystub dated 9/6/2017 for gross taxable earnings of $1,470.07, with year-to-date earnings of $37,161.83;
    c. A letter from the Social Security Administration dated June 3, 2017, addressed to [redacted], stating that her monthly Social Security benefits, before any deductions, are $246.00, beginning March 2017.

    Taken together, these documents are collectively marked and entered into the record as "Appellant's Exhibit One."

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

Applicable Law and Regulations

Advance Payments of Premium Tax Credit

APTC are generally available to a person who is eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan (QHP) and (1) expects to have a household income between 138% and 400% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL), (2) expects to file a tax return and claim a personal exemption deduction for a person who meets the eligibility requirements to enroll in a QHP, and (3) is not otherwise eligible for

minimum essential coverage except through the individual market (*see* 45 CFR § 155.305(f), 42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)).

The maximum amount of APTC that can be authorized equals:

1) the cost of the health insurance premium for the taxpayer's coverage family in the second lowest cost silver plan offered through NY State of Health in the county where the taxpayer resides

minus

2) the taxpayer's expected contribution amount

(*see* 26 USC § 36B, 26 CFR § 1.36B-3).

The taxpayer's expected contribution amount is the amount that the taxpayer is expected to spend on health insurance premiums. The expected contribution for 2017 is set by federal law at 2.04% to 9.69% of household income (26 USC § 36B(b)(3)(A), 26 CFR § 1.36B-3T(g)(1), IRS Rev. Proc.2016-24).

In an analysis of APTC eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR §§ 155.300(a), 155.305(f)(1)(i)). On the date of your application, that was the 2016 FPL, which is $11,880.00 for a one-person household (81 Federal Register 4036).

For annual household income in the range of at least 300% but less than 400% of the 2016 FPL, the expected contribution is 9.69 % of the household income (26 CFR § 1.36B-3T(g)(1), 45 CFR § 155.300(a), IRS Rev. Proc. 2016-24).

People who use the APTC to help pay health insurance premiums must file a federal tax return and reconcile their expected income (stated on NYSOH application) with their actual income (stated on their federal income tax return). Those who take less tax credit in advance than they claim on the tax return may get the rest of it as an income tax refund or have their tax bill reduced. Those who take more tax credit in advance than they can claim on their tax return will owe the difference as additional income taxes (26 CFR § 1.36B-4).

<u>Cost-Sharing Reductions</u>

Cost-sharing reductions are available to a person who (1) is eligible to enroll in a QHP through NYSOH, (2) meets the requirements to receive APTC, (3) is expected to have an annual household income that does not exceed 250% of the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which

coverage is requested, and (4) is enrolled in a silver-level QHP (45 CFR § 155.300(a), 45 CFR § 155.305(g)(1)).

Essential Plan

NYSOH must generally determine an applicant eligible for the Essential Plan, a basic health plan, if the person is (1) a resident of New York State, (2) expects to have a household income between 138% and 200% of the applicable FPL or, in the case of an individual who is a lawfully present non-citizen who is ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus as a result of their immigration status, has a household income that is between 0% and 200% of the FPL, (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market, (4) is 64 years old or younger, (5) is a citizen or a lawfully present non-citizen, and (6) is not incarcerated (*see* 42 CFR § 600.305, 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4), 45 CFR § 155.305(e), NY Social Services Law § 369-gg(3), 42 USC § 18051).

In an analysis of Essential Plan eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL in effect on the first day of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). On the date of your application, that was the 2016 FPL, which is $11,880.00 for a one-person household (81 Fed. Reg. 4036).

A person who has a household income that is at or below 150% of the FPL has a $0.00 premium contribution (New York's Basic Health Plan Blueprint, p. 21, as approved January 2016; see https://www.medicaid.gov/basic-health-program/basic-health-program.html).

A person who has a household income greater than 150% of the FPL or below 200% of the FPL has a $20.00 per month premium contribution (New York's Basic Health Plan Blueprint, as approved January 2016).

The Essential Plan is considered minimum essential coverage therefore, a person who is eligible for the Essential Plan is not eligible for any premium tax credit because they are eligible for minimum essential coverage through the individual market (*see* 26 CFR § 1.36B-2(c)(1), 26 USC § 5000A(f)(1)(C)).

Medicaid

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults who: (1) are age 19 or older and under age 65, (2) are not pregnant, (3) are not entitled to or enrolled for Medicare benefits under part A or B of title XVIII of the Act, (4) are not otherwise eligible for and enrolled for mandatory coverage under a State's Medicaid State plan in accordance with subpart B of this part, and (5) have a household modified adjusted gross income (MAGI) that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size (42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)), NY Social Services Law § 366(1)(b)).

In an analysis of Medicaid eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL “for the applicable budget period used to determine an individual's eligibility” (42 CFR § 435.4). On the date of your application, that was the 2017 FPL, which is $12,060.00 for a one-person household (82 Fed. Reg. 8831).

Financial eligibility for Medicaid for applicants who are not currently receiving Medicaid benefits is based on current monthly household income and family size (42 CFR § 435.603(h)(1); State Plan Amendment (SPA) 13-0055-MM3, as approved March 19, 2014).

Legal Analysis

The first issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were eligible for an APTC of up to $154.00 per month, effective June 1, 2017.

The application that was submitted on May 9, 2017 listed an annual household income of $37,440.00 and the eligibility determination relied upon that information.

According to your May 9, 2017 application, you expected to file your 2017 income taxes as single and to claim no dependents on that tax return.

You reside in Queens County, where the second lowest cost silver plan available for an individual through NYSOH costs $456.46 per month.

An annual income of $37,440.00 is 315.15% of the 2016 FPL for a one-person household. At 315.15% of the FPL, the expected contribution to the cost of the health insurance premium is 9.69% of income, or $302.33 per month.

The maximum amount of APTC that can be approved equals the cost of the second lowest cost silver plan available through NYSOH for an individual in your county ($456.46 per month) minus your expected contribution ($302.33 per month), which equals $154.33 per month. Therefore, rounding to the nearest dollar, NYSOH correctly determined you to be eligible for up to $154.00 per month in APTC, based on the information in your May 9, 2017 application.

The second issue under review is whether you were properly found ineligible for cost-sharing reductions. Cost-sharing reductions are available to a person who has a household income no greater than 250% of the FPL. Since a household income of $37,440.00 is 315.15% of the applicable FPL, NYSOH correctly found you to be ineligible for cost sharing reductions, based on the information in your May 9, 2017 application.

The third issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were ineligible for the Essential Plan, as of your May 9, 2017 application.

The Essential Plan is provided through NYSOH to individuals who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is between 138% and 200% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was $11,880.00 for a one-person household. Since an annual household income of $37,440.00 is 315.15% of the 2016 FPL, NYSOH properly found you to be ineligible for the Essential Plan, based on the information in your May 9, 2017 application.

The fourth issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were ineligible for Medicaid.

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults between the ages of 19 and 65 who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was $12,060.00 for a one-person household. Since $37,440.00 is 315.15% of the 2017 FPL, NYSOH properly found you to be ineligible for Medicaid on an expected annual income basis, using the information provided in your application.

Since the May 10, 2017 eligibility determination properly stated that, based on the information you provided, you were eligible for up to $154.00 per month in APTC, ineligible for cost-sharing reductions, ineligible for the Essential Plan and ineligible for Medicaid, it was correct and is AFFIRMED.

However, during the hearing, you testified that you now expect to file your 2017 tax return with a filing status of head of household with qualifying individual, and to claim your mother as a tax dependent. You testified that this is because your mother is only receiving $200.00 or so in retirement benefits, and you are supporting her financially.

After the hearing, you submitted recent income documentation that, when averaged, amount to biweekly gross taxable earnings of $15,83.41. This equates to an annual expected income of $41,168.66. You also submitted documentation to show that your mother's income consists of $246.00 per month in Social Security benefits (Appellant's Exhibit One).

Therefore, your case is RETURNED to NYSOH, and NYSOH is directed to contact you immediately to assist you in updating your application so that your mother's information can be added to your account, and your income information can be updated. NYSOH is directed to issue an eligibility redetermination after your account has been updated.

Decision

The May 10, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH, and NYSOH is directed to contact you immediately so that your application can be updated with your mother's information, and your updated income information.

Effective Date of this Decision: September 15, 2017

How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

You were eligible for up to $154.00 per month in APTC, effective June 1, 2017, based on your May 9, 2017 application.

You were not eligible for cost-sharing reductions, the Essential Plan, or Medicaid, as of your May 9, 2017 application.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to assist you in updating your application for financial assistance so that your mother's information can be added to your account, and your income information can be updated.

After NYSOH contacts you to update your application, NYSOH will issue a notice of eligibility redetermination to inform you of your updated eligibility for financial assistance.

If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

This Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

  Health Insurance Marketplace
  Attn: Appeals
  465 Industrial Blvd.
  London, KY 40750-0061

- By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:

  NY State of Health Appeals
  P.O. Box 11729
  Albany, NY 12211

- By fax: 1-855-900-5557

Summary

The May 10, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH, and NYSOH is directed to contact you immediately so that your application can be updated with your mother's information, and your updated income information.

You were eligible for up to $154.00 per month in APTC, effective June 1, 2017, based on your May 9, 2017 application.

You were not eligible for cost-sharing reductions, the Essential Plan, or Medicaid, as of your May 9, 2017 application.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to assist you in updating your application for financial assistance so that your mother's information can be added to your account, and your income information can be updated.

After NYSOH contacts you to update your application, NYSOH will issue a notice of eligibility redetermination to inform you of your updated eligibility for financial assistance.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

Español (Spanish)

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。 如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助，請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件，请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

한국어 (Korean)

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

العربية (Arabic)

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 1-855-355-5777. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجانًا.

বাংলা (Bengali)

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्त्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई निःशुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

Twi (Twi)

Krataa yi yɛ tow krataa a ho hia. Sɛ wo hia ɛho nkyerɛkyerɛmu a, yɛ srɛ wo, frɛ 1-855-355-5777. yƐbƐtumi ama wo obi a ɔkyerƐ kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

اردو (Urdu)

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم1-855-355-5777 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

אידיש (Yiddish)

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).