



STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

Notice of Decision

Decision Date: November 3, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000020165

[REDACTED]

Dear [REDACTED],

On September 22, 2017, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's July 1, 2017 eligibility determination notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:
NY State of Health Appeals
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211
- Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the Account ID at the top of this notice.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

This page intentionally left blank.



STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

Decision

Decision Date: November 3, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000020165



Issue

The issue presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health is:

Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly determine that you were not eligible to enroll in coverage through NYSOH as of July 2, 2017, because you are not considered lawfully present?

Procedural History

On March 16, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice, based on your March 15, 2017 application, stating that you were eligible to enroll in the Essential Plan for a limited time, effective April 1, 2017. The notice further stated that you needed to submit proof of your household income by June 13, 2017.

Also on March 16, 2017, NYSOH issued a plan enrollment notice confirming you're your enrollment in an Essential Plan 4 with no monthly premium, effective April 1, 2017.

On March 21, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice, based on your updated March 20, 2017 application, stating that you were eligible to enroll in the Essential Plan for a limited time, effective April 1, 2017. The notice further stated that you needed to submit proof of your immigration status and household income by June 13, 2017.

On June 7, 2017, you updated your NYSOH account and uploaded proof of income documents and a copy of your I-766 Employment Authorization Card reflecting category code of "C33". (see [REDACTED].)

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

On June 7, 2017, NYSOH reviewed and verified the income documentation you submitted and your annual income was updated to \$32,072.82 based on the pay stubs submitted.

On June 8, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were eligible for a limited period of time for advance payment of premium tax credit of up to \$221.00 per month, effective July 1, 2017. The notice stated that NYSOH was checking federal data sources to confirm your immigration status.

On June 8, 2017, NYSOH issued a disenrollment notice stating that your coverage in your Essential Plan 4 would end on June 30, 2017. This was because you were no longer eligible to enroll in Essential Plan 4.

On June 13, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice, based on the updated June 12, 2017 application, stating that you were eligible for a limited period of time for advance payment of premium tax credit of up to \$221.00 per month, effective July 1, 2017. The notice stated that you needed to submit proof of your immigration status by September 10, 2017.

Also on June 13, 2017, NYSOH reviewed and verified the I-766 Employment Authorization Card you submitted on June 7, 2017, as valid proof of your immigration status.

On June 14, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice based on information verified on June 13, 2017. The notice stated that, effective July 2, 2017, you were not eligible for Medicaid, Child Health Plus, Essential Plan, or to receive tax credits or cost-sharing reductions to help pay for the cost of insurance. The notice also stated that you were not eligible for Medicaid because the household income you provide of \$32,072.82 was over the allowable income limit for that program.

On June 30, 2017, you updated your NYSOH account and that day, a preliminary eligibility determination was prepared finding you not eligible to purchase health care coverage through NYSOH.

Also on June 30, 2017, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed those eligibility determinations insofar as you were no longer eligible to enroll in health insurance through NYSOH because of your immigration status.

On July 1, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice based on the updated June 30, 2017 application, stating that you were not eligible for Medicaid, Child Health Plus, the Essential Plan, or to receive tax credits or cost-sharing reductions to help pay for the cost of insurance. The notice also stated that you were not eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan at full cost. The notice stated that you were not eligible for Medicaid because the household

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

income you provide of \$30,628.00 was over the allowable income limit for that program.

On July 7, 2017, NYSOH granted your request for Aid to Continue pending the outcome of your appeal and you were reinstated in your Essential Plan 4 with no monthly premium, effective July 1, 2017

On September 22, 2017, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and held open up to October 9, 2017, to allow you to submit supporting documents.

On October 10, 2017, you uploaded to your account two documents: An earnings statement, dated 9/1/17, and an earnings statement, dated 9/8/2017. Collectively these documents were made part of the record as Appellant's Exhibit # 1. The record was closed at that time.

Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) According to your NYSOH account, you expect to file your 2017 taxes with a status of single and will claim no dependents on that tax return.
- 2) You are seeking insurance for yourself.
- 3) Your application states you are an immigrant non-citizen.
- 4) You uploaded a copy of your Employment Authorization card on June 7, 2017 with the status of C-33, which was verified on June 13, 2017.
- 5) The status of C-33, according to the United States Customs and Immigration Services (USCIS) and Social Security Administration (SSA) is in reference to a status classified as Deferred Action on Childhood Arrivals.
- 6) The application that was submitted on June 30, 2017, in which you requested financial assistance, listed annual household income of \$30,628.00, consisting of income you earn from employment. You testified that this amount was correct at the time.
- 7) According to your NYSOH account and your testimony, you have steady employment, earn \$15.50 per hour, and generally work 40 hours a week, which may vary depending on [REDACTED].

- 8) According to the pay statements you submitted and your testimony, your monthly gross pay is approximately \$2,400.00 a month.
- 9) You testified that you believe NYSOH is incorrect in its statement that you are not lawfully present. You testified that you entered the United States many years ago when you were a child.
- 10) You testified that you are [REDACTED] and would like to purchase health insurance, for which you believe you are eligible.
- 11) According to your NYSOH account and your testimony, you reside in [REDACTED], New York.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

Applicable Law and Regulations

Citizenship and Immigration Status

To enroll in a qualified health plan through NYSOH, an applicant must be a citizen or national of the United States, or a non-citizen who is lawfully present in the United States and reasonably expects to become a citizen or remain a lawfully present noncitizen for the entire period for which enrollment is being sought (45 CFR § 155.305(a)(1)).

NYSOH must verify or obtain information in order to determine that an applicant is eligible for enrollment in a qualified health plan, including the certification of citizenship, status as a national, or lawful presence (45 CFR § 155.315(a), (c)).

If an applicant attests to citizenship, status as a national, or lawful presence, and NYSOH is unable to verify such attestation, NYSOH must provide the applicant with notice of the inconsistency. NYSOH must then provide the applicant with 90 days to provide satisfactory documentary evidence, from the date the notice of inconsistency is received by the applicant. Notice is considered received 5 days after the date on the notice, unless the applicant demonstrates that he or she did not receive the notice within the five-day period. (45 CFR § 155.315(c)(3), (f)(2)(i)).

If NYSOH remains unable to verify the citizenship attestation after the 90-day period ends, it must determine the applicant's eligibility based on the information available (45 CFR § 155.315(f)(5)).

Immigration Status

Generally, no person except a United States citizen, a naturalized citizen, a qualified alien, and persons permanently residing in the United States under color of law (PRUCOL), is eligible for medical assistance from the state (NY Soc. Serv. Law § 122(1); 18 NYCRR § 360-3.2(j)).

A PRUCOL alien is a person who is residing in the United States with the knowledge and permission or acquiescence of the federal immigration agency and whose departure from the United States such agency does not contemplate enforcing (18 NYCRR §360-3.2(j)). The New York Department of Health regards aliens who have been issued an Employment Authorization Document (I-688B or I-766), and have the requisite category code, to be PRUCOL (08 OHIP/INF-4, dated August 4, 2008)).

The guide, “Key to I-766/I-688B, Employment Authorization Documents (EADs)”, defines certain codes on the USCIS Employment Authorization Documents” (08 MA/033, dated December 1, 2008, and as amended). It confirms that a person who has category code of “(c)(33)” has PRUCOL status for Medicaid and Child Health Plus only (*id.*).

Essential Plan

NYSOH must generally determine an applicant eligible for the Essential Plan, a basic health plan, if the person is (1) a resident of New York State, (2) expects to have a household income between 138% and 200% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL) or, in the case of an individual who is a lawfully present non-citizen who is ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus as a result of their immigration status, has a household income that is between 0% and 200% of the FPL, (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market, (4) is 64 years old or younger, (5) is a citizen or a lawfully present non-citizen, and (6) is not incarcerated (see 42 CFR § 600.305, 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4), 45 CFR § 155.305(e), NY Social Services Law § 369-gg(3), 42 USC § 18051).

Medicaid

A person who meets certain nonfinancial criteria and has a household income that is at or below the applicable Medicaid income standard is eligible for Medicaid benefits (45 CFR § 155.305(c)). One of the non-financial criteria for Medicaid eligibility is the immigration status of the person applying for health insurance. A person is eligible for Medicaid when his or her immigration status is satisfactory and he or she meets all other requirements for Medicaid.

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults who: (1) are age 19 or older and under age 65, (2) are not pregnant, (3) are not entitled to or enrolled for

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Medicare benefits under part A or B of title XVIII of the Act, (4) are not otherwise eligible for and enrolled for mandatory coverage under a State's Medicaid State plan in accordance with subpart B of this part, and (5) have a household modified adjusted gross income (MAGI) that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size (42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)), NY Social Services Law § 366(1)(b)).

In an analysis of Medicaid eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL “for the applicable budget period used to determine an individual's eligibility” (42 CFR § 435.4). On the date of your application, that was the 2017 FPL, which is \$12,060.00 for a one-person household (82 Federal Register 8831).

Financial eligibility for Medicaid for applicants who are not currently receiving Medicaid benefits is based on current monthly household income and family size (42 CFR § 435.603(h)(1); State Plan Amendment (SPA) 13-0055-MM3, as approved March 19, 2014).

Legal Analysis

The issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were not eligible to enroll in coverage through NYSOH as of July 2, 2017, because you are not considered lawfully present.

NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notices stating that you were eligible to enroll in the Essential Plan for a limited time, effective April 1, 2017. Your eligibility was contingent on you providing documentation of your immigration status and proof of household income.

According to your NYSOH account, on June 7, 2017 the income documentation you submitted was verified and you were determined eligible for advance premium tax credit of \$221.00 per month for a limited period of time. The eligibility determination notice issued on June 8, 2017 stated that NYSOH was checking federal data sources to confirm your immigration status.

On June 13, 2017, NYSOH verified the I-766 Employment Authorization card with a code of “C-33” that you submitted on June 7, 2017 as valid proof of immigration status. At that time, an updated application was submitted on your behalf using your listed annual household income of \$32,072.82 and your status as an immigrant non-citizen.

As a result, on June 14, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were not qualified to enroll in coverage through NYSOH because the documentation you provided showed that you were not lawfully present. The notice also stated that you were not eligible for Medicaid because your

household income \$32,072.82 was over the allowable income limit for that program.

On June 30, 2017, you updated your NYSOH account with an annual household income of \$30,628.00 and an updated application for financial assistance was submitted. On July 1, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination stating that you were not qualified to enroll in coverage through NYSOH because the documentation you provided showed that you were not lawfully present. The notice also stated that you were not eligible for Medicaid because your household income of \$30,628.00 was over the allowable income limit for that program.

Your employment authorization documentation states you are an immigrant non-citizen with a C-33 status. The status of C-33, according to USCIS and SSA is in reference to a status classified as Deferred Action on Childhood Arrivals. Individuals who have obtained an Employment Authorization card with the status of C-33 category are persons considered not “lawfully present” for purposes of the federal definition and are therefore not recognized as eligible to receive federal funding under those programs.

However, NY State has consistently recognized persons with Deferred Action status within the accepted meaning of “*PRUCOL alien*”; even though the federal government has not. The New York Court of Appeals ruled, in *Aliessa, et al. v. Novello* (96 NY 2d 418 [2001]), that New York must provide state-funded Medicaid to the lawfully residing immigrants who had been excluded from access to the federal Medicaid program.

Since your current Deferred Action status does confer PRUCOL status for individuals seeking Medicaid eligibility, we may review whether you met the financial criteria for Medicaid.

You are in a one-person household for the purpose of this analysis. This is because you expect to file your 2017 income taxes as single and will claim no dependents on that tax return.

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults between the ages of 19 and 65 who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income (MAGI) that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your applications, the relevant FPL was \$12,060.00 for a one-person household. Since \$30,628.00 is 253.96% of the 2017 FPL, NYSOH properly found you to be ineligible for Medicaid on an expected annual income basis, using the information provided in your June 30, 2017 application.

Financial eligibility for Medicaid can also be based on current monthly household income and family size.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

According to your NYSOH account, you receive income of approximately \$2,400.00 every month from employment.

To be eligible for Medicaid, you would need to meet the non-financial criteria and have an income no greater than 138% of the FPL, which is \$1,387.00 per month. Since the documentation you provided shows that you earned approximately \$2,400.00 every month, which is over the maximum allowable monthly income limit to be Medicaid eligible, you do not qualify for Medicaid on the basis of monthly income as of the date of your June 30, 2017 application.

Finally, federal regulations require that a person seeking enrollment in a qualified health plan through the NYSOH have United States citizenship or satisfactory or immigration status. Under the federal regulations, individuals with Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals status are not considered to be lawfully present for the purposes of obtaining coverage in a qualified health plan through NYSOH. It necessarily follows that such individuals also cannot qualify for advance premium tax credits or the Essential Plan.

Accordingly, July 1, 2017 eligibility determination notice properly found you to be ineligible to enroll in a qualified health plan, for advance premium tax credits, or the Essential Plan based on you not being lawfully present. Additionally, your ineligibility for Medicaid was properly based on your annual household income being over the limit for that program, not your legal presence.

Decision

The June 8, 2017 disenrollment notice is AFFIRMED.

The July 1, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

Effective Date of this Decision: November 3, 2017

How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

You are not eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan, to receive advance premium tax credits, or enroll in the Essential Plan because you are not lawfully present.

Although you qualify as a PRUCOL alien for state-based Medicaid, you are not eligible for Medicaid at this time because your household income is over the maximum allowable income limit.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

This Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:
Health Insurance Marketplace
Attn: Appeals
465 Industrial Blvd.
London, KY 40750-0061
- By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:

NY State of Health Appeals
P.O. Box 11729

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Albany, NY 12211

- By fax: 1-855-900-5557

Summary

The June 8, 2017 disenrollment notice is AFFIRMED.

The July 1, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

You are not eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan, to receive advance premium tax credits, or enroll in the Essential Plan because you are not lawfully present.

Although you qualify as a PRUCOL alien for state-based Medicaid, you are not eligible for Medicaid at this time because your household income is over the maximum allowable income limit.

Legal Authority

We are issuing this determination in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:



Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

Español (Spanish)

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助，請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件，请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您提供相应语种的口译服务。

Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

한국어 (Korean)

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

العربية (Arabic)

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 1-855-355-5777. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجاناً.

বাংলা (Bengali)

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई निःशुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

Twi (Twi)

Krataa yi ye tow krataa a ho hia. Se wo hia eho nkyerekyeremu a, ye sre wo, fre 1-855-355-5777. ye&btumi ama wo obi a okyerε kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

(Urdu) اردو

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم 1-855-355-5777 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

אידיש (Yiddish)

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).