



STATE OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211

## Notice of Decision

Decision Date: November 08, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]  
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000020761



On October 6, 2017, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's July 23, 2017 eligibility determination notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:  
NY State of Health Appeals  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211
- Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the NY State of Health Account ID at the top of this notice.

### Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

This page intentionally left blank.

STATE OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211

## Decision

Decision Date: November 08, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]  
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000020761



## Issue

The issue presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health is:

Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly determine that you were eligible to receive up to \$56.00 per month in advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC), not eligible for cost-sharing reductions, and not eligible for the Essential Plan, effective September 1, 2017?

## Procedural History

On July 22, 2017, you updated your application for financial assistance. That same day, NYSOH issued a preliminary eligibility determination stating in part that you were eligible to receive up to \$56.00 in APTC and ineligible to receive cost-sharing reductions, effective September 1, 2017.

Also on July 22, 2017, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed the preliminary eligibility determination insofar as you were not eligible for the Essential Plan.

On July 23, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were eligible to receive up to \$56.00 in APTC and ineligible to receive cost-sharing reductions, effective September 1, 2017. The notice also stated that you were not eligible for Medicaid and the Essential Plan because your income was over the allowable income limit for those programs.

On October 6, 2017, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and held

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

open until October 21, 2017 to allow you time to submit supporting documentation.

On October 18, 2017, you submitted proof of your income for June 2017, including six consecutive weekly paystubs, dated June 2, 2017 through July 7, 2017; [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] These documents were made part of the record as "Appellant's Exhibit A." No further documentation was received as of October 21, 2017 and the record is now closed.

## Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) According to your NYSOH account and your testimony, you expect to file your 2017 taxes with a tax filing status of single. You will claim no dependents on that tax return.
- 2) You are seeking insurance for yourself.
- 3) The application that was submitted on July 22, 2017, listed annual household income of \$41,450.00, consisting of \$41,450.00 you earn from your employment. You testified that this is incorrect because it includes a one-time severance bonus in the amount of \$16,000.00.
- 4) You testified that when you applied, you were no longer working your primary job and you were only working two to three days in a different [REDACTED] and had no other income in the months of June 2017 and July 2017.
- 5) On October 18, 2017, you submitted documentation showing that your total average monthly income from [REDACTED] as of the date of your application was \$1,141.65, based paystubs dated June 16, 2017 through July 7, 2017 (in the amounts of \$228.24, \$192.23, \$211.46 and \$313.55) [REDACTED]. These earnings total approximately \$14,841.45 in expected 2017 annual income (Totaled and divided by 4 weeks for an average weekly wage times 52 weeks).
- 6) You testified that, as of September 2017, your hours at your current job have increased and you are making \$595.00 per week based off a 35-hour work week at \$17.00 per hour.

- 7) The submitted documentation further shows that you are no longer working for [REDACTED] and that your last paystub from that employer was dated May 17, 2017, which included your one-time bonus in the amount of \$16,421.17. It also shows that you have had no income from [REDACTED] since February 13, 2017.
- 8) According to your NYSOH account and your testimony, you will not be taking any deductions on your 2017 tax return.
- 1) According to your NYSOH account, and your testimony, you live in [REDACTED].

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

## **Applicable Law and Regulations**

### Gross Income

Gross income means all income from whatever source derived, unless excluded by law. Gross income includes income realized in any form, whether in money, property or services (26 CFR § 1.61-1).

### Modified Adjusted Gross Income

NYSOH bases its eligibility determinations on modified adjusted gross income as defined in the federal tax code (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). The term “modified adjusted gross income” means adjusted gross income increased by (1) any income that was excluded under 26 USC § 911 for United States citizens or residents living abroad, (2) tax-exempt interest received or accrued, and (3) Social Security benefits that were excluded from gross income under 26 USC § 86 (see 26 USC § 36B(d)(2)(B), 26 CFR § 1.36B-1(e)(2)).

“Adjusted gross income” means, in the case of an individual taxpayer, gross federal taxable income minus certain specific deductions, such as expenses reimbursed by an employer, losses from sale or exchange of property, losses from premature withdrawal of funds from time savings accounts, deductions attributable to royalties, and certain retirement savings (26 USC § 62(a)).

### Advance Payments of Premium Tax Credit

Advance payments of the premium tax credit are generally available to a person who is eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan and (1) expects to have a household income between 138% and 400% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL), (2) expects to file a tax return and claim a personal exemption

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

deduction for a person who meets the eligibility requirements to enroll in a QHP, and (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market (see 45 CFR § 155.305(f), 42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)).

The maximum amount of APTC that can be authorized equals:

- 1) the cost of the health insurance premium for the taxpayer's coverage family in the second lowest cost silver plan offered through NY State of Health in the county where the taxpayer resides

*minus*

- 2) the taxpayer's expected contribution amount

(see 26 USC § 36B, 26 CFR § 1.36B-3).

The taxpayer's expected contribution amount is the amount that the taxpayer is expected to spend on health insurance premiums. The expected contribution for 2017 is set by federal law at 2.04% to 9.69% of household income (26 USC § 36B(b)(3)(A), 26 CFR § 1.36B-3T(g)(1), IRS Rev. Proc.2016-24).

In an analysis of APTC eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR §§ 155.300(a), 155.305(f)(1)(i)). On the date of your application, that was the 2016 FPL, which is \$11,880.00 for a one-person household (81 Federal Register 4036).

For annual household income in the range of at least 200% but less than 250% of the 2016 FPL, the expected contribution is between 6.43% and 8.21% of the household income (26 CFR § 1.36B-3T(g)(1), 45 CFR § 155.300(a), IRS Rev. Proc. 2016-24).

### Cost-Sharing Reductions

Cost-sharing reductions are available to a person who (1) is eligible to enroll in a QHP through NYSOH, (2) meets the requirements to receive APTC, (3) is expected to have an annual household income that does not exceed 250% of the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested, and (4) is enrolled in a silver-level QHP (45 CFR § 155.300(a), 45 CFR § 155.305(g)(1)).

### Essential Plan

NYSOH must generally determine an applicant eligible for the Essential Plan, a basic health plan, if the person is (1) a resident of New York State, (2) expects to

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

have a household income between 138% and 200% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL) or, in the case of an individual who is a lawfully present non-citizen who is ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus as a result of their immigration status, has a household income that is between 0% and 200% of the FPL, (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market, (4) is 64 years old or younger, (5) is a citizen or a lawfully present non-citizen, and (6) is not incarcerated (see 42 CFR § 600.305, 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4), 45 CFR § 155.305(e), NY Social Services Law § 369-gg(3), 42 USC § 18051).

In an analysis of Essential Plan eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL in effect on the first day of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). On the date of your application, that was the 2016 FPL, which is \$11,880.00 for a one-person household (81 Fed. Reg. 4036).

The Essential Plan is considered minimum essential coverage therefore, a person who is eligible for the Essential Plan is not eligible for any premium tax credit because they are eligible for minimum essential coverage through the individual market (see 26 CFR § 1.36B-2(c)(1), 26 USC § 5000A(f)(1)(C)).

## **Legal Analysis**

The first issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were eligible for an APTC of up to \$56.00 per month, not eligible for CSR; and not eligible for the Essential Plan, effective September 1, 2017.

The application that was submitted on August 2, 2017 listed annual household income of \$41,450.00, consisting of \$41,450.00 you earn from your employment. NYSOH relied on this information. However, you testified, and submitted documentation, that the income information in your application used by NYSOH was incorrect because it included a one-time bonus in the amount of \$16,000.00. You further testified that when you applied, you were no longer working your primary job and you were only working two to three days in a different vineyard and had no other income in the months of June 2017 and July 2017.

Nonetheless, NYSOH bases its eligibility determinations on modified adjusted gross income as defined in the federal tax code. Since your bonus of \$16,000.00 is part of your gross income that must be included in your eligibility determination, NYSOH properly determined your annual household income to be \$41,450.00.

You expect to file your 2017 income taxes as single and will claim no dependents on that tax return. Therefore, for purposes of these analyses, you are in a one-person household.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

According to your NYSOH account and your testimony, you live in [REDACTED] where the second lowest cost silver plan available for an individual through NYSOH costs \$390.79 per month.

An annual income of \$41,450.00 is 348.06% of the 2016 FPL for a one-person household. At 348.06% of the FPL, the expected contribution to the cost of the health insurance premium in 2017 is 9.69% of income, or \$334.71 per month.

The maximum amount of APTC that can be approved equals the cost of the second lowest cost silver plan available through NYSOH for an individual in your county (\$390.79 per month) minus your expected contribution (\$334.71 per month), which equals \$56.08 per month. Therefore, rounding to the nearest dollar, NYSOH correctly determined you to be eligible for up to \$56.00 per month in APTC, based on the information you provided in your application.

The second issue under review is whether you were properly found ineligible for cost-sharing reductions. Cost-sharing reductions are available to a person who has a household income no greater than 250% of the FPL. Since a household income of \$41,450.00 is 348.06% of the applicable FPL, NYSOH correctly found you to be ineligible for cost sharing reductions, based on the information you provided in your application.

The third issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan, effective September 1, 2017.

The Essential Plan is provided through NYSOH to individuals who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is between 138% and 200% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was \$11,880.00 for a one-person household. Since an annual household income of \$41,450.00 is 348.06% of the 2016 FPL, NYSOH properly found you to be eligible for the Essential Plan, based on the information you provided in your application.

Your submitted documentation shows that your total average monthly income as of the date of your application was \$1,141.65, based paystubs dated June 16, 2017 through July 7, 2017 (in the amounts of \$228.24, \$192.23, \$211.46 and \$313.55) [REDACTED]. These earnings total approximately \$14,841.45 in expected 2017 annual income (Totaled and divided by 4 weeks for an average weekly wage times 52 weeks).

Since the July 23, 2017 eligibility determination notice properly stated that, based on the information you provided, you were eligible for \$56.00 APTC, not eligible for cost-sharing reductions, and not eligible for the Essential Plan, it is correct and is AFFIRMED.



## **Decision**

The July 23, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

**Effective Date of this Decision:** November 08, 2017

## **How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility**

You remain eligible for up to \$56.00 in APTC.

You are not eligible for cost-sharing reductions.

You are not eligible for the Essential Plan.

## **If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)**

This Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

Health Insurance Marketplace  
Attn: Appeals  
465 Industrial Blvd.  
London, KY 40750-0061

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

- By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

### **If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):**

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:  
NY State of Health Appeals  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211
- By fax: 1-855-900-5557

### **Summary**

The July 23, 2017 eligibility determination notice is **AFFIRMED**.

You remain eligible for up to \$56.00 in APTC.

You are not eligible for cost-sharing reductions.

You are not eligible for the Essential Plan.

### **Legal Authority**

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

**A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:**



## **Getting Help in a Language Other than English**

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

### **Español (Spanish)**

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

### **中文 (Traditional Chinese)**

這是重要的文件。如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助，請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

### **Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)**

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

### **中文 (Simplified Chinese)**

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件，请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

### **Italiano (Italian)**

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

### **한국어 (Korean)**

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

### **Русский (Russian)**

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

### **العربية (Arabic)**

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 1-855-355-5777. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجاناً.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

## (Bengali)

1-855-355-5777

## Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

## हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

## 日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

## नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई निःशुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

## Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

## Twí (Twi)

Krataa yi ye tow krataa a ho hia. Se wo hia eho nkyerekyeremu a, ye sre wo, fre 1-855-355-5777. ye&etumi ama wo obi a okyerE kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

## (Urdu) اردو

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم 1-855-355-5777 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

## Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

**אידיש (Yiddish)**

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.