STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
PO Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

## Notice of Decision

Decision Date: January 17, 2018
NY State of Health Account ID:
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000022554


On December 18, 2017, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's September 30, 2017 eligibility determination.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:

NY State of Health Appeals
PO Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

- Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the NY State of Health Account ID at the top of this notice.

## Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § $155.545(b)$.

## This page intentionally left blank.

STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
PO Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

## Decision

Decision Date: January 17, 2018
NY State of Health Account ID: Appeal Identification Number: AP000000022554


## Issues

The issues presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health are:
Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly determine you were eligible to receive up to $\$ 202.00$ per month in advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC), effective November 1, 2017?

Did NYSOH properly determine you were not eligible for cost-sharing reductions (CSR)?

Did NYSOH properly determine you were not eligible for the Essential Plan, effective November 1, 2017?

Did NYSOH properly determine you were not eligible for Medicaid?

## Procedural History

On September 19, 2017, NYSOH received an updated application for financial assistance with health insurance submitted on your behalf. That day, a preliminary eligibility determination was prepared, stating you were eligible to receive up to \$202.00 in APTC, effective November 1, 2017.

Also on September 19, 2017, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed insofar as you were not eligible for more financial assistance.

On September 30, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility determination, based on the September 19, 2017 application, stating you were eligible to
receive up to $\$ 202.00$ in APTC, effective November 1, 2017. The notice indicated you were not eligible for CSR, the Essential Plan, or Medicaid, because your household income was over the allowable income limits for those programs.

On December 18, 2017, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and held open to allow you to submit supporting documents. On January 2, 2018, the Appeals Unit received your documentation which was incorporated into the record as Appellant's Exhibit \#1. The record closed thereafter.

## Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

1) On September 19, 2017, your application was updated over the phone.
2) The application listed your annual expected income for 2017 as
$\$ 33,800.00$ consisting of income you earned at your employment at a rate of $\$ 13.00$ an hour for 50 hours per week.
3) You testified that you are not sure if the annual income amount listed in your application was accurate, because you do not always work the same number of hours.
4) You testified you have worked for the same employer for all of 2017. You testified that you earn \$13.00 an hour and "time and a half" for any time worked over 40 hours. You testified that your hours fluctuate.
5) NYSOH determined you eligible for receive up to $\$ 202.00$ in APTC and ineligible to receive CSR, based on the September 19, 2017 application.
6) You testified you are seeking review of your eligibility for the Essential Plan or Medicaid.
7) You testified, and your application indicates, you will not be taking any deductions on your 2017 tax return.
8) You testified, and your application indicates, you live in Westchester County.
9) On January 2, 2018, the Appeals Unit received four weekly paystubs for you including a paystub for check date of December 26, 2017 showing year to date gross earnings of $\$ 33,933.78$.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

## Applicable Law and Regulations

## Advance Payments of Premium Tax Credit

Advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC) are generally available to a person who is eligible to enroll in a QHP and (1) expects to have a household income between $138 \%$ and $400 \%$ of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL), (2) expects to file a tax return and claim a personal exemption deduction for a person who meets the eligibility requirements to enroll in a QHP, and (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market (see 45 CFR § 155.305(f), 42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)).

The maximum amount of APTC that can be authorized equals:

1) the cost of the health insurance premium for the taxpayer's coverage family in the second lowest cost silver plan offered through NYSOH in the county where the taxpayer resides
minus
2) the taxpayer's expected contribution amount
(see 26 USC § 36B, 26 CFR § 1.36B-3).
The taxpayer's expected contribution amount is the amount that the taxpayer is expected to spend on health insurance premiums. The expected contribution for 2017 is set by federal law at 2.04\% to $9.69 \%$ of household income (26 USC § 36B(b)(3)(A), IRS Revenue Procedure (RP) 2016-24).

In an analysis of APTC eligibility, the determination is based on the applicable FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested ( 45 CFR $\S \S 155.300$ (a), $155.305(\mathrm{f})(1)(\mathrm{i})$ ). On the date of your application, that was the 2016 FPL, which is $\$ 11,880.00$ for a one-person household (81 Federal Register 4036).

For annual household income in the range of at least $250 \%$ but less than $300 \%$ of the 2016 FPL , the expected contribution is between $8.21 \%$ and $9.69 \%$ of the household income (26 CFR § 1.36B-3, IRS RP 2016-24).

People who use the APTC to help pay health insurance premiums must file a federal tax return and reconcile their expected income (stated on NYSOH
application) with their actual income (stated on federal income tax return). Those who take less tax credit in advance than they can claim on the tax return may get the rest of it as an income tax refund or have their tax bill reduced. Those who take more tax credit in advance than they can claim on their tax return will owe the difference as additional income taxes (26 CFR § 1.36B-4).

## Cost-Sharing Reductions

Cost-sharing reductions (CSR) are available to a person who (1) is eligible to enroll in a QHP through NYSOH, (2) meets the requirements to receive APTC, (3) is expected to have an annual household income that does not exceed 250\% of the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested, and (4) is enrolled in a silver-level QHP (45 CFR § 155.300(a), 45 CFR § $155.305(\mathrm{~g})(1)$ ).

## Essential Plan

NYSOH must generally determine an applicant eligible for the Essential Plan, a basic health plan, if the person is (1) a resident of New York State, (2) expects to have a household income between $138 \%$ and $200 \%$ of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL) or, in the case of an individual who is a lawfully present noncitizen who is ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus as a result of their immigration status, has a household income that is between 0\% and 200\% of the FPL, (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market, (4) is 64 years old or younger, (5) is a citizen or a lawfully present non-citizen, and (6) is not incarcerated (see 42 CFR § 600.305, 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4), 45 CFR § 155.305(e), NY Social Services Law § 369-gg(3), 42 USC § 18051).

In an analysis of Essential Plan eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL in effect on the first day of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR § $155.300(\mathrm{a})$ ). On the date of your application, that was the 2016 FPL, which is $\$ 11,880.00$ for a one-person household (81 Federal Register 4036).

## Medicaid

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults who: (1) are age 19 or older and under age 65, (2) are not pregnant, (3) are not entitled to or enrolled for Medicare benefits under part A or B of title XVIII of the Act, (4) are not otherwise eligible for and enrolled for mandatory coverage under a State's Medicaid State plan in accordance with subpart B of this part, and (5) have a household modified adjusted gross income (MAGI) that is at or below 138\% of the FPL for the applicable family size (42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)), NY Social Services Law § 366(1)(b)).

In an analysis of Medicaid eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL "for the applicable budget period used to determine an individual's eligibility" (42 CFR $\S$ 435.4). On the date of your application, that was the 2017 FPL, which is $\$ 12,060.00$ for a one-person household (82 Federal Register 8831, 8832).

Financial eligibility for Medicaid for applicants who are not currently receiving Medicaid benefits is based on current monthly household income and family size (42 CFR § 435.603(h)(1); State Plan Amendment (SPA) 13-0055-MM3, as approved March 19, 2014).

## Legal Analysis

The first issue is whether NYSOH properly determined you were eligible to receive up to \$202.00 per month in APTC, effective November 1, 2017.

On September 19, 2017, your application was updated over the phone. That application listed your annual expected income for 2017 as $\$ 33,800.00$ consisting of income you earned at your employment at a rate of $\$ 13.00$ an hour for 50 hours per week. You testified you are not sure if the annual income amount listed in your application was accurate, because you do not always work the same number of hours. However, the subject eligibility determination relied upon the information you provided in that application.

The evidence establishes you are in a one-person household, because you will file your 2017 income taxes with a tax filing status of single and you will claim no dependents.

You reside in Westchester County, where the second lowest cost silver plan available for an individual through NYSOH costs $\$ 461.49$ per month.

An annual income of $\$ 33,800.00$ is $284.51 \%$ of the 2016 FPL for a one-person household. At $284.51 \%$ of the FPL, the expected contribution to the cost of the health insurance premium is $9.23 \%$ of income, or $\$ 259.98$ per month.

The maximum amount of APTC that can be approved equals the cost of the second lowest cost silver plan available through NYSOH for an individual in your county (\$461.49 per month) minus your expected contribution (\$259.98 per month), which equals $\$ 201.51$ per month. Therefore, rounding to the nearest dollar, NYSOH correctly determined you eligible for up to $\$ 202.00$ per month in APTC.

The second issue is whether you were properly found ineligible for CSR.
CSR are available to a person who has a household income no greater than $250 \%$ of the applicable FPL. Since a household income of $\$ 33,800.00$ is
284.51\% of the applicable FPL, over the $250 \%$ limit, NYSOH correctly found you to be ineligible for CSR.

The third issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined you were ineligible for the Essential Plan, effective November 1, 2017.

The Essential Plan is provided through NYSOH to individuals who meet the nonfinancial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is between $138 \%$ and $200 \%$ of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was $\$ 11,880.00$ for a one-person household. Since an annual household income of $\$ 33,800.00$ is $284.51 \%$ of the 2016 FPL, over the 200\% limit, NYSOH properly found you eligible for the Essential Plan.

The fourth issue is whether NYSOH properly determined were ineligible for Medicaid.

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults between the ages of 19 and 65 who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is at or below 138\% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was \$12,060.00 for a one-person household. Since $\$ 33,800.00$ is $280.27 \%$ of the 2017 FPL, NYSOH properly found you ineligible for Medicaid on an expected annual income basis, using the information provided in your application.

However, financial eligibility for Medicaid for applicants who are not currently receiving Medicaid benefits is based on current monthly household income and family size.

Based on the income information provided in the September 19, 2017 application, the system calculated your average monthly income as \$2,816.67. There is no evidence in the record contradicting that calculation.

To be eligible for Medicaid, you would need to meet the non-financial criteria and have an income no greater than $138 \%$ of the FPL, which is $\$ 1,387.00$ per month. Since the evidence indicates that you earned $\$ 2,816.67$ in September 2017, you do not qualify for Medicaid based on monthly income as of the date of your application.

Because the September 30, 2017 eligibility determination properly stated that, based on the information you provided, you were eligible for up to $\$ 202.00$ per month in APTC, ineligible for CSR, ineligible for the Essential Plan, and ineligible for Medicaid, it is correct and is AFFIRMED.

It is noted that you submitted income documentation including a paystub for the final weekly pay check of 2017, dated December 26, 2017, showing year to date
gross earnings of $\$ 33,933.78$. It is concluded that this evidence confirms the income information in the September 19, 2017 application. Thus, there is insufficient evidence to redetermine your eligibility for financial assistance based on the newly submitted income documentation.

## Decision

The September 30, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

Effective Date of this Decision: January 17, 2018

## How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

Based on the information in the September 19, 2017 application, you were eligible to receive up to $\$ 202.00$ per month in APTC, ineligible for CSR, ineligible for the Essential Plan, and ineligible for Medicaid.

This decision does not affect subsequent eligibility determinations.

## If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

If applicable, if you think a portion of your appeal should not be dismissed, you can ask us to vacate, or cancel, this dismissal. You must ask us in writing within 30 days after the date on this notice, showing good cause as to why the dismissal should be vacated. NYSOH's Appeals Unit will review your request. If your request is approved, another hearing will be scheduled for you. If your request is denied, NYSOH will tell you in writing. If you do not respond to the dismissed portion of your appeal within 30 days, your appeal will remain dismissed, and NYSOH will take no further action on your appeal.

Insofar as your appeal was decided, the Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

Health Insurance Marketplace
Attn: Appeals
465 Industrial Blvd.
London, KY 40750-0061

- By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

## If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:

NY State of Health Appeals
PO Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

- By fax: 1-855-900-5557


## Summary

The September 30, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.
Based on the information in the September 19, 2017 application, you were eligible to receive up to $\$ 202.00$ per month in APTC, ineligible for CSR, ineligible for the Essential Plan, and ineligible for Medicaid.

This decision does not affect subsequent eligibility determinations.

## Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

## A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:



## Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document．If you need help to understand it，please call 1－855－355－ 5777．We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak．

## Español（Spanish）

Este es un documento importante．Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo，llame al 1－855－355－5777．Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo．

## 中文（Traditional Chinese）

這是重要的文件。如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件内容方面的協助，請致電 1－855－355－5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

## Kreyòl Ayisyen（Haitian Creole）

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan．Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li，tanpri rele nimewo 1－855－355－5777． Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a．

## 中文（Simplified Chinese）

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件，请打电话至 1－855－355－5777。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

## Italiano（Italian）

Questo è un documento importante．Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1－855－355－5777． Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua．

## 한국어（Korean）

중요한 서류입니다．이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1－855－355－5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오．귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다．

## Русский（Russian）

Это важный документ．Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа，позвоните по телефону 1－855－355－5777．Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка．

## （العربية）（Arabic）

هتحثهو ثثقجة مهنًا. إذا كتّ بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتو اها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 5777-355-855-1. يُككنا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي

## বাংলা（Bengali）

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে，অনুগ্রহ করে 1－855－355－5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

## Francais（French）

Ceci est un document important．Si vous avez besoin d＇aide pour en comprendre le contenu，appelez le $1-855-355-5777$ ．Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue．

## हिंदी（Hindi）

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए，तो कृपया 1－855－355－5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

## 日本語（Japanese）

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は，1－855－355－5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料 で提供いたします。

## नेपाली（Nepali）

यो एउटा महत्त्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने，कृपया 1－855－355－5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई नि：शुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

## Polski（Polish）

To jest ważny dokument．W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1－855－355－5777．Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka，którym się posługujesz．

## Twi（Twi）

 ama wo obi a $0 k y e r \varepsilon$ kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee．

## （Urdu）ارددو

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { كى مادرى زبان ميس ايكى مفت مترجم فرابم كر سكتــ بيـ. }
\end{aligned}
$$

## Tiếng Việt（Vietnamese）

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng．Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này，vui lòng gọi 1－855－355－5777． Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị．

## אידיש（Yiddish）

דאם איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט．אויב איר דארפט הילף עם צו פארשטיין，ביטע רופט 1－855－355－5777．מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואם איר רעדט．

