

STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

#### **Notice of Decision**

Decision Date: January 12, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID:

Appeal Identification Number: AP000000023639



On January 8, 2018, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's September 30, 2017 eligibility determination notice and September 22, 2017 enrollment confirmation notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the Account ID at the top of this notice.

## **Legal Authority**

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.



STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

#### **Decision**

Decision Date: January 12, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID:

Appeal Identification Number: AP000000023639



#### Issue

The issue presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health is:

Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly determine that your enrollment in your Essential Plan was effective November 1, 2017?

## **Procedural History**

On August 17, 2016, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility determination stating that you were eligible for Medicaid effective October 1, 2016.

On August 2, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice that it was time to renew your health insurance. That notice stated that, based on information from federal and state sources, NYSOH could not make a decision about whether you would qualify for financial help paying for your health coverage, and that you needed to update your account between August 16, 2017 and September 15, 2017 or you might lose your coverage and financial assistance.

On August 4, 2017, you updated your application for financial assistance.

On August 5, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility determination stating that you were no longer eligible for Medicaid, however, your Medicaid coverage would continue until September 30, 2017.

No updates were made to your account between August 16, 2017 and September 15, 2017.

On September 17, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you are not eligible for Medicaid, Child Health Plus or the Essential Plan, or to receive tax credits or cost-sharing reductions to help pay for the cost of insurance. You also could not enroll in a qualified health plan at full cost. This was because you had not responded to the renewal notice and had not completed your renewal within the required time frame. Your eligibility ended October 1, 2017.

On September 21, 2017, NYSOH received your updated application for health insurance.

On September 22, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of enrollment confirmation, based on your plan selection on September 21, 2017, stating that you were enrolled in an Essential Plan with a plan enrollment start date of November 1, 2017.

On September 30, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility determination, based on your September 21, 2017 application, stating that you were eligible for the Essential Plan, effective November 1, 2017.

On October 24, 2017, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed insofar as your Essential Plan began on November 1, 2017 and not October 1, 2017.

On January 8, 2018, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and closed at the end of the hearing.

## **Findings of Fact**

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) You testified that you previously elected to receive all of your notices from NYSOH via electronic mail, however, you changed this preference after learning that you had not received an electronic alert regarding the August 2, 2017 renewal notice.
- 2) You testified that you did not receive any electronic alerts regarding any notice in your NYSOH account telling you that you needed to update your application in order to renew your eligibility. You also did not receive any renewal notice by regular mail.
- 3) During the hearing, you searched through your e-mail inbox to see if you had received an electronic alert from NYSOH on or around August 2, 2017. You testified that you could find no such electronic alert.

- 4) You testified that you received a phone call advising you that you needed to renew your coverage. You explained that this phone call is what prompted you to update your account on August 5, 2017. You went on to testify that you were unaware that your renewal had to be done between August 16, 2017 and September 15, 2017.
- You testified that you did not know that you had updated your account too early and that you needed to update your account again until you received a phone call from your Medicaid Managed Care plan carrier advising you that your coverage was going to lapse at the end of September 2017.
- The record reflects that on September 21, 2017, NYSOH received your updated application for health insurance. That day, you selected an Essential Plan for enrollment.
- 7) You testified that you are seeking for your Essential Plan to begin on October 1, 2017.
- 8) NYSOH uploaded an evidence packet to your NYSOH account. Contained within that evidence packet under the heading of "electronic notice requirement" is a three-page memorandum dated August 21, 2017. The memorandum sets forth the federal requirements regarding use of electronic communications and asserts that NYSOH is in compliance with federal regulation and guidance on the use of electronic notices. The memorandum asserts that "the electronic notification rules do not require that exchanges track and monitor consumers actual receipt of electronic notices".
- 9) NYSOH has submitted no evidence that an electronic alert was sent to you regarding the August 2, 2017 renewal notice.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

## **Applicable Law and Regulations**

#### Medicaid Renewal

In general, NYSOH must review Medicaid eligibility once every 12 months or "whenever it receives information about a change in a beneficiary's circumstances that may affect eligibility" (42 CFR § 435.916(a)(1), (d)). NYSOH must make its "redetermination of eligibility without requiring information from the individual if able to do so based on reliable information contained in the

individual's account or other more current information available to the agency, including but not limited to information accessed through any data bases accessed by the agency" (42 CFR § 435.916(a)(2)).

NYSOH must provide an individual with the annual redetermination notice, including the projected eligibility for coverage and financial assistance, and must require the qualified individual to report any changes within 30 days (45 CFR § 155.335(c), (e)). Once the 30-day period has lapsed, NYSOH must issue a redetermination as provided by the notice, with consideration given to any updates that may have been provided by the individual (45 CFR §155.335(h)).

An individual is eligible for fee-for-service Medicaid effective on the first day of the month if an individual was eligible any time during that month (42 CFR § 435.915(b); Medicaid Eligibility Changes under the Affordable Care Act (ACA) of 2010,13 ADM-03(III)(F)).

Medicaid Managed Care (MMC) plan enrollments received on or before the fifteenth day of the month are effective the first day of the following month. Enrollments received after the fifteenth day of the month are effective the first day of the second following month (Medicaid Managed Care Model Contract (Appendix H(6)(b)(ii) & (iii), effective 3/1/2014 – 2/28/2019; NY Social Services Law § 364-j(1)(c); 18 NYCRR § 360-10.3(h); Medicaid Eligibility Changes under the Affordable Care Act (ACA) of 2010,13 ADM-03(III)(F)).

#### **Electronic Notices**

Applicants may choose to receive notices and information from NYSOH either by electronic alerts or by regular mail. If the applicant elects to receive electronic notices, NYSOH must send an email or other electronic communication alerting the individual that a notice has been posted to the applicant's account (45 CFR § 155.230(d); 42 CFR §435.918(b)(4)).

Additionally, if an electronic alert regarding a notice in an individual's NYSOH account fails, NYSOH must send out the notice by regular mail within three days of the failed alert (42 CFR § 435.918(b)(5)).

#### Essential Plan Effective Date

For individuals seeking enrollment in an Essential Plan, New York State has elected to follow the same rules that NYSOH uses in determining effective dates for individuals seeking enrollment in qualified health plans (NY Social Services Law § 369-gg(4)(c); New York's Basic Health Plan Blueprint, p. 16, as approved January 2016; see https://www.medicaid.gov/basic-health-program/basic-health-program.html).

The effective date of coverage by an Essential Plan is determined by the date on which an applicant selects a plan for enrollment. For individuals who are eligible for enrollment, NYSOH must generally ensure that coverage is effective the first day of the following month for selections received by NYSOH from the first to the fifteenth of any month (45 CFR §§ 155.410(f)(2), 155.420(b)(1)(i); see also 42 CFR § 600.320). For selections received by NYSOH from the sixteenth to the last day of any month, NYSOH must ensure coverage is effective the first day of the second following month (45 CFR §§ 155.410(f)(2), 155.420(b)(1)(ii)).

## **Legal Analysis**

The issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that your enrollment in your Essential Plan was effective November 1, 2017.

You were found eligible for Medicaid effective October 1, 2016. You subsequently enrolled into a Medicaid Managed Care plan.

Generally, NYSOH must redetermine a qualified individual's eligibility for Medicaid once every 12 months without requiring information from the individual if able to do so based on reliable information contained in the individual's account or other more current information available to the agency. NYSOH's August 2, 2017 renewal notice stated that there was not enough information to determine whether you were eligible to continue your financial assistance for health insurance, and that you needed to update your application between August 16, 2017 and September 15, 2017, or your coverage and financial assistance might end.

Because you did not update your NYSOH account between August 16, 2017 and September 15, 2017, you were terminated from your coverage effective September 30, 2017.

However, you testified and the record reflects that you elected to receive alerts regarding notices from NYSOH electronically. Although NYSOH contends that it complies with federal mandates regarding electronic notices, there is no evidence in the file that NYSOH sent you an electronic alert notifying you of a new notice available in your account on or around August 2, 2017. You credibly testified that you did not receive any electronic alert regarding the notice that directed you to update the information in your NYSOH account. There is no evidence in your account showing that any email alert was sent to you regarding the need to renew your application, that any such electronic notice failed, or that the notice was later sent to you by regular mail.

Although the record reflects that you updated your NYSOH account on August 4, 2017, you credibly testified that this was in response to a phone call you received advising you that it was time to renew your coverage. Additionally, during the

hearing, you searched your e-mail inbox for an electronic alert from NYSOH on or around August 2, 2017, however, you could not find any such electronic alert.

Therefore, it is concluded that NYSOH did not give you the required notice that you needed to update your account.

You first renewed your eligibility for financial assistance through NYSOH for the upcoming coverage year on September 21, 2017, and therefore we must assume that the information you provided at that time is the information that would have been used had you been timely informed of the need to update your account, as stated in the renewal notice.

Had the information been submitted at that time, your eligibility for and enrollment in your Essential Plan would have begun as of October 1, 2017.

Therefore, the September 30, 2017 eligibility determination notice and the September 22, 2017 enrollment confirmation notice are MODIFIED to state that your eligibility for and enrollment in your Essential Plan was effective as of October 1, 2017.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to enroll you in your Essential Plan as of October 1, 2017.

#### Decision

The September 30, 2017 eligibility determination notice is MODIFIED to state that you were eligible for the Essential Plan effective October 1, 2017.

The September 22, 2017 enrollment confirmation notice is MODIFIED to state that your enrollment in your Essential Plan was effective as of October 1, 2017.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to enroll you in your Essential Plan as of October 1, 2017.

Effective Date of this Decision: January 12, 2018

## **How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility**

Your eligibility for and enrollment in your Essential Plan should have been effective October 1, 2017.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to begin your enrollment in your Essential Plan as of October 1, 2017.

## If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

This Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

Health Insurance Marketplace Attn: Appeals 465 Industrial Blvd. London, KY 40750-0061

By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

# If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

• By fax: 1-855-900-5557

## **Summary**

The September 30, 2017 eligibility determination notice is MODIFIED to state that you were eligible for the Essential Plan effective October 1, 2017.

The September 22, 2017 enrollment confirmation notice is MODIFIED to state that your enrollment in your Essential Plan was effective as of October 1, 2017.

Your eligibility for and enrollment in your Essential Plan should have been effective October 1, 2017.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to enroll you in your Essential Plan as of October 1, 2017.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to begin your enrollment in your Essential Plan as of October 1, 2017.

## **Legal Authority**

We are issuing this determination in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

## A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:



## **Getting Help in a Language Other than English**

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

#### **Español (Spanish)**

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

#### 中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。 如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助,請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

#### Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

#### 中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件,请打电话至 **1-855-355-5777**。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

#### Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

#### 한국어 (Korean)

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

#### Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

#### (Arabic)العربية

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 5777-355-855-1. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجانًا.

#### বাংলা (Bengali)

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

#### Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

## हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

#### 日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

## नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्त्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई नि:शुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छों।

#### Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

#### Twi (Twi)

Krataa yi yε tow krataa a ho hia. Sε wo hia εho nkyerεkyerεmu a, yε srε wo, frε 1-855-355-5777. yεbεtumi ama wo obi a okyerε kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

#### اردو(Urdu)

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم5777-355-855-1 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

## Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

#### אידיש (Yiddish)

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.

