



STATE OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211

## Notice of Decision

Decision Date: December 29, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]  
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000023698

[REDACTED]

Dear [REDACTED]

On December 27, 2017, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's September 30, 2017 eligibility determination notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:  
NY State of Health Appeals  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211
- Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the Account ID at the top of this notice.

### Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

This page intentionally left blank.



STATE OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211

## Decision

Decision Date: December 29, 2017

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]  
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000023698

[REDACTED]

## Issue

The issue presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health is:

Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly determine that you were not eligible to enroll in health insurance coverage through NYSOH?

## Procedural History

On September 29, 2017, you submitted an application for financial assistance through NYSOH.

On September 30, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were not eligible for Medicaid because your household income exceeded the income threshold. Further, you were not eligible for the Essential Plan, tax credits, or enroll in a qualified health plan because verification documents showed you were not lawfully present.

On October 25, 2017, you contacted NYSOH's Account Review Unit and requested an appeal insofar as you were determined not eligible for financial assistance or to purchase health insurance through NYSOH.

On December 27, 2017, you had a telephone hearing, with the assistance of Spanish interpreter [REDACTED] with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. Testimony was taken and the record was fully developed during the hearing. The record was closed at the end of the hearing.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

## Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) According to your NYSOH account and testimony, you are applying for health insurance for yourself.
- 2) According to your September 29, 2017 application and testimony, you expect to file a 2017 federal income tax return with the tax status of single and do not expect to claim any dependents on that tax return.
- 3) According to your September 29, 2017 application, you attested that you expect your 2017 household income to be \$19,760.00.
- 4) According to your September 29, 2017 application, you did not expect to claim any deductions on your 2017 federal income tax return.
- 5) According to your NYSOH account, you are an immigrant non-citizen.
- 6) According to your U.S. Employment Authorization card, your category code is C33 with an expiration date of [REDACTED] (see Documents [REDACTED]).
- 7) You testified that your immigration status has not changed.
- 8) You testified that you want to be determined eligible to enroll in health insurance through NYSOH.
- 9) According to your NYSOH account, you reside in [REDACTED], New York.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

## Applicable Law and Regulations

### Essential Plan

NYSOH must generally determine an applicant eligible for the Essential Plan, a basic health plan, if the person is (1) a resident of New York State, (2) expects to have a household income between 138% and 200% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL) or, in the case of an individual who is a lawfully present non-citizen who is ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus as a result of their immigration status, has a household income that is between 0% and 200% of the FPL, (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

the individual market, (4) is 64 years old or younger, (5) is a citizen or a lawfully present non-citizen, and (6) is not incarcerated (see 42 CFR § 600.305, 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4), 45 CFR § 155.305(e), NY Social Services Law § 369-gg(3), 42 USC § 18051).

### Qualified Health Plan/Essential Plan – Citizenship and Immigration Status

To enroll in a qualified health plan (QHP) through the Marketplace, an applicant must be a citizen or national of the United States or a non-citizen who is lawfully present in the United States and reasonably expects to become a citizen or remain a lawfully present noncitizen for the entire period for which enrollment is being sought (45 CFR § 155.305(a)(1); 45 CFR § 155.20; 42 CFR §600.305; 42 CFR § 600.5).

The federal regulations state that the following non-citizens are lawfully present:

- (1) A qualified alien as defined in section 431 of the Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Act (PRWORA) (8 U.S.C. 1641);
- (2) An alien in nonimmigrant status who has not violated the terms of the status under which he or she was admitted or to which he or she has changed after admission;
- (3) An alien who has been paroled into the United States pursuant to section 212(d)(5) of the Immigration and Nationality Act (INA) (8 U.S.C. 1182(d)(5)) for less than 1 year, except for an alien paroled for prosecution, for deferred inspection or pending removal proceedings;
- (4) An alien who belongs to one of the following classes:
  - (i) Aliens currently in temporary resident status pursuant to section 210 or 245A of the INA (8 U.S.C. 1160 or 1255a, respectively);
  - (ii) Aliens currently under Temporary Protected Status (TPS) pursuant to section 244 of the INA (8 U.S.C. 1254a), and pending applicants for TPS who have been granted employment authorization;
  - (iii) Aliens who have been granted employment authorization under 8 CFR 274a.12(c)(9), (10), (16), (18), (20), (22), or (24);
  - (iv) Family Unity beneficiaries pursuant to section 301 of Public Law 101-649 as amended;
  - (v) Aliens currently under Deferred Enforced Departure (DED) pursuant to a decision made by the President;

(vi) Aliens currently in deferred action status;

(vii) Aliens whose visa petitions have been approved and who have a pending application for adjustment of status;

(5) A pending applicant for asylum under section 208(a) of the INA (8 U.S.C. 1158) or for withholding of removal under section 241(b)(3) of the INA (8 U.S.C. 1231) or under the Convention Against Torture who has been granted employment authorization, and such an applicant under the age of 14 who has had an application pending for at least 180 days;

(6) An alien who has been granted withholding of removal under the Convention Against Torture; or

(7) A child who has a pending application for Special Immigrant Juvenile status as described in section 101(a)(27)(J) of the INA (8 U.S.C. 1101(a)(27)(J));

(8) *Exception.* An individual with deferred action under the Department of Homeland Security's deferred action for childhood arrivals process, as described in the Secretary of Homeland Security's June 15, 2012, memorandum, shall not be considered to be lawfully present with respect to any of the above categories in paragraphs (1) through (7) of this definition.

(45 CFR § 152.2).

#### Medicaid – Citizenship/Immigration Status

Medicaid must be provided to a United States citizen, a naturalized citizen, a qualified alien, and persons permanently residing in the United States under permanently residing under color of law (PRUCOL), and is eligible for medical assistance from the state (42 CFR § 435.406; NY Soc. Serv. Law § 122(1); 18 NYCRR § 360-3.2(j)).

A PRUCOL alien is a person who is residing in the United States with the knowledge and permission or acquiescence of the federal immigration agency and whose departure from the United States such agency does not contemplate enforcing (18 NYCRR §360-3.2(j)). The New York Department of Health regards aliens who have been issued an Employment Authorization Document (I-688B or I-766), and have the requisite category code, to be PRUCOL (08 OHIP/INF-4, dated August 4, 2008)).

The guide, “Key to I-766/I-688B, Employment Authorization Documents (EADs)”, defines certain codes on the USCIS Employment Authorization Documents” (08 MA/033, dated December 1, 2008, and as amended). It confirms that a person

who has category code of “(c)(33)” has PRUCOL status for Medicaid and Child Health Plus only (*id.*).

### Medicaid – Financial Eligibility

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults who: (1) are age 19 or older and under age 65, (2) are not pregnant, (3) are not entitled to or enrolled for Medicare benefits under part A or B of title XVIII of the Act, (4) are not otherwise eligible for and enrolled for mandatory coverage under a State's Medicaid State plan in accordance with subpart B of this part, and (5) have a household modified adjusted gross income (MAGI) that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size (42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)), NY Social Services Law § 366(1)(b)).

In an analysis of Medicaid eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL “for the applicable budget period used to determine an individual's eligibility” (42 CFR § 435.4). On the date of your application, that was the 2017 FPL, which is \$12,060.00 for a one-person household (82 Federal Register 8831).

Financial eligibility for Medicaid for applicants who are not currently receiving Medicaid benefits is based on current monthly household income and family size (42 CFR § 435.603(h)(1); State Plan Amendment (SPA) 13-0055-MM3, as approved March 19, 2014).

## **Legal Analysis**

The issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were not eligible to enroll in health insurance coverage through NYSOH.

On September 30, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were not eligible for Medicaid because your household income exceeded the income threshold. Further, you were not eligible for the Essential Plan, tax credits, or enroll in a qualified health plan because verification documents showed you were not lawfully present.

Federal regulations require that a person seeking enrollment in the Essential Plan or a qualified health plan must be a citizen of the United States or have a satisfactory immigration status.

The record reflects that you attested that you are an immigrant non-citizen and submitted your employment authorization card as proof of your immigration status. Your employment authorization card reflects that your current category code is C33, and you testified that your status has not changed.

Individuals with deferred action under the Department of Homeland Security's deferred action for childhood arrivals process are not considered to be "lawfully present." Since your status does not meet the definition of lawfully present, for the purposes of obtaining coverage in the Essential Plan or a qualified health plan, NYSOH correctly determined you to be ineligible to enroll in those coverages based on your immigration status.

NY State has recognized persons with Deferred Action status within the accepted meaning of "*PRUCOL alien*," even though the federal government has not. The New York Court of Appeals ruled, in *Aliessa, et al. v. Novello* (96 NY 2d 418 [2001]), that New York must provide state-funded Medicaid to the lawfully residing immigrants who had been excluded from access to the federal Medicaid program. Since your current Deferred Action status does confer PRUCOL status for individuals seeking Medicaid eligibility, your eligibility is contingent on whether you met the financial criteria for Medicaid.

The record reflects that you expected to file your 2017 federal income tax return with the tax status of single and did not expect to claim any dependents on that tax return. Therefore, you are in a one-person household for purposes of this analysis.

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults between the ages of 19 and 65 who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household income that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size. The relevant FPL was \$12,060.00 for a one-person household.

According to your September 29, 2017 application, you attested to a yearly income of \$19,760.00. Since \$19,760.00 is 163.85% of the 2017 FPL, NYSOH properly found you to be ineligible for Medicaid, based on the fact that your income exceeded the allowable income threshold.

Accordingly, the September 30, 2017 eligibility determination notice properly found you to be ineligible to enroll in the Essential Plan or QHP based on your immigration status, and ineligible for Medicaid based on your expected annual household income. Therefore, the September 30, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

## **Decision**

The September 30, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

**Effective Date of this Decision:** December 29, 2017

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).



## **How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility**

You are not eligible to enroll in the Essential Plan or a QHP based on your immigration status.

You are not eligible for Medicaid because your household income is over the maximum allowable income limit.

## **If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)**

This Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:  
Health Insurance Marketplace  
Attn: Appeals  
465 Industrial Blvd.  
London, KY 40750-0061
- By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

## **If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):**

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:  
NY State of Health Appeals  
P.O. Box 11729  
Albany, NY 12211
- By fax: 1-855-900-5557

## **Summary**

The September 30, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

You are not eligible to enroll in the Essential Plan or a QHP based on your immigration status.

You are not eligible for Medicaid because your household income is over the maximum allowable income limit.

## **Legal Authority**

We are issuing this determination in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

**A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:**



## **Getting Help in a Language Other than English**

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

### **Español (Spanish)**

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

### **中文 (Traditional Chinese)**

這是重要的文件。如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助，請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

### **Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)**

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

### **中文 (Simplified Chinese)**

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件，请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

### **Italiano (Italian)**

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

### **한국어 (Korean)**

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

### **Русский (Russian)**

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

### **العربية (Arabic)**

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 1-855-355-5777. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجانًا.

### **বাংলা (Bengali)**

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

### **Français (French)**

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

### **हिंदी (Hindi)**

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

### **日本語 (Japanese)**

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

### **नेपाली (Nepali)**

यो एउटा महत्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई निःशुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

### **Polski (Polish)**

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

### **Twi (Twi)**

Krataa yi ye tow krataa a ho hia. Se wo hia eho nkyerekyeremu a, ye sre wo, fre 1-855-355-5777. ye bɛtumi ama wo obi a okyerɛ kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

### **(Urdu) اردو**

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم 1-855-355-5777 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

### **Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)**

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

### **אידיש (Yiddish)**

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמענטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).