

STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Notice of Decision

Decision Date: February 7, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID: Appeal Identification Number: AP00000024509



On January 8, 2018, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's July 25, 2017 eligibility determination and disenrollment notices, July 30, 2017 enrollment confirmation notice and November 9, 2017 enrollment confirmation notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the Account ID at the top of this notice.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) §155.545.



STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Decision

Decision Date: February 7, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID:

Appeal Identification Number: AP000000024509



Issues

The issues presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health are:

Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly determine that your wife was newly eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost, effective September 1, 2017?

Did NYSOH properly determine that you were entitled to \$41.00 per month in advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC) effective September 1, 2017?

Procedural History

On November 16, 2016, you submitted a non-financial application for health insurance.

On November 17, 2016, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you and your wife were eligible for a full cost qualified health plan, effective January 1, 2017.

Also on November 17, 2016, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice stating that you and your wife were enrolled in a full cost qualified health plan with start date of January 1, 2017.

On April 20, 2017, NYSOH received you and your wife's application for financial assistance with health insurance. Also on that date, you uploaded income documentation consisting of your 2016 federal tax return.

On April 21, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice based on your April 20, 2017 application stating you and your wife were eligible for APTC, on a limited basis, for up to \$495.00 per month, effective June 1, 2017. The income listed in the application was \$51,037.00. The notice directed you to provide proof of income by July 19, 2017.

Also on April 21, 2017, NYSOH issued a letter confirming your and your wife's enrollment in a qualified health plan with a monthly premium responsibility of \$756.05 per month after your APTC of \$495.00 was applied. The notice stated your APTC was effective May 1, 2017.

As of July 24, 2017, NYSOH records reflect that your 2016 federal tax return had not been reviewed by NYSOH.

On July 24, 2017, NYSOH redetermined you and your wife's eligibility.

On July 25, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility redetermination stating that you were eligible for APTC in the amount of \$41.00 per month on a limited basis. The notice directed you to provide proof of income by August 3, 2017. The notice also stated that your wife was newly eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost because she did not provide the income documentation to verify the income listed in your application. This eligibility was effective September 1, 2017.

Also on July 25, 2017, NYSOH issued a disenrollment notice stating that your wife's coverage in her qualified health plan was ending effective August 31, 2017.

Also on July 25, 2017, NYSOH issued a letter confirming you remained enrolled in a qualified health plan effective January 1, 2017, with a monthly premium responsibility of \$584.52 per month with an APTC of \$41.00, effective September 1, 2017.

On July 27, 2017, NYSOH verified you and your spouse's 2016 tax return and redetermined your household income to be \$45,372.00.

On July 28, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating you and your wife were eligible for APTC up to \$559.00 per month, effective September 1, 2017.

Also on July 28, 2017, NYSOH issued a letter confirming your enrollment in a qualified health plan with a monthly premium responsibility of \$584.52, after your APTC of \$41.00 was applied. The notice stated that your APTC would be applied effective September 1, 2017. The notice also stated that your spouse was not enrolled in a health plan.

On July 29, 2017, you updated your NYSOH account and selected a health plan for your wife.

On July 30, 2017, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice stating that you and your wife were enrolled in a qualified health plan with an APTC of \$41.00 per month and a premium amount of \$1,210.05 per month, effective September 1, 2017.

On November 8, 2017, you updated your NYSOH account attesting to a household income of \$36,017.00.

On November 9, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating you and your wife were eligible for APTC up to \$687.00 per month, effective December 1, 2017.

Also on November 9, 2017, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice stating that you and your wife were enrolled in a qualified health plan with an APTC of \$41.00 per month and a premium amount of \$1,210.05 per month, effective September 1, 2017.

On November 17, 2017, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed the eligibility determination and enrollment confirmation notices insofar as you and your wife have not received the APTC that you both have been entitled to from September 1, 2017 through December 2017.

Also, on November 17, 2017, you updated your NYSOH account attesting to an annual household income of \$56,703.00.

On November 18, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility redetermination notice stating that you and your wife were eligible for an APTC up to \$622.00 per month, effective January 1, 2018.

Also, on November 18, 2017, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice stating that you and your wife were enrolled in a qualified health plan with an APTC of \$622.00 per month and a premium amount of \$731.67 per month, effective January 1, 2018.

On January 8, 2018, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and closed at the end of the hearing.

Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) You applied for financial assistance with your health insurance on April 20, 2017.
- 2) You testified that also on April 20, 2017 you uploaded your 2016 federal income tax return to your NYSOH account.
- 3) On April 21, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice based on your April 20, 2017 application stating you and your wife were eligible for APTC, on a limited basis, up to \$495.00 per month, effective June 1, 2017. The notice directed you to provide proof of income by July 19, 2017.
- 4) You testified that at or about this time that you contacted NYSOH and advised that you had previously uploaded your 2016 tax return as proof of income. You testified that the NYSOH representative advised you that it was an error that your 2016 income tax return had not yet been verified.
- 5) You and your spouse subsequently enrolled in a qualified health plan with an APTC of \$495.00 per month, with a start date of June 1, 2017.
- 6) On July 24, 2017, NYSOH redetermined you and your wife's eligibility.
- 7) On July 25, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility redetermination stating that you were eligible for APTC in the amount of \$41.00 per month on a limited basis. The notice directed you to provide proof of income by August 3, 2017. The notice also stated that your wife was newly eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost because your wife did not provide the income documentation to verify the income listed in your application. This eligibility was effective September 1, 2017.
- 8) You testified that you contacted NYSOH on July 27, 2017 and advised a NYSOH representative that you had submitted your 2016 tax return as proof of income on April 20, 2017 and that it was not yet reviewed or verified. You testified that the NYSOH representative advised you that your tax return would be reviewed that day.
- 9) NYSOH records reflect that your 2016 federal tax return was verified on July 27, 2017.
- 10)On July 28, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating you and your wife were eligible for APTC up to \$559.00 per month, effective September 1, 2017.

- 11)On July 30, 2017, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice stating that you and your wife were enrolled in a qualified health plan with an APTC of \$41.00 per month and a premium amount of \$1,210.05 per month, effective September 1, 2017.
- 12) You testified you reside in a two-person household, and will file your 2017 taxes as married filing jointly.
- 13) You testified that NYSOH did not timely review and verify your 2016 income tax return which you uploaded on April 20, 2017 until July 27, 2017.
- 14) You testified that NYSOH incorrectly determined that you did not timely submit proof of income resulting in your wife being disenrolled from her qualified health plan.
- 15) You testified that after your tax return was verified that you and your wife were determined eligible for an APTC of \$559.00 per month, effective September 1, 2017. However, after you enrolled in health plans, you and your wife were only granted an APTC of \$41.00 per month.
- 16) You testified that you need you and your wife's correct APTC to begin on September 1, 2017 because you had a substantially higher premium responsibility due for the months of September 2017 through December 2017.
- 17) You testified that you and your spouse began receiving APTC in the amount of \$622.00 per month, effective January 1, 2018 and that you are not disputing your APTC beginning January 1, 2018.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

Applicable Law and Regulations

Advance Payments of Premium Tax Credit

Advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC) are generally available to a person who is eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan (QHP) and (1) expects to have a household income between 138% and 400% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL), (2) expects to file a tax return and claim a personal exemption deduction for a person who meets the eligibility requirements to enroll in a QHP, and (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market (see 45 CFR § 155.305(f), 42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)).

The maximum amount of APTC that can be authorized equals:

 the cost of the health insurance premium for the taxpayer's coverage family in the second lowest cost silver plan offered through NY State of Health in the county where the taxpayer resides

minus

2) the taxpayer's expected contribution amount

(see 26 USC § 36B, 26 CFR § 1.36B-3).

The taxpayer's expected contribution amount is the amount that the taxpayer is expected to spend on health insurance premiums. The expected contribution for 2017 is set by federal law at 2.04% to 9.69% of household income (26 USC § 36B(b)(3)(A), 26 CFR § 1.36B-3T(g)(1), IRS Rev. Proc.2016-24).

In an analysis of APTC eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR §§ 155.300(a), 155.305(f)(1)(i)). On the date of your application, that was the 2016 FPL, which is \$16,020.00 for a two-person household (81 Federal Register 4036).

Redetermination During a Benefit Year

When a redetermination is issued because of a change in an applicant's information, NYSOH must generally make that redetermination effective on the first day of the month following the date NYSOH is notified of the change (45 CFR § 155.330 (f)(1)(ii)). However, NYSOH may determine that its policy will be that any change made after the 15th of any month will not be effective until the first of the second following month (45 CFR § 155.330(f)(2)).

When an eligibility redetermination results in a change in the amount of APTC for the benefit year, NYSOH must recalculate the amount of APTC in such a manner as to account for any advance payments already made on behalf of the tax filer, such that the recalculated advance payment amount is projected to result in total advance payments for the benefit year that correspond to the tax filer's total projected premium tax credit for that benefit year (45 CFR § 155.330(g)).

Enrollment in a Qualified Health Plan

The effective date of coverage by a qualified health plan is determined by the date on which an applicant selects a plan for enrollment. For individuals who are eligible for enrollment, NYSOH must generally ensure that coverage is effective the first day of the following month for selections received by NYSOH from the first to the fifteenth of any month (45 CFR §§ 155.410(f)(2), 155.420(b)(1)(i)). For

selections received by NYSOH from the sixteenth to the last day of any month, NYSOH must ensure coverage is effective the first day of the second following month (45 CFR §§ 155.410(f)(2), 155.420(b)(1)(ii)).

Legal Analysis

The first issue whether NYSOH properly determined that your wife was newly eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost, effective September 1, 2017.

On November 17, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you and your wife were eligible for a full cost qualified health plan, effective January 1, 2017. You and your wife subsequently enrolled in a full cost qualified health plan with start date of January 1, 2017.

On April 20, 2017, NYSOH received your and your wife's updated application for financial assistance with your health insurance. Also on that date, you testified, and NYSOH records reflect that you uploaded your joint 2016 federal income tax return to your NYSOH account.

On April 21, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice based on your April 20, 2017 application stating you and your wife were eligible for APTC, on a limited basis, up to \$495.00 per month, effective June 1, 2017. The notice directed you to provide proof of income by July 19, 2017. You and your spouse subsequently enrolled in a qualified health plan with a start date of June 1, 2017.

You testified that at or about this time that you contacted NYSOH and advised that you had previously uploaded your 2016 tax return as proof of income. You testified that the NYSOH representative advised you that it was an error that your 2016 income tax return had not been reviewed or verified.

On July 25, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility redetermination stating that you were eligible for APTC in the amount of \$41.00 per month on a limited basis. The notice directed you to provide proof of income by August 3, 2017. The notice also stated that your wife was newly eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost because your wife did not provide the income documentation to verify the income listed in your application. This eligibility was effective September 1, 2017.

You testified that you contacted NYSOH on July 27, 2017 and advised a NYSOH representative that you had submitted your 2016 tax return as proof of income on April 20, 2017 and that it was not yet reviewed or verified. You testified that the NYSOH representative advised you that it would be reviewed that day. NYSOH records reflect that your 2016 federal tax return was validated on July 27, 2017.

Based on your testimony and NYSOH records, you timely provided proof of your household income on April 20, 2017. However, NYSOH did not determine that your 2016 federal tax return was valid until July 27, 2017. Due to NYSOH's failure to timely review your 2016 federal tax return, your wife was disenrolled from her qualified health plan effective August 31, 2017 after NYSOH incorrectly determined that she had not provided income documentation.

Therefore, that part of NYSOH's July 25, 2017 notice of eligibility determination stating that your wife was newly eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost, effective September 1, 2017, was incorrect and is RESCINDED. Also, the July 25, 2017 disenrollment notice ending her qualified health plan coverage effective August 31, 2017 is RESCINDED.

The second issue is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were entitled to \$41.00 in APTC, effective September 1, 2017.

On July 25, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility redetermination stating that you were eligible for an APTC in the amount of \$41.00 per month on a limited basis. The notice directed you to provide proof of income by August 3, 2017. The notice also stated that your wife was newly eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost because she did not provide the income documentation to verify the income listed in your application. This eligibility was effective September 1, 2017.

As discussed above, due to NYSOH's failure to timely review your 2016 federal tax return, your wife was incorrectly disenrolled from her qualified health plan effective August 31, 2017.

As such, NYSOH incorrectly determined you (and not your wife) to eligible for an APTC of \$41.00, effective September 1, 2017. As your wife should have been eligible for APTC, your APTC should have been determined for you and your spouse effective September 1, 2017.

Therefore, NYSOH's July 25, 2017 eligibility determination notice and the July 30, 2017 and November 9, 2017 enrollment confirmation notice are RESCINDED and your case is being RETURNED to NYSOH to redetermine you and your wife's eligibility for financial assistance, effective September 1, 2017.

Decision

The July 25, 2017 eligibility determination and disenrollment notices are RESCINDED.

The July 30, 2017 enrollment confirmation notice is RESCINDED.

The November 9, 2017 enrollment confirmation notice is RESCINDED.

Your case is being RETURNED to NYSOH to redetermine you and your wife's eligibility for financial assistance, effective September 1, 2017.

Effective Date of this Decision: February 7, 2018

How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

NYSOH incorrectly determined that your wife was newly eligible for a full cost qualified health plan, effective September 1, 2017.

Your case is being RETURNED to NYSOH to redetermine you and your wife's eligibility for financial assistance, effective September 1, 2017.

If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

This Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

Health Insurance Marketplace Attn: Appeals 465 Industrial Blvd. London, KY 40750-0061 • By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

• By fax: 1-855-900-5557

Summary

The July 25, 2017 eligibility determination and disenrollment notices are RESCINDED.

The July 30, 2017 enrollment confirmation notice is RESCINDED.

The November 9, 2017 enrollment confirmation notice is RESCINDED.

NYSOH incorrectly determined that your wife was newly eligible for a full cost qualified health plan, effective September 1, 2017.

Your case is being RETURNED to NYSOH to redetermine you and your wife's eligibility for financial assistance, effective September 1, 2017.

Legal Authority

We are issuing this determination in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:



Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

Español (Spanish)

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。 如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助,請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件,请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

<u>한국어 (Korean)</u>

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

(Arabic)العربية

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 5777-355-855-1. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجانًا.

বাংলা (Bengali)

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নিখি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्त्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई नि:श्ल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

Twi (Twi)

Krataa yi ye tow krataa a ho hia. Se wo hia eho nkyerekyeremu a, ye sre wo, fre 1-855-355-5777. yebetumi ama wo obi a okyere kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

اردو(Urdu)

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم5777-355-485-1 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

אידיש (Yiddish)

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.