

STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH PO Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

#### Notice of Decision

Decision Date: March 29, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID:

Appeal Identification Number: AP000000025945



Dear ,

On February 21, 2018, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's December 19, 2017 eligibility determination notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:

NY State of Health Appeals PO Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the NY State of Health Account ID at the top of this notice.

## **Legal Authority**

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.



STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH PO Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Decision

Decision Date: March 29, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID:

Appeal Identification Number: AP000000025945



#### Issues

The issues presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health are:

Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly determine that you were eligible to receive up to \$378.00 per month in advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC), for a limited time, effective January 1, 2018?

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were eligible for costsharing reductions (CSR) for a limited time?

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan?

Did NY State of Health properly determine you were not eligible for Medicaid?

## **Procedural History**

On January 12, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility determination, stating that you were eligible for Medicaid, effective February 1, 2017. On January 19, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice, confirming your enrollment in a Medicaid Managed Care plan, effective February 1, 2017.

On December 2, 2017, NYSOH issued a renewal notice, advising you that NYSOH could not determine your continuing eligibility for financial assistance with health insurance. The notice directed you to update your application

between December 16, 2017 and January 18, 2018, so that your eligibility for the upcoming year could be determined.

On December 18, 2017, you applied for health insurance and financial assistance through NYSOH.

That day, a preliminary eligibility determination was prepared, stating that you were eligible to receive up to \$378.00 in APTC, as well as cost-sharing reductions if you enrolled in a silver level qualified health plan, both effective January 1, 2018.

Also on December 18, 2017, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed that preliminary eligibility determination notice insofar as you were not eligible for Medicaid.

On December 19, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were eligible to receive up to \$378.00 in APTC, as well as cost-sharing reductions if you enrolled in a silver level qualified health plan, both effective January 1, 2018. That notice also stated that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan or Medicaid because your annual household income was over the allowable income limits for those programs.

Also on December 19, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of enrollment, confirming that your enrollment in a qualified health plan (QHP), effective February 1, 2018, with APTC applied against the premium.

Also on December 19, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of enrollment, confirming that your enrollment in your Medicaid Managed Care plan would end effective December 31, 2017.

On February 7, 2018, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility determination, stating you were eligible for Medicaid for January 2018, and confirming that your coverage with your Medicaid Managed Care plan would continue through that month.

On February 8, 2018, NYSOH issued a notice stating that you were eligible for Medicaid, for a limited time, effective February 1, 2018. This was because you had been granted "Aid to Continue" pending the outcome of your appeal.

Also on February 8, 2018, NYSOH issued enrollment notices, confirming that your enrollment in your QHP did not go into effect, and that you were reenrolled in your Medicaid Managed Care plan.

On February 21, 2018, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and held open until March 18, 2018, to allow you time to submit supporting documents.

As of March 18, 2018, the Appeals Unit had not received any documents from you and none were viewable in your NYSOH account. Therefore, the record was closed that same day and this decision is based on the record as developed at the time of the hearing.

## **Findings of Fact**

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) You testified that you expect to file your tax return for 2018 with a tax filing status of single. You will claim no dependents on that tax return.
- 2) You are seeking insurance for yourself.
- 3) The application that was submitted on December 18, 2017 listed annual household income of \$24,504.84, consisting of \$15,624.84 you receive from your share of your ex-spouse's pension and \$8,880.00 in Social Security benefits.
- 4) You testified that you receive \$1,302.00 per month from your ex-spouse's pension, as well as \$740.00 per month in Social Security benefits.
- 5) Your application states that you will not be taking any deductions on your 2018 tax return.
- 6) Your application states that you live in Kings County.
- 7) You testified that you are and not qualified for Medicare, and you do not have access for subsidized housing. You cannot afford to buy insurance with your current level of financial assistance.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

## **Applicable Law and Regulations**

#### Advance Payments of Premium Tax Credit

APTC are generally available to a person who is eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan and (1) expects to have a household income between 138% and 400% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL), (2) expects to file a tax return and claim a personal exemption deduction for a person who meets the eligibility requirements to enroll in a qualified health plan, and (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market (see 45

CFR § 155.305(f), 26 CFR § 1.36B-2, 42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)).

The maximum amount of APTC that can be authorized equals:

 the cost of the health insurance premium for the taxpayer's coverage family in the second lowest cost silver plan offered through NY State of Health in the county where the taxpayer resides

minus

2) the taxpayer's expected contribution amount

(see 26 USC § 36B, 26 CFR § 1.36B-3).

The taxpayer's expected contribution amount is the amount that the taxpayer is expected to spend on health insurance premiums. The expected contribution for 2018 is set by federal law at 2.01% to 9.56% of household income (26 USC § 36B(b)(3)(A), 26 CFR § 1.36B-3, IRS Rev. Proc. 2017-36).

In an analysis of APTC eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR §§ 155.300(a), 155.305(f)(1)(i)). On the date of your application, that was the 2017 FPL, which is \$12,060.00 for a one-person household (82 Federal Register 8831).

For annual household income in the range of at least 200% but less than 250% of the 2017 FPL, the expected contribution towards health insurance premiums is between 6.34% and 8.1% of household income (26 CFR § 1.36B-3(g)(1), 45 CFR § 155.300(a), IRS Rev. Proc. 2017-36).

People who use the APTC to help pay health insurance premiums must file a federal tax return and reconcile their expected income (stated on NYSOH application) with their actual income (stated on their federal income tax return). Those who take less tax credit in advance than they can claim on the tax return may get the rest of it as an income tax refund or have their tax bill reduced. Those who take more tax credit in advance than they can claim on their tax return will owe the difference as additional income taxes (26 CFR § 1.36B-4).

#### Cost-Sharing Reductions

CSRs are available to a person who (1) is eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan through NYSOH, (2) meets the requirements to receive APTC, (3) is expected to have an annual household income that does not exceed 250% of the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which

coverage is requested, and (4) is enrolled in a silver-level qualified health plan (45 CFR § 155.300(a), 45 CFR § 155.305(g)(1)).

#### **Essential Plan**

NYSOH must generally determine an applicant eligible for the Essential Plan, a basic health plan, if the person is (1) a resident of New York State, (2) expects to have a household income between 138% and 200% of the applicable FPL or, in the case of an individual who is a lawfully present non-citizen who is ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus as a result of their immigration status, has a household income that is between 0% and 200% of the FPL, (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market, (4) is 64 years old or younger, (5) is a citizen or a lawfully present non-citizen, and (6) is not incarcerated (see 42 CFR § 600.305, 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4), 45 CFR § 155.305(e), NY Social Services Law § 369-gg(3), 42 USC § 18051).

In an analysis of Essential Plan eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL in effect on the first day of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). On the date of your application that was the 2017 FPL, which is \$12,060.00 for a one-person household (82 Fed. Reg. 8831).

The Essential Plan is considered minimum essential coverage; therefore, a person who is eligible for the Essential Plan is not eligible for any premium tax credit because they are eligible for minimum essential coverage through the individual market (see 26 CFR § 1.36B-2(c)(1), 26 USC § 5000A(f)(1)(C)).

#### Medicaid

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults who: (1) are age 19 or older and under age 65, (2) are not pregnant, (3) are not entitled to or enrolled for Medicare benefits under part A or B of title XVIII of the Act, (4) are not otherwise eligible for and enrolled for mandatory coverage under a State's Medicaid State plan in accordance with subpart B of this part, and (5) have a household modified adjusted gross income (MAGI) that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size (42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)), NY Social Services Law § 366(1)(b)).

In an analysis of Medicaid eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL "for the applicable budget period used to determine an individual's eligibility" (42 CFR § 435.4). On the date of your application, that was the 2017 FPL, which is \$12,060.00 for a one-person household (82 Fed. Reg. 8831).

#### Modified Adjusted Gross Income

NYSOH bases its eligibility determinations on modified adjusted gross income as defined in the federal tax code (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). The term "modified

adjusted gross income" means adjusted gross income increased by (1) any income that was excluded under 26 USC § 911 for United States citizens or residents living abroad, (2) tax-exempt interest received or accrued, and (3) Social Security benefits that were excluded from gross income under 26 USC § 86 (see 26 USC § 36B(d)(2)(B), 26 CFR § 1.36B-1(e)(2)).

"Adjusted gross income" means, in the case of an individual taxpayer, gross federal taxable income minus certain specific deductions, such as expenses reimbursed by an employer, losses from sale or exchange of property, losses from premature withdrawal of finds from time savings accounts, deductions attributable to royalties, and certain retirement savings (26 USC § 62(a)). Living expenses, such as rent and utilities are not an allowable deduction in computing adjusted gross income (*id.*).

## Legal Analysis

The first issue is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were eligible for up to \$378.00 per month in APTC.

The application that was submitted on December 18, 2017 listed an annual household income of \$24,504.84, and the corresponding eligibility determination relied upon that information.

During the hearing, you testified that the amount you provided in your application was correct. However, you asked that your current financial circumstances, including your and lack of subsidized housing, be considered.

Since the Internal Revenue Service rules do not allow living expenses to be deducted from the calculation of your adjusted gross income, they cannot be deducted when the NYSOH computes your modified adjusted gross income for APTC purposes. Therefore, NYSOH correctly determined your eligibility based on the annual household income you submitted, \$24,504.84.

You are in a one-person household. You expect to file your 2018 income tax return as single and will claim no dependents on that tax return.

You reside in Kings County, where the second lowest cost silver plan available for an individual through NYSOH costs \$509.30 per month.

An annual income of \$24,504.84 is 203.19% of the 2017 FPL for a one-person household. At 203.19% of the FPL, the expected contribution to the cost of the health insurance premium is 6.45% of income, or \$131.71 per month.

The maximum amount of APTC that can be approved equals the cost of the second lowest cost silver plan available through NYSOH for an individual in your

county (\$509.30 per month) minus your expected contribution (\$131.71 per month), which equals \$377.59 per month. Therefore, rounding to the nearest dollar, NYSOH correctly determined that you were eligible to receive up to \$378.00 per month in APTC.

The second issue is whether you were properly determined eligible for CSR. CSRs are available to a person who has a household income no greater than 250% of the FPL. Since a household income of \$24,504.84 is 203.19% of the applicable FPL, NYSOH correctly found you to be eligible for CSR.

The third issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined you were ineligible for the Essential Plan.

The Essential Plan is generally provided through NYSOH to individuals who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is between 138% and 200% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was \$12,060.00 for a one-person household. Since an annual household income of \$24,504.84 is 203.19% of the 2017 FPL, NYSOH correctly found you to be ineligible for the Essential Plan.

The fourth issue is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were ineligible for Medicaid.

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults between the ages of 19 and 65 who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was \$12,060.00 for a one-person household. Since \$24,504.84 is 203.19% of the 2017 FPL, NYSOH properly found you to be ineligible for Medicaid on an expected annual income basis, using the information provided in your application.

Since the December 19, 2017 eligibility determination notice properly stated that, based on the information you provided, you were eligible for up to \$378.00 per month in APTC, eligible for cost-sharing reductions, ineligible for the Essential Plan and ineligible for Medicaid, it is correct and is AFFIRMED.

#### Decision

The December 19, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

You are not eligible for Medicaid or the Essential Plan, because your income is over the allowable limits for those programs, and your receipt of Medicaid under "Aid to Continue" will end.

Effective Date of this Decision: March 29, 2018

## How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

You remain eligible for up to \$378.00 in APTC and cost-sharing reductions.

You are ineligible for the Essential Plan and Medicaid.

Your receipt of Medicaid pending the completion of the appeals process will end.

## If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

If applicable, if you think a portion of your appeal should not be dismissed, you can ask us to vacate, or cancel, this dismissal. You must ask us in writing within 30 days after the date on this notice, showing good cause as to why the dismissal should be vacated. NYSOH's Appeals Unit will review your request. If your request is approved, another hearing will be scheduled for you. If your request is denied, NYSOH will tell you in writing. If you do not respond to the dismissed portion of your appeal within 30 days, your appeal will remain dismissed, and NYSOH will take no further action on your appeal.

Insofar as your case was decided, the Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

Health Insurance Marketplace

Attn: Appeals

465 Industrial Blvd. London, KY 40750-0061

• By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

# If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:

NY State of Health Appeals PO Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

• By fax: 1-855-900-5557

## Summary

The December 19, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

You are not eligible for Medicaid or the Essential Plan, because your income is over the allowable limits for those programs, and your receipt of Medicaid under "Aid to Continue" will end.

You remain eligible for up to \$378.00 in APTC and cost-sharing reductions.

You are ineligible for the Essential Plan and Medicaid.

Your receipt of Medicaid pending the completion of the appeals process will end.

## **Legal Authority**

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

## A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:



#### **Getting Help in a Language Other than English**

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

#### **Español (Spanish)**

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

#### 中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。 如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助,請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

#### Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

#### 中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件,请打电话至 **1-855-355-5777**。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

#### Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

#### 한국어 (Korean)

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

#### Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

#### (Arabic)العربية

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 5777-355-855-1. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها محانًا.

#### বাংলা (Bengali)

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

#### Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

#### हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

#### 日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

#### नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्त्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई नि:शुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

#### Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

#### Twi (Twi)

Krataa yi ye tow krataa a ho hia. Se wo hia eho nkyerekyeremu a, ye sre wo, fre 1-855-355-5777. yebetumi ama wo obi a okyere kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

#### اردو(Urdu)

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم5777-355-485-1 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجہ فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

#### Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

#### אידיש (Yiddish)

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.