

STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Notice of Decision

Decision Date: March 27, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID:

Appeal Identification Number: AP000000026185



Dear ,

On February 27, 2018, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's December 22, 2017 discontinuance notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the Account ID at the top of this notice.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.



STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Decision

Decision Date: March 27, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID:

Appeal Identification Number: AP000000026185



Issues

The issues presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health are:

Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly determine that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan, to receive tax credits or cost-sharing reductions to help pay for the cost of insurance, or to enroll in a qualified health plan at full cost through NYSOH as of January 1, 2018, because you were not considered lawfully present?

Did NYSOH properly determine that you were ineligible for Medicaid?

Procedural History

On November 8, 2017, you submitted an application for financial assistance.

On November 9, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice of eligibility determination stating that you were conditionally eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost through NYSOH, effective December 1, 2017. This notice directed you to submit proof of your immigration status by February 6, 2018.

On December 20, 2017, NYSOH received your updated application for health insurance.

On December 21, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice, based on your December 20, 2017 application, stating that you were eligible to enroll in the Essential Plan for a limited time, effective February 1, 2018. The notice stated that you were not eligible for Medicaid because your income was over the

allowable income limit for that program. The notice further stated that you needed to submit documentation of your immigration status by February 6, 2018 so that your eligibility could be confirmed.

Also on December 21, 2017, NYSOH received a copy of your I-776 Employment Authorization Card reflecting a category code of "C33." This document was reviewed and verified on that day as valid proof of your immigration status and an application was submitted on your behalf.

Also on December 21, 2017, NYSOH prepared a preliminary eligibility determination was regard to that application, stating that you were not eligible to purchase health insurance through NYSOH.

Additionally, on December 21, 2017, you contacted NYSOH's Account Review Unit and requested an appeal insofar as you were not eligible for coverage under the Essential Plan as of January 1, 2018.

On December 22, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility redetermination notice based on information verified on December 21, 2017. The notice stated that you were not eligible for Medicaid. This was because your income was over the allowable income limit for that program. The notice also stated that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan, to receive tax credits or cost-sharing reductions to help pay for the cost of insurance, or to enroll in a qualified health plan at full cost. This was because your "[v]erification documents show not lawfully present."

On January 27, 2018, you updated your application for financial assistance.

On January 28, 2018, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice. The notice stated that you were not eligible for Medicaid. This was because your income was over the allowable income limit for that program. The notice also stated that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan, to receive tax credits or cost-sharing reductions to help pay for the cost of insurance, or to enroll in a qualified health plan at full cost. This was because your "[v]erification documents show not lawfully present."

On February 27, 2018, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and held open until March 13, 2018, to allow you the opportunity to submit supporting documents.

On March 9, 2018, the Appeals Unit received via fax copies of nine of your paystubs. These documents were collectively marked as Appellant's Exhibit #1 and incorporated into the record. One of the paystubs was illegible therefore, an extension was granted to March 21, 2018 to allow you time to resubmit your paystubs. On March 20, 2018, the Appeals Unit received via fax copies of two of

your paystubs. These documents were marked as Appellant's Exhibit #2. The record is now closed.

Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) You testified that you expect to file your 2017 tax return with a tax filing status of single and you will not claim any dependents on that tax return.
- 2) You testified that you expect to file your 2018 tax return with a tax filing status of single and you will not claim any dependents on that tax return.
- 3) You are seeking insurance for yourself.
- 4) Your application states you are an immigrant non-citizen.
- 5) You uploaded a copy of your Employment Authorization card on December 21, 2017 with the status of C-33, which was verified on December 21, 2017.
- 6) The status of C-33, according to the United States Customs and Immigration Services (USCIS) and Social Security Administration (SSA) is in reference to a status classified as Deferred Action on Childhood Arrivals.
- 7) The applications that were submitted on November 8, 2017, December 20, 2017, and January 27, 2018, which requested financial assistance, listed annual household income of \$21,000.00, consisting of income you earn from employment. You testified that this amount is correct.
- 8) You submitted copies of ten of your paystubs;
 - a. The first is for pay date November 6, 2017 and pay period October 21, 2017 through November 3, 2017 for a gross pay amount of \$1,018.98 and a gross year to date amount of \$16,205.69;
 - b. The second is for pay date November 20, 2017 and pay period November 4, 2017 through November 17, 2017 for a gross pay amount of \$907.55 and a gross year to date amount of \$20,113.24;
 - c. The third is for pay date November 20, 2017 for a gross pay amount of \$50.00 and a gross year to date amount of \$20,163.24;
 - d. The fourth is for pay date December 4, 2017 and pay period 11/4/2017 to 11/17/2017 and does not show a gross pay amount or gross year to date amount;

- e. The fifth is for pay date December 4, 2017 and pay period December 1, 2017 through December 14, 2017 for a gross pay amount of \$50.00 and a gross year to date amount of \$20,213.24;
- f. The sixth is for pay date December 18, 2017 and pay period December 3, 2017 through December 16, 2017 for a gross pay amount of \$1,124.76 and a gross year to date amount of \$22,189.70:
- g. The seventh is for pay date January 2, 2018 for a gross pay amount of \$1,125.37;
- h. The eighth is for pay date January 15, 2018 for a gross pay amount of \$957.00;
- i. The ninth is for pay date January 26, 2018 for a gross pay amount of \$50.00;
- j. The tenth is for pay date January 29, 2018 for a gross pay amount of \$1,018.88.
- 9) You testified that you will not claim any deductions on your 2017 or 2018 tax return.
- 10) Your application states, and you confirmed that you live in Suffolk County.
- 11) You testified that you previously had coverage through the Child Health Plus program through your parents NYSOH account, but that you aged off of this program as of 2017.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

Applicable Law and Regulations

Essential Plan

NYSOH must generally determine an applicant eligible for the Essential Plan, a basic health plan, if the person is (1) a resident of New York State, (2) expects to have a household income between 138% and 200% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL) or, in the case of an individual who is a lawfully present noncitizen who is ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus as a result of their immigration status, has a household income that is between 0% and 200% of the FPL, (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market, (4) is 64 years old or younger, (5) is a citizen or a lawfully present non-citizen, and (6) is not incarcerated (see 42 CFR § 600.305, 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4), 45 CFR § 155.305(e), NY Social Services Law § 369-gg(3), 42 USC § 18051).

Qualified Immigrants Transitioned to the Essential Plan

In New York State, qualified immigrants who were formerly eligible for Medicaid through the state, but not eligible for Medicaid under federal law, were transitioned to the Essential Plan as of January 1, 2016 (New York's Basic Health Plan Blueprint, p. 19, as approved January 2016; see https://www.medicaid.gov/basic-health-program/basic-health-program.html). This category of qualified immigrants includes individuals lawfully admitted for permanent residence in the United States who are still in their first five years of permanent residency (18 NYCRR § 349.3, 8 USC § 1613).

Medicaid

A person who meets certain nonfinancial criteria and has a household income that is at or below the applicable Medicaid income standard is eligible for Medicaid benefits (45 CFR § 155.305(c)). One of the non-financial criteria for Medicaid eligibility is the immigration status of the person applying for health insurance. A person is eligible for Medicaid when his or her immigration status is satisfactory and he or she meets all other requirements for Medicaid.

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults who: (1) are age 19 or older and under age 65, (2) are not pregnant, (3) are not entitled to or enrolled for Medicare benefits under part A or B of title XVIII of the Act, (4) are not otherwise eligible for and enrolled for mandatory coverage under a State's Medicaid State plan in accordance with subpart B of this part, and (5) have a household modified adjusted gross income (MAGI) that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size (42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)), NY Social Services Law § 366(1)(b)).

In an analysis of Medicaid eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL "for the applicable budget period used to determine an individual's eligibility" (42 CFR § 435.4). On the date of your November 8, 2017 and December 20, 2017 applications, that was the 2017 FPL, which is \$12,060.00 for a one-person household (82 Fed. Reg. 8831). On the date of your January 27, 2018 application, that was the 2018 FPL, which is \$12,140.00 for a one-person household (83 Fed. Reg. 2642).

Financial eligibility for Medicaid for applicants who are not currently receiving Medicaid benefits is based on current monthly household income and family size (42 CFR § 435.603(h)(1); State Plan Amendment (SPA) 13-0055-MM3, as approved March 19, 2014).

Qualified Health Plan

To enroll in a qualified health plan (QHP) through the Marketplace, an applicant must be a citizen or national of the United States or a non-citizen who is lawfully present in the United States and reasonably expects to become a citizen or

remain a lawfully present noncitizen for the entire period for which enrollment is being sought (45 CFR § 155.305(a)(1)).

Advance Payments of Premium Tax Credit

Advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC) are generally available to a person who is eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan (QHP) and (1) expects to have a household income between 138% and 400% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL), (2) expects to file a tax return and claim a personal exemption deduction for a person who meets the eligibility requirements to enroll in a QHP, and (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market (see 45 CFR § 155.305(f), 42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)).

Cost-Sharing Reductions

Cost-sharing reductions (CSR) are available to a person who (1) is eligible to enroll in a QHP through NYSOH, (2) meets the requirements to receive APTC, (3) is expected to have an annual household income that does not exceed 250% of the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested, and (4) is enrolled in a silver-level QHP (45 CFR § 155.300(a), 45 CFR § 155.305(g)(1)).

Immigration Status

Generally, no person except a United States citizen, a naturalized citizen, a qualified alien, and persons permanently residing in the United States under color of law (PRUCOL), is eligible for medical assistance from the state (NY Soc. Serv. Law § 122(1); 18 NYCRR § 360-3.2(j)).

A PRUCOL alien is a person who is residing in the United States with the knowledge and permission or acquiescence of the federal immigration agency and whose departure from the United States such agency does not contemplate enforcing (18 NYCRR §360-3.2(j)). The New York Department of Health regards aliens who have been issued an Employment Authorization Document (I-688B or I-766), and have the requisite category code, to be PRUCOL (08 OHIP/INF-4, dated August 4, 2008)).

The guide, "Key to I-766/I-688B, Employment Authorization Documents (EADs)', defines certain codes on the USCIS Employment Authorization Documents" (08 MA/033, dated December 1, 2008, and as amended). It confirms that a person who has category code of "(c)(33)" has PRUCOL status for Medicaid and Child Health Plus only (id.).

Legal Analysis

The first issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were not eligible to enroll in the Essential Plan, to receive tax credits or cost-sharing reductions, or to enroll in a full cost qualified health plan through NYSOH, because you are not considered lawfully present.

On December 21, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were eligible to enroll in the Essential Plan for a limited time, effective February 1, 2018. Your eligibility was contingent on you providing documentation of your immigration status.

Also on December 21, 2017, you provided to NYSOH a copy of your I-766 EAC. That same day, this information was verified and an application was submitted to NYSOH on your behalf. That application listed an annual household income of \$21,000.00. and reflected that you were an immigrant non-citizen.

As a result, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were not qualified to enroll in coverage through NYSOH because the documentation you provided showed that you were not lawfully present. Your employment authorization documentation states you are an immigrant noncitizen with a C-33 status. The status of C-33, according to the United States Customs and Immigration Services (USCIS) and Social Security Administration (SSA) is in reference to a status classified as Deferred Action on Childhood Arrivals. Individuals who have obtained an Employment Authorization card with the status of C-33 category are persons considered not "lawfully present" for purposes of the federal definition, and are therefore not recognized as eligible to receive federal funding under those programs.

In addition, while individuals who have been determined to be qualified aliens and were formerly eligible for Medicaid through the state, but not eligible for Medicaid under federal law, were transitioned to the Essential Plan as of January 1, 2016, this is not the case for persons who received Deferred Action status.

Therefore, NYSOH was correct in finding you ineligible for coverage under the Essential Plan.

Additionally, federal regulations require that a person seeking enrollment in a qualified health plan through NYSOH have United States citizenship or satisfactory or immigration status. Under the federal regulations, individuals with Deferred Action for Childhood arrivals status are not considered to be lawfully present for the purposes of obtaining coverage in a qualified health plan though NYSOH. Therefore, NYSOH properly found you ineligible to enroll in a qualified health plan.

In order to be found eligible for advance payments of the premium tax credit or cost-sharing reductions, and individual must be eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan. As you are ineligible to enroll in a qualified health plan for 2018 for the reasons noted above, NYSOH properly found you ineligible for advance payments of the premium tax credit and cost-sharing reductions.

Accordingly, the December 22, 2018 discontinuance notice properly found you to be ineligible to enroll in a qualified health plan, ineligible for APTC and cost-sharing reductions, and ineligible for the Essential Plan based on you not being considered lawfully present.

The second issue is whether NYSOH properly found you ineligible for Medicaid.

NY State has consistently recognized persons with Deferred Action status within the accepted meaning of "*PRUCOL alien*"; even though the federal government has not. The New York Court of Appeals ruled, in *Aliessa, et al. v. Novello* (96 NY 2d 418 [2001]), that New York must provide state-funded Medicaid to the lawfully residing immigrants who had been excluded from access to the federal Medicaid program.

Since your current Deferred Action status does confer PRUCOL status for individuals seeking Medicaid eligibility, we may review whether you met the financial criteria for Medicaid.

You expect to file your 2017 and 2018 income tax returns as single and will not claim any dependents on that return. Therefore, you are in a one-person household.

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults between the ages of 19 and 65 who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income (MAGI) that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your November 8, 2017 and December 20, 2017 applications, the relevant FPL was \$12,060.00 for a one-person household. Since \$21,000.00 is 174.13% of the 2017 FPL, NYSOH properly found you to be ineligible for Medicaid on an expected annual income basis, using the information provided in your application.

Additionally, on the date of your January 27, 2018 application, the relevant FPL was \$12,140.00 for a one-person household. Since \$21,000.00 is 172.98% of the 2018 FPL, you also were not eligible for Medicaid on an expected annual income basis as of the January 27, 2018 application.

Financial eligibility for Medicaid can also be based on current monthly household income and family size.

You provided documentation that your monthly income for November 2017 was \$1,976.53, for December 2017 was \$2,029.46, and January 2018 was \$3,151.25.

To be eligible for Medicaid, you would need to meet the non-financial criteria and have an income no greater than 138% of the FPL, which is \$1,387.00 per month in November 2017 and December 2017, and \$1,397.00 per month in January 2018. Since the paystubs you provided indicate that you earned, \$1,976.53 in November 2017, \$2,029.46 in December 2017, and \$3,151.25 in January 2018 you do not qualify for Medicaid on the basis of monthly income as of the date of your November 8, 2017, December 20, 2017, or January 27, 2018 applications.

As NYSOH properly found you ineligible to enroll in the Essential Plan, to receive tax credits or cost-sharing reductions to help pay for the cost of insurance, or to enroll in a qualified health plan at full cost because you are not considered lawfully present, and ineligible for Medicaid as your income is over the allowable income limit for that program, the December 22, 2017 eligibility determination notice is AFFIRMED.

Decision

The December 22, 2017 discontinuance notice is AFFIRMED.

Effective Date of this Decision: March 27, 2018

How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

You are not eligible for the Essential Plan, to receive tax credits or cost-sharing reductions to help pay for the cost of insurance, or to enroll in a qualified health plan at full cost because you are not lawfully present.

Although you qualify as a PRUCOL alien for state-based Medicaid, you are not eligible for Medicaid at this time, because your household income is over the maximum allowable income limit.

If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

This Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This

must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

Health Insurance Marketplace Attn: Appeals 465 Industrial Blvd. London, KY 40750-0061

• By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

• By fax: 1-855-900-5557

Summary

The December 22, 2017 discontinuance notice is AFFIRMED.

You are not eligible for the Essential Plan, to receive tax credits or cost-sharing reductions to help pay for the cost of insurance, or to enroll in a qualified health plan at full cost because you are not lawfully present.

Although you qualify as a PRUCOL alien for state-based Medicaid, you are not eligible for Medicaid at this time, because your household income is over the maximum allowable income limit.

Legal Authority

We are issuing this determination in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:



Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

Español (Spanish)

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

<u>中文 (Traditional Chinese)</u>

這是重要的文件。 如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助,請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件,请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

<u>한국어 (Korean)</u>

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

(Arabic)العربية

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 5777-355-855-1. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجانًا.

বাংলা (Bengali)

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নিখি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কখা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

<u>日本語 (Japanese)</u>

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्त्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई नि:शुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

Twi (Twi)

Krataa yi ye tow krataa a ho hia. Se wo hia eho nkyerekyeremu a, ye sre wo, fre 1-855-355-5777. yebetumi ama wo obi a okyere kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

اردو(Urdu)

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم5777-355-855-1 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

אידיש (Yiddish)

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.