

STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Notice of Decision

Decision Date: May 11, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID: Appeal Identification Number: AP000000028841

Dear			

On April 18, 2018, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's February 24, 2018 eligibility determination notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

• Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the NY State of Health Account ID at the top of this notice.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.

This page intentionally left blank.



STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Decision

Decision Date: May 11, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID: Appeal Identification Number: AP000000028841

Issues

The issues presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health are:

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were eligible to receive up to \$364.00 per month in advance payments of the premium tax credit, effective April 1, 2018?

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were eligible for costsharing reductions?

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were ineligible for the Essential Plan?

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were ineligible for Medicaid?

Procedural History

On February 6, 2018, NY State of Health (NYSOH) received your updated application for financial assistance with health insurance.

On February 7, 2018, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating, in part, that you were eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost through NYSOH, effective March 1, 2018. This notice further stated that you were ineligible for Medicaid, or the Essential Plan because you do not meet the income limits or other eligibility standards for these programs. It further stated that you were ineligible for an advanced payment of the premium tax credit

(APTC) and cost-sharing reductions because of the one of the following reasons: you told NYSOH you do not plan on filing a federal tax return, you are married and you told NYSOH you will file taxes separately from your spouse, or you received APTC in a prior year and NYSOH cannot tell if you filed a federal tax return for that year.

Also on February 12, 2018, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed the eligibility determination notice insofar as you were not eligible for financial assistance with your health insurance coverage.

On February 23, 2018, NYSOH received your updated application for financial assistance with health insurance. More specifically, your marital status was updated from "separated" to "single."

On February 24, 2018, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating, in part, that you were eligible to receive up to \$364.00 in APTC, as well as costsharing reductions if you enrolled in a silver level qualified health plan, both effective April 1, 2018. That notice also stated that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan or Medicaid because your annual household income was over the allowable income limits for those programs.

On March 1, 2018, NYSOH issued a notice stating that you were eligible for the Essential Plan, for a limited time, effective February 1, 2018. This was because you had been granted Aid to Continue pending the outcome of your appeal.

On March 1, 2018, NYSOH issued a plan enrollment notice stating that you were enrolled in an Essential Plan, effective February 1, 2018.

On April 18, 2018, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. Spanish interpreter **assisted** with the hearing. During the hearing, you asked to amend the appeal to include the February 24, 2018 eligibility determination notice. The Hearing Officer agreed to amend the appeal to include the February 24, 2018 eligibility determination notice. The record was developed during the hearing and the record held open until May 3, 2018, to allow you time to submit supporting documents.

As of the end of the business day on May 3, 2018, the NYSOH's Appeals Unit did not receive any documents from you and none were viewable in your NYSOH account. Therefore, the record was closed that same day and this decision is based on the record as developed at the time of the hearing.

Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) The February 23, 2018 application indicates that you expect to file your tax return for 2018 with a tax filing status of single and that you plan on claiming no dependents on that tax return.
- You testified that you expect to file your tax return for 2018 with a tax filing status of single and you plan on claiming one dependent on that tax return.
- 3) You are seeking insurance for yourself and your grandchild. However, you testified that you are only appealing your eligibility determination.
- The application that was submitted on February 23, 2018 listed an annual household income of \$25,688.00, consisting of income you earn from your employment.
- 5) You testified that you make \$13.00 an hour and work, on average, 38 hours a week.
- 6) You testified that you are paid biweekly and the amount you are paid varies depending on how much you work for that pay period.
- 7) Your application states that you will not be taking any deductions on your 2018 tax return.
- 8) Your application states, and you testified, that you are an immigrant noncitizen and that you have permanent resident status.
- 9) You testified that you have been a permanent resident of the United States since .
- 10) Your application states that you live in , NY.
- 11) You testified that you have bills, including rent and other utilities, that you think should be deducted from your household income.
- 12) You testified that you are unable to afford health insurance unless you are found eligible for a higher amount of financial assistance.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

Applicable Law and Regulations

Advance Payments of Premium Tax Credit

APTC are generally available to a person who is eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan and (1) expects to have a household income between 138% and 400% of the applicable federal poverty level (FPL), (2) expects to file a tax return and claim a personal exemption deduction for a person who meets the eligibility requirements to enroll in a qualified health plan, and (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market (see 45 CFR § 155.305(f), 26 CFR § 1.36B-2, 42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)).

The maximum amount of APTC that can be authorized equals:

 the cost of the health insurance premium for the taxpayer's coverage family in the second lowest cost silver plan offered through NY State of Health in the county where the taxpayer resides

minus

2) the taxpayer's expected contribution amount

(see 26 USC § 36B, 26 CFR § 1.36B-3).

The taxpayer's expected contribution amount is the amount that the taxpayer is expected to spend on health insurance premiums. The expected contribution for 2018 is set by federal law at 2.01% to 9.56% of household income (26 USC § 36B(b)(3)(A), 26 CFR § 1.36B-3, IRS Rev. Proc. 2017-36).

In an analysis of APTC eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR §§ 155.300(a), 155.305(f)(1)(i)). On the date of your application, that was the 2017 FPL, which is \$12,060.00 for a one -person household (82 Federal Register 8831).

For annual household income in the range of at least 200% but less than 250% of the 2017 FPL, the expected contribution for 2018 is between 6.34% and 8.10% of the household income (26 CFR § 1.36B-3(g)(1), 45 CFR § 155.300(a), IRS Rev. Proc. 2017-36).

People who use the APTC to help pay health insurance premiums must file a federal tax return and reconcile their expected income (stated on NYSOH application) with their actual income (stated on their federal income tax return). Those who take less tax credit in advance than they claim on the tax return may get the rest of it as an income tax refund or have their tax bill reduced. Those

who take more tax credit in advance than they can claim on their tax return will owe the difference as additional income taxes (26 CFR § 1.36B-4).

Cost-Sharing Reductions

Cost-sharing reductions are available to a person who (1) is eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan through NYSOH, (2) meets the requirements to receive APTC, (3) is expected to have an annual household income that does not exceed 250% of the FPL for the first day of the open enrollment period of the benefit year for which coverage is requested, and (4) is enrolled in a silver-level qualified health plan (45 CFR § 155.300(a), 45 CFR § 155.305(g)(1)).

Essential Plan

NYSOH must generally determine an applicant eligible for the Essential Plan, a basic health plan, if the person is (1) a resident of New York State, (2) expects to have a household income between 138% and 200% of the applicable FPL or, in the case of an individual who is a lawfully present non-citizen who is ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus as a result of their immigration status, has a household income that is between 0% and 200% of the FPL, (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market, (4) is 64 years old or younger, (5) is a citizen or a lawfully present non-citizen, and (6) is not incarcerated (see 42 CFR § 600.305, 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4), 45 CFR § 155.305(e), NY Social Services Law § 369-gg(3), 42 USC § 18051).

In an analysis of Essential Plan eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL in effect on the first day of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). On the date of your application that was the 2017 FPL, which is \$12,060.00 for a one-person household (82 Fed. Reg. 8831).

A person who has a household income that is at or below 150% of the FPL has a \$0.00 premium contribution (New York's Basic Health Plan Blueprint, p. 21, as approved January 2016; see https://www.medicaid.gov/basic-health-program/downloads/ny-blueprint.pdf).

A person who has a household income greater than 150% of the FPL or below 200% of the FPL has a \$20.00 per month premium contribution (New York's Basic Health Plan Blueprint, as approved January 2016).

The Essential Plan is considered minimum essential coverage; therefore, a person who is eligible for the Essential Plan is not eligible for any premium tax credit because they are eligible for minimum essential coverage through the individual market (see 26 CFR § 1.36B-2(c)(1), 26 USC § 5000A(f)(1)(C)).

<u>Medicaid</u>

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults who: (1) are age 19 or older and under age 65, (2) are not pregnant, (3) are not entitled to or enrolled for Medicare benefits under part A or B of title XVIII of the Act, (4) are not otherwise eligible for and enrolled for mandatory coverage under a State's Medicaid State plan in accordance with subpart B of this part, and (5) have a household modified adjusted gross income (MAGI) that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size (42 CFR § 435.119(b), 42 CFR § 435.911(b)(1), 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4)), NY Social Services Law § 366(1)(b)).

In an analysis of Medicaid eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL "for the applicable budget period used to determine an individual's eligibility" (42 CFR § 435.4). On the date of your application, that was the 2018 FPL, which is \$12,140.00 for a one-person household (83 Fed. Reg. 2642).

Financial eligibility for Medicaid for applicants who are not currently receiving Medicaid benefits is based on current monthly household income and family size (42 CFR § 435.603(h)(1); State Plan Amendment (SPA) 13-0055-MM3, as approved March 19, 2014).

Modified Adjusted Gross Income

NYSOH bases its eligibility determinations on modified adjusted gross income as defined in the federal tax code (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). The term "modified adjusted gross income" means adjusted gross income increased by (1) any income that was excluded under 26 USC § 911 for United States citizens or residents living abroad, (2) tax-exempt interest received or accrued, and (3) Social Security benefits that were excluded from gross income under 26 USC § 86 (see 26 USC § 36B(d)(2)(B), 26 CFR § 1.36B-1(e)(2)).

"Adjusted gross income" means, in the case of an individual taxpayer, gross federal taxable income minus certain specific deductions, such as expenses reimbursed by an employer, losses from sale or exchange of property, losses from premature withdrawal of finds from time savings accounts, deductions attributable to royalties, and certain retirement savings (26 USC § 62(a)). Living expenses, such as rent and utilities are not an allowable deduction in computing adjusted gross income (*id*.).

Legal Analysis

The first issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were eligible for up to \$364.00 per month in APTC.

The application that was submitted on February 23, 2018, listed an annual household income of \$25,688.00 and the eligibility determination relied upon that information.

During the hearing, you testified that the amount you provided in your application was correct. However, you asked that your current expenses, which include rent and other utilities, be considered when calculating your annual household income.

Since the Internal Revenue Service rules do not allow living expenses such as rent and utilities to be deducted from the calculation of your adjusted gross income, they cannot be deducted when the NYSOH computes your modified adjusted gross income for APTC purposes. Therefore, NYSOH correctly determined your household income to be \$25,688.00.

You are in a one-person household for purposes of this analysis. This is because your application states that you expect to file your 2018 income tax return as single and will claim no dependents on that tax return.

You reside in Queens County, where the second lowest cost silver plan available for an individual through NYSOH costs \$509.30 per month.

An annual income of \$25,688.00 is 213.00% of the 2017 FPL for a one-person household. At 213.00% of the FPL, the expected contribution to the cost of the health insurance premium in 2018 is 6.80% of income, or \$145.57 per month.

The maximum amount of APTC that can be approved equals the cost of the second lowest cost silver plan available through NYSOH for an individual in your county (\$509.30 per month) minus your expected contribution (\$145.57 per month), which equals \$363.73 per month. Therefore, rounding to the nearest dollar, NYSOH correctly determined you to be eligible for up to \$364.00 per month in APTC, based on the information provided in your application.

The second issue under review is whether you were properly determined eligible for cost-sharing reductions.

Cost-sharing reductions are available to a person who has a household income no greater than 250% of the FPL. Since a household income of \$25,688.00 is 213.00% of the applicable FPL, NYSOH correctly found you to be eligible for cost sharing reductions.

The third issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined you were ineligible for the Essential Plan.

The Essential Plan is generally provided through NYSOH to individuals who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is between 138% and 200% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was \$12,060.00 for a oneperson household. Since an annual household income of \$25,688.00 is 213.00% of the 2017 FPL, NYSOH correctly found you to be ineligible for the Essential Plan.

The fourth issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you were ineligible for Medicaid.

Medicaid can be provided through NYSOH to adults between the ages of 19 and 65 who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is at or below 138% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was \$12,140.00 for a one-person household. Since \$25,688.00 is 211.60% of the 2018 FPL, NYSOH properly found you to be ineligible for Medicaid on an expected annual income basis, using the information provided in your application.

However, financial eligibility for Medicaid for applicants who are not currently receiving Medicaid benefits is based on current monthly household income and family size. To be eligible for Medicaid, you would need to meet the non-financial criteria and have an income no greater than 138% of the FPL, which is \$1,396.00 per month. There is no indication in the record that you would be ineligible for Medicaid due to non-financial reasons in the month of February 2018.

The Hearing Officer left the record open until May 3, 2018, to allow you time to submit your paystubs from the month of February 2018. However, by the end of the business day on May 3, 2018, the NYSOH's Appeals Unit had not received any documents from you and none were viewable in your NYSOH account. Therefore, this Decision is based on the record as developed during the hearing.

Your February 23, 2018 application states that your annual expected income is \$25,688.00. Therefore, using the information contained in your application, the system calculated your monthly income to be \$2,140.67 per month. Since the system calculated your monthly income to be \$2,140.67 in February 2018, you do not qualify for Medicaid based on monthly income as of the date of your application.

Since the February 24, 2018 eligibility determination notice properly stated that, based on the information you provided, you were eligible for up to \$364.00 per month in APTC, eligible for cost-sharing reductions, ineligible for the Essential Plan and ineligible for Medicaid, it is correct and is AFFIRMED, as it pertains only to your eligibility.

During the hearing, you testified that, while your application states that you will claim no dependents on your 2018 federal tax return, you now plan to claim one dependent on your 2018 federal tax return.

NYSOH's Appeals Unit does not have the authority to change a consumer's tax filing status on their application. You will need to contact NYSOH and update your application to reflect a change in your tax filing status, if you so choose.

Decision

The February 24, 2018 eligibility determination is AFFIRMED, as it pertains to only your eligibility.

Effective Date of this Decision: May 11, 2018

How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

NYSOH properly determined that you were eligible for up to \$364.00 per month in APTC and cost-sharing reductions, based on the information provided in your application.

NYSOH properly determined that you were ineligible for the Essential Plan and Medicaid, based on the information provided in your application.

You will need to contact NYSOH and update your application to reflect a change in tax filing status, if you so choose.

If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

If applicable, if you think a portion of your appeal should not be dismissed, you can ask us to vacate, or cancel, this dismissal. You must ask us in writing within 30 days after the date on this notice, showing good cause as to why the dismissal should be vacated. NYSOH's Appeals Unit will review your request. If your request is approved, another hearing will be scheduled for you. If your request is denied, NYSOH will tell you in writing. If you do not respond to the dismissed portion of your appeal within 30 days, your appeal will remain dismissed, and NYSOH will take no further action on your appeal.

Insofar as your case was decided, the Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

Health Insurance Marketplace Attn: Appeals 465 Industrial Blvd. London, KY 40750-0061

• By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

• By fax: 1-855-900-5557

Summary

The February 24, 2018 eligibility determination is AFFIRMED, as it pertains to only your eligibility.

NYSOH properly determined that you were eligible for up to \$364.00 per month in APTC and cost-sharing reductions, based on the information provided in your application.

NYSOH properly determined that you were ineligible for the Essential Plan and Medicaid, based on the information provided in your application.

You will need to contact NYSOH and update your application to reflect a change in tax filing status, if you so choose.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:



Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

Español (Spanish)

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助,請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您 免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

<u>中文 (Simplified Chinese)</u>

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件,请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您免费提供 相应语种的口译服务。

Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

<u> 한국어 (Korean)</u>

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 **1-855-355-5777** 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

(Arabic)العربية

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 5777-355-355-1. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجانًا.

<u>বাংলা (Bengali)</u>

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

<u>हिंदी (Hindi)</u>

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料 で提供いたします。

<u>नेपाली (Nepali)</u>

यो एउटा महत्त्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई नि:शुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

<u>Twi (Twi)</u>

Krataa yi yɛ tow krataa a ho hia. Sɛ wo hia ɛho nkyerɛkyerɛmu a, yɛ srɛ wo, frɛ 1-855-355-5777. yɛbɛtumi ama wo obi a ɔkyerɛ kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

اردو**(Urdu)**

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم5777-355-1855 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

אידיש **(Yiddish)**

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.