



STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

Notice of Decision

Decision Date: May 15, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000029387



Dear [REDACTED]

On April 24, 2018 you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's February 22, 2018 disenrollment notice and NY State of Health's verbal denial of a special enrollment period.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:
NY State of Health Appeals
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211
- Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the Account ID at the top of this notice.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

This page intentionally left blank.



STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

Decision

Decision Date: May 15, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000029387



Issues

The issues presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health are:

Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly terminate your and your spouse's qualified health plans for non-payment of premium effective, February 1, 2018?

Did NYSOH properly determine that you and your spouse do not qualify to enroll in a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period?

Procedural History

On December 2, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice stating that it was time to renew your health insurance for the upcoming coverage year. That renewal notice stated that you and your spouse were eligible to receive an advance premium tax credit of up to \$669.02 per month, effective February 1, 2018. That notice further directed you to choose a health plan between December 16, 2017 and January 18, 2018.

On January 10, 2018, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice stating that you and your spouse were enrolled in a qualified health plan, effective February 1, 2018.

On February 22, 2018, NYSOH issued a disenrollment notice stating that your and your spouse's enrollment in your qualified health plan was terminated,

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

effective February 1, 2018, because a premium payment had not been received by the health plan.

Also on February 22, 2018, NYSOH received your updated application for health insurance. At that time, you attempted to enroll yourself and your spouse into a qualified health plan, and were unable to.

On February 23, 2018, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you and your spouse may be eligible to receive an advance premium tax credit of up to \$773.00 per month, effective April 1, 2018, if you qualify for a special enrollment period.

On February 26, 2018, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed insofar as you and your spouse were not eligible to reenroll in a health plan outside of the open enrollment period.

On March 29, 2018, NYSOH issued an evidence packet in which the appeal reason was marked as Denial of Special Enrollment Period (SEP).

On April 24, 2018, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and closed at the end of the hearing. During the hearing, you gave the Hearing Officer permission to listen to recordings of phone calls you had with NYSOH.

Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) You testified that you had contacted NYSOH during December 2017 to enroll into a qualified health plan, but you were told to wait until January 2018 to contact NYSOH again to reenroll.
- 2) The Hearing Officer requested a call log of all calls placed to NYSOH, a review of your call logs with NYSOH does not indicate that you called NYSOH during December 2017.
- 3) You testified that you applied for health insurance on January 10, 2018, and enrolled in a plan at that time.
- 4) You testified that prior to your enrollment on January 10, 2018, you had not been enrolled in coverage since June 2017. You testified that you cancelled your insurance coverage in June 2017 because of the cost of coverage.

- 5) On January 10, 2018, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice stating that you enrolled in a qualified health plan for the 2018 coverage year with a plan premium of \$817.23 per month, to which you applied the full advance tax credit of \$669.02 per month, resulting in a \$148.21 monthly premium, with an enrollment start date of February 1, 2018.
- 6) You testified that you reached out to your insurance provider between February 15, 2018, and February 17, 2018, and were told that a bill would be coming from NYSOH.
- 7) You testified that your health insurance coverage was terminated between February 20, 2018, and February 22, 2018.
- 8) You testified that your and your spouse's coverage was terminated for nonpayment. You testified that at the time you confirmed this with your health insurance provider, you had missed your original payment deadline by a single day
- 9) You testified that you did not pay your premiums to your qualified health plan prior to your disenrollment, because you did not receive a bill from your insurance provider.
- 10) You contacted NYSOH on February 22, 2018. During that call, you were informed that your health insurance provider was responsible for sending you a bill for your coverage. You stated that your health insurance provider informed you that you had your coverage terminated, and that you had missed the deadline to pay by one day. An NYSOH representative assisted you with the process of completing a new application for health insurance. At the end of your application, the representative explained that you would have to qualify for a special enrollment period in order to enroll in coverage for 2018. The representative informed you that he was unable to select the option that you had lost coverage as your qualifying event, because your coverage was lost because you did not pay your premium. You were advised to reach out to your health insurance provider, to ask to speak to a manager, to make a payment within thirty days of your disenrollment in, and request to be reinstated in your coverage.
- 11) You contacted NYSOH on February 23, 2018. During that call, you stated you had concerns about your disenrollment, and your new application from the previous day. The NYSOH representative stated that the representative you spoke with the previous day had run your application because you had been disenrolled for nonpayment. The NYSOH representative further stated that your health insurance provider should have billed you. You stated that you had made a payment to your health insurance provider. The NYSOH representative informed you that they

had submitted a request to your health insurance provider for you to be reinstated.

- 12) You testified that you were never reimbursed for your February 2018 payment.
- 13) You testified that you and your spouse have been without health insurance through February, March, and April 2018.
- 14) You testified that you had medical bills during this period, specifically the cost of one or two [REDACTED] appointments.
- 15) You testified that NYSOH did not make any representations to you that turned out to be true.
- 16) You testified that the only information you relied on from NYSOH in choosing your plan was the information available on its website.
- 17) You testified that since your and your spouse's disenrollment on February 22, 2018, there have been no other major changes to your household.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

Applicable Law and Regulations

Appealable Issues

An applicant has the right to appeal to NYSOH's Appeals Unit: (1) an eligibility determination, including the amount of advance payments of the premium tax credit and level of cost-sharing reductions; (2) a redetermination of eligibility, including the amount of advance payments of the premium tax credit and level of cost-sharing reductions; (3) a failure by NYSOH to provide timely notice of an eligibility determination 45 CFR § 155.505; and (4) a denial of a request for a special enrollment period (45 CFR § 155.505(b)(1)(iii), 45 CFR § 155.305(b), and 45 CFR § 155.420(d)).

De Novo Review

NYSOH Appeals Unit must review each appeal de novo and "consider all relevant facts and evidence adduced during the appeals process" (45 CFR § 155.535(f)). "De novo review means a review of an appeal without deference to prior decisions in the case" (45 CFR § 155.500).

Enrollment in a Qualified Health Plan

NYSOH must provide annual open enrollment periods during which time qualified individuals may enroll in a QHP and enrollees may change QHPs (45 CFR § 155.410(a)(1)).

For the benefit year beginning on January 1, 2018, the national annual open enrollment period began on November 1, 2017 and extended through December 15, 2017 (45 CFR § 155.410(e)(3)). NY State extended this enrollment period through January 31, 2018 for applications processed through NYSOH (https://www.health.ny.gov/press/releases/2017/2017-09-07_open_enrollment_dates.htm).

Special Enrollment Periods

After each open enrollment period ends, NYSOH provides special enrollment periods to qualified individuals. During a special enrollment period, a qualified individual may enroll in a qualified health plan, and an enrollee may change their enrollment to another plan. This is generally permitted when one of the following triggering events occur:

- (1) The qualified individual or his or her dependent either:
 - (i) Loses minimum essential coverage.
 - (ii) Is enrolled in any non-calendar year group health plan or individual health insurance coverage, even if the qualified individual or his or her dependent has the option to renew such coverage.
 - (iii) Loses pregnancy-related coverage.
 - (iv) Loses medically needy coverage as described under section 1902(a)(10)(C) of the Social Security Act only once per calendar year.
- (2)(i) The qualified individual gains a dependent or becomes a dependent through marriage, birth, adoption, placement for adoption, or placement in foster care, or through a child support order or other court order.
 - (ii) the enrollee loses a dependent or is no longer considered a dependent through divorce or legal separation as defined by State law in the State in which the divorce or legal separation occurs, or if the enrollee, or his or her dependent, dies.

(3) The qualified individual, or his or her dependent, becomes newly eligible for enrollment in a qualified health plan because he or she gains citizenship, status as a national, or lawful present or is no longer incarcerated.

(4) The qualified individual's or his or her dependent's, enrollment or non-enrollment in a qualified health plan is unintentional, inadvertent, or erroneous and is the result of the error, misrepresentation, misconduct, or inaction of an officer, employee, or agent of NYSOH, its instrumentalities, or a non-NYSOH entity providing enrollment assistance or conducting enrollment activities.

(5) The enrollee or, his or her dependent adequately demonstrates to NYSOH that the qualified health plan in which he or she is enrolled substantially violated a material provision of its contract in relation to the enrollee;

(6) The enrollee or enrollee's dependent is newly eligible or ineligible for advance payments of the premium tax credit, or change in eligibility for cost-sharing reductions.

(7) The qualified individual or enrollee, or his or her dependent, gains access to new qualified health plan as a result of a permanent move and either—

(i) Had minimum essential coverage for one or more days during the 60 days preceding the date of the permanent move, or

(ii) Was living outside of the United States or in a United States territory at the time of the permanent move;

(8) The qualified individual or dependent who gains or maintains status as an Indian may enroll in a qualified health plan or change from one plan to another, once per month.

(9) The qualified individual or enrollee, or his or her dependent, demonstrates to the Exchange, in accordance with guidelines issued by HHS, that the individual meets other exceptional circumstances as the Exchange may provide;

(10) A qualified individual or enrollee—

(i) Is a victim of domestic abuse or spousal abandonment, including a dependent or unmarried victim within a household, is enrolled in minimum essential coverage and seeks to enroll in coverage separate from the perpetrator of the abuse or abandonment; or

(ii) Is a dependent of a victim of domestic abuse or spousal abandonment, on the same application as the victim, may enroll in coverage at the same time as the victim;

(11) A qualified individual or dependent—

(i) Applies for coverage through NYSOH during the annual open enrollment period or due to a qualifying event, is assessed as potentially eligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus and is determined ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus either after open enrollment has ended or more than 60 days after the qualifying event; or

(ii) Applies for coverage at their Local Department of Social Services or Human Resources Administration during the annual open enrollment period, and is determined ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus after open enrollment has ended;

(12) The qualified individual or enrollee, or his or her dependent, adequately demonstrates to NYSOH that a material error related to plan benefits, service area, or premium influenced the qualified individual's or enrollee's decision to purchase a qualified health plan; or

(13) At the option of NYSOH, the qualified individual provides satisfactory documentary evidence to verify his or her eligibility for an insurance affordability program or enrollment following termination of enrollment due to a failure to verify such status within 90 days. NYSOH has not elected to adopt this subsection at this time.

(45 CFR § 155.420(d)).

Generally, if a triggering life event occurs, the qualified individual or enrollee has 60 days from the date of a triggering event to select a qualified health plan (45 CFR § 155.420(c)(1)).

However, a loss of health insurance coverage such as that referenced above does not include,

“voluntary termination of coverage or other loss due to—

(1) Failure to pay premiums on a timely basis, including COBRA premiums prior to expiration of COBRA coverage, or

(2) Situations allowing for a rescission as specified in 45 CFR [§] 147.128” such as failure to comply with other requirements (45 CFR § 147.128(b))

(45 CFR § 155.420(e)).

Legal Analysis

The first issue under review is whether NYSOH properly terminated your and your spouse's qualified health plans for non-payment of premium effective, February 1, 2018.

On January 10, 2018 you were enrolled in a qualified health plan for the 2018 coverage year with a monthly premium of \$148.21, effective February 1, 2018.

You testified that you did not receive a bill from your qualified health plan for February 2018. You testified that you reached out to your insurer and were informed that you had missed your deadline to pay by one day, resulting in your and your spouse's coverage being terminated.

On February 22, 2018 NYSOH issued a notice stating that you and your spouse were disenrolled from your health plan for non-payment of the premium, effective February 2, 2018.

NYSOH Appeals Unit only has the authority to review issues related to the following: (1) an eligibility determination, including the amount of advance payments of the premium tax credit and level of cost-sharing reductions, (2) a redetermination of eligibility, including the amount of advance payments of the premium tax credit and level of cost-sharing reductions, (3) a failure to provide timely notice of an eligibility determination, and (4) a denial of a special enrollment period.

Since the Appeals Unit is not given the authority to review termination of enrollment due to non-payment of premiums, we cannot reach the merits as to whether you and your spouse were properly terminated from your health plan for non-payment of premiums. Therefore, your appeal of the February 22, 2018 disenrollment notice is **DISMISSED** as a non-appealable issue.

The second issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you and your spouse do not qualify to enroll in a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period.

You testified that you are appealing the denial of a special enrollment period to enroll into a health plan through NYSOH. However, the record does not contain a notice of eligibility determination or redetermination on the issue of special enrollment period for you or your spouse issued prior to your request for an appeal.

Here, the lack of a notice of eligibility determination on the issue of special enrollment periods does not prevent the Appeals Unit from reaching the merits of the case or constitute material error. Under 45 CFR § 155.505(b), you are as entitled to appeal NYSOH failure to timely issue a notice of eligibility determination as you are to appeal an adverse notice of eligibility determination. Your credible testimony, along with the March 29, 2018 evidence packet in which the appeal reason was marked as Denial Of Special Enrollment Period (SEP), confirms that NYSOH did deny your special enrollment request.

Since the Appeals Unit review of NYSOH determinations is performed on a de novo basis, no deference would have been granted to the eligibility determination notice had it been issued.

NYSOH provided an open enrollment period from November 1, 2017 until January 31, 2018. On February 22, 2018 you spoke with a NYSOH representative and requested to have yourself and your spouse reenrolled in a qualified health plan. You were informed that you were unable to reenroll.

Once the annual open enrollment period ends, a health plan enrollee must qualify for a special enrollment period in order to enroll in, or change to another health plan offered in NYSOH. In order to qualify for a special enrollment period, a person must experience a triggering event.

In the present case, there is no evidence in the record to establish grounds for a special enrollment period. You testified that there have been no changes to your household in 2018.

Though you did lose health coverage as a result of the February 22, 2018 disenrollment, the loss of health insurance coverage in this case cannot be considered a triggering event for a special enrollment period, because it was a result of non-payment of your premiums which NYSOH considers a voluntary action causing the termination of your coverage.

As a result, the credible evidence of record indicates that, since the open enrollment period closed on January 31, 2018, you did not experience a triggering event that would qualify you for a special enrollment period as of the date of the hearing.

Therefore, NYSOH's denial of a special enrollment period to select a health plan outside of the open enrollment period for 2018 is **AFFIRMED**.

Decision

Your appeal of the February 22, 2018 disenrollment notice is **DISMISSED** as a non-appealable issue.

NYSOH's denial of a special enrollment period to select a health plan outside of the open enrollment period for 2018 is **AFFIRMED**.

Effective Date of this Decision: May 15, 2018

How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

You and your spouse do not qualify for a special enrollment period at this time.

If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

If applicable, if you think a portion of your appeal should not be dismissed, you can ask us to vacate, or cancel, this dismissal. You must ask us in writing within 30 days after the date on this notice, showing good cause as to why the dismissal should be vacated. NYSOH's Appeals Unit will review your request. If your request is approved, another hearing will be scheduled for you. If your request is denied, NYSOH will tell you in writing. If you do not respond to the dismissed portion of your appeal within 30 days, your appeal will remain dismissed, and NYSOH will take no further action on your appeal.

Insofar as your case was decided, the Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:
Health Insurance Marketplace
Attn: Appeals
465 Industrial Blvd.
London, KY 40750-0061
- By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:
NY State of Health Appeals
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211
- By fax: 1-855-900-5557

Summary

Your appeal of the February 22, 2018 disenrollment notice is **DISMISSED** as a non-appealable issue.

NYSOH's denial of a special enrollment period to select a health plan outside of the open enrollment period for 2018 is **AFFIRMED**.

You and your spouse do not qualify for a special enrollment period at this time.

Legal Authority

We are issuing this determination in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:



Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

Español (Spanish)

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助，請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件，请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您提供相应语种的口译服务。

Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

한국어 (Korean)

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

العربية (Arabic)

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 1-855-355-5777. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجانًا.

বাংলা (Bengali)

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई निःशुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

Twi (Twi)

Krataa yi ye tow krataa a ho hia. Se wo hia eho nkyerekyeremu a, ye sre wo, fre 1-855-355-5777. ye&etumi ama wo obi a okyerE kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

(Urdu) اردو

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم 1-855-355-5777 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

אידיש (Yiddish)

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).