

STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

## **Notice of Decision**

Decision Date: April 23, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID: Appeal Identification Number: AP000000029425



On April 18, 2018, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's February 20, 2018 eligibility determination notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the NY State of Health Account ID at the top of this notice.

# **Legal Authority**

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.



STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Decision

Decision Date: April 23, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID: Appeal Identification Number: AP00000029425



#### Issue

The issue presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health is:

Did NY State of Health properly determine that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan?

# **Procedural History**

On February 20, 2018, NY State of Health (NYSOH) issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were eligible for up to \$351.00 in advance payments of the premium tax credit as well as cost-sharing reductions if you enrolled in a silver level qualified health plan, both effective April 1, 2018. The notice stated that you were not eligible for the Essential Plan because your annual household income was over the allowable income limit for that program.

On February 27, 2018, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed that eligibility determination notice insofar as you were not eligible for an increased amount of financial assistance.

On March 24, 2018, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were eligible for Medicaid for a limited time, effective April 1, 2018. The notice stated that you were granted Aid to Continue until a decision is made on your appeal.

Also on March 24, 2018, a plan enrollment notice was issued confirming your enrollment in a Medicaid Managed Care plan, effective April 1, 2018.

On April 18, 2018, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and closed at the end of the hearing.

# **Findings of Fact**

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- According to your NYSOH account and testimony, you are divorced and you expect to file your tax return for 2018 with a tax filing status of head of household. You will claim one dependent on that tax return, who is your adult child.
- 2) You are seeking health insurance for yourself.
- 3) The application that was submitted on February 19, 2018 listed annual household income of \$28,879.50, consisting of \$21,574.02 you earn from your employment and \$7,305.48 you receive in taxable pension income. You testified these amounts are correct. You further testified that you are the sole provider in your household.
- 4) According to your NYSOH account and testimony, your gross income for February 2018 was \$2,316.37.
- 5) According to your NYSOH account and testimony, you will not be taking any deductions on your 2018 tax return.
- 6) According to your NYSOH account, you live in Nassau County, NY.
- 7) You testified that you have bills including a large mortgage payment and union dues that you think should be deducted from your household income.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

# **Applicable Law and Regulations**

#### Modified Adjusted Gross Income

NYSOH bases its eligibility determinations on modified adjusted gross income as defined in the federal tax code (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). The term "modified adjusted gross income" means adjusted gross income increased by (1) any

income that was excluded under 26 USC § 911 for United States citizens or residents living abroad, (2) tax-exempt interest received or accrued, and (3) Social Security benefits that were excluded from gross income under 26 USC § 86 (see 26 USC § 36B(d)(2)(B), 26 CFR § 1.36B-1(e)(2)).

"Adjusted gross income" means, in the case of an individual taxpayer, gross federal taxable income minus certain specific deductions, such as expenses reimbursed by an employer, losses from sale or exchange of property, losses from premature withdrawal of finds from time savings accounts, deductions attributable to royalties, and certain retirement savings (26 USC § 62(a)). Living expenses, such as your mortgage payment and utilities are not allowable deductions in computing adjusted gross income. Additionally, some employee expenses, such as union dues and administrative fees are not allowable deductions in computing adjusted gross income.

#### Household Size

"Family size" means the number of persons counted as members of an individual's household. The household of a taxpayer who expects to file a return, and does not expect to be claimed as a tax dependent by anyone else, consists of the taxpayer plus all people the taxpayer expects to claim as tax dependents (42 CFR § 435.603(f)(1)).

## **Essential Plan**

NYSOH must generally determine an applicant eligible for the Essential Plan, a basic health plan, if the person is (1) a resident of New York State, (2) expects to have a household income between 138% and 200% of the applicable FPL or, in the case of an individual who is a lawfully present non-citizen who is ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus as a result of their immigration status, has a household income that is between 0% and 200% of the FPL, (3) is not otherwise eligible for minimum essential coverage except through the individual market, (4) is 64 years old or younger, (5) is a citizen or a lawfully present non-citizen, and (6) is not incarcerated (see 42 CFR § 600.305, 42 CFR § 435.603(d)(4), 45 CFR § 155.305(e), NY Social Services Law § 369-gg(3), 42 USC § 18051).

In an analysis of Essential Plan eligibility, the determination is based on the FPL in effect on the first day of the benefit year for which coverage is requested (45 CFR § 155.300(a)). On the date of your application that was the 2017 FPL, which is \$16,240.00 for a two-person household (82 Fed. Reg. 8831).

A person who has a household income that is at or below 150% of the FPL has a \$0.00 premium contribution (New York's Basic Health Plan Blueprint, p. 21, as approved January 2016; see https://www.medicaid.gov/basic-health-program/downloads/ny-blueprint.pdf).

A person who has a household income greater than 150% of the FPL or below 200% of the FPL has a \$20.00 per month premium contribution (New York's Basic Health Plan Blueprint, as approved January 2016).

The Essential Plan is considered minimum essential coverage; therefore, a person who is eligible for the Essential Plan is not eligible for any premium tax credit because they are eligible for minimum essential coverage through the individual market (see 26 CFR § 1.36B-2(c)(1), 26 USC § 5000A(f)(1)(C)).

# **Legal Analysis**

The issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined you to be ineligible for the Essential Plan.

The application that was submitted on February 19, 2018, listed an annual household income of \$28,879.50 and the eligibility determination relied upon that information. During the hearing, you testified that the income amount you provided in your application was correct. However, you asked that your current expenses, which include a large mortgage payment and your union dues, be considered when calculating your annual household income.

Since the Internal Revenue Service rules do not allow living expenses such as mortgage payments, utilities, and union dues to be deducted from the calculation of your adjusted gross income, they cannot be deducted when the NYSOH computes your modified adjusted gross income for APTC purposes. Therefore, NYSOH correctly determined your household income to be \$28,879.50.

However, it appears that, although you testified and your application reflects that you expect to file your tax return for 2018 with a tax filing status of head of household and claim one dependent on that tax return, NYSOH determined your eligibility based on a one-person household.

Generally, a person's household size includes the taxpayer plus all people the taxpayer expects to claim as tax dependents. Since you are divorced, plan on filing head of household, and claiming your adult child on your tax return, for purposes of this analysis, it is concluded that you are in a two-person household.

The Essential Plan is generally provided through NYSOH to individuals who meet the non-financial requirements and have a household modified adjusted gross income that is between 138% and 200% of the FPL for the applicable family size. On the date of your application, the relevant FPL was \$16,240.00 for a two-person household. Since an annual household income of \$28,879.50 is 177.83% of the 2017 FPL, NYSOH improperly found you to be ineligible for the Essential plan, using the information provided in your application.

Since the record reflects that you reside in a two-person household and your calculated 2018 expected MAGI income is \$28,879.50, the February 20, 2018 eligibility determination notice is not supported by the record and must be RESCINDED.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to redetermine your eligibility for financial assistance with health insurance as of February 19, 2018, using a two-person household with an expected annual income of \$28,879.50, for an individual living in Nassau County, New York, and to notify you accordingly.

#### **Decision**

The February 20, 2018 eligibility determination notice is RESCINDED.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to redetermine your eligibility for financial assistance with health insurance as of February 19, 2018, using a two-person household with an expected annual income of \$28,879.50, for an individual living in Nassau County, New York, and to notify you accordingly.

Effective Date of this Decision: April 23, 2018

## How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

NYSOH improperly determined that you were ineligible for the Essential Plan as of your February 19, 2018 application.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to redetermine your eligibility for financial assistance based on the parameters noted above. NYSOH will notify you of its redetermination.

# If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

If applicable, if you think a portion of your appeal should not be dismissed, you can ask us to vacate, or cancel, this dismissal. You must ask us in writing within 30 days after the date on this notice, showing good cause as to why the dismissal should be vacated. NYSOH's Appeals Unit will review your request. If your request is approved, another hearing will be scheduled for you. If your request is denied, NYSOH will tell you in writing. If you do not respond to the dismissed portion of your appeal within 30 days, your appeal will remain dismissed, and NYSOH will take no further action on your appeal.

Insofar as your case was decided, the Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

Health Insurance Marketplace Attn: Appeals 465 Industrial Blvd. London, KY 40750-0061

By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

# If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

• By fax: 1-855-900-5557

# Summary

The February 20, 2018 eligibility determination notice is RESCINDED.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to redetermine your eligibility for financial assistance with health insurance as of February 19, 2018, using a two-person household with an expected annual income of \$28,879.50, for an individual living in Nassau County, New York, and to notify you accordingly.

NYSOH improperly determined that you were ineligible for the Essential Plan as of your February 19, 2018 application.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to redetermine your eligibility for financial assistance based on the parameters noted above. NYSOH will notify you of its redetermination.

# **Legal Authority**

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

# A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:



## **Getting Help in a Language Other than English**

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

#### **Español (Spanish)**

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

#### 中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。 如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助,請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

#### Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

#### 中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件,请打电话至 **1-855-355-5777**。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

#### Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

#### 한국어 (Korean)

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

#### Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

#### (Arabic)العربية

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 5777-355-855-1. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجانًا.

#### বাংলা (Bengali)

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

#### Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

## हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

#### 日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

## नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्त्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई नि:शुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छों।

#### Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

#### Twi (Twi)

Krataa yi yε tow krataa a ho hia. Sε wo hia εho nkyerεkyerεmu a, yε srε wo, frε 1-855-355-5777. yεbεtumi ama wo obi a ɔkyerε kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

#### اردو (Urdu)

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم5777-355-855-1 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

# Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

#### אידיש (Yiddish)

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.