

STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Notice of Decision

Decision Date: May 23, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID:
Appeal Identification Number: AP00000030260



Dear ,

On May 7, 2018 you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's March 16, 2018 eligibility determination notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the Account ID at the top of this notice.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.



STATE OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

Decision

Decision Date: May 23, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID:

Appeal Identification Number: AP00000030260



Issue

The issue presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health is:

Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly determine that you do not qualify to enroll in a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period, effective April 1, 2018?

Procedural History

On February 15, 2018, NYSOH received your updated application for health insurance.

On February 16, 2018, NYOSH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan at full cost, effective March 1, 2018. The notice stated that you must confirm your health plan selection by March 1, 2018.

Also on February 16, 2018, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice stating that you were enrolled in a qualified health plan at full cost, with an enrollment start date of January 1, 2018.

On March 5, 2018, NYSOH received your updated application for health insurance.

Oh March 6, 2018, NYSOH issued a discontinuance notice, stating that you were no longer eligible for health insurance through NYSOH because you indicated you no longer wanted to receive coverage, effective April 1, 2018.

Also on March 6, 2018, NYSOH issued a disenrollment notice, indicating that your coverage with your qualified health plan would end on March 31, 2018, because you were no longer eligible for that plan.

On March 15, 2018, NYSOH received application for financial assistance. That day, a preliminary eligibility determination was prepared stating that you were eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan. You also attempted to enroll into a qualified health plan but were unable to select a plan for enrollment.

Also on March 15, 2018, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed your inability to enroll into a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period.

On March 16, 2018, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice, based on the March 15, 2018 application for financial assistance, stating that you do not qualify to select a health plan outside of the open enrollment period for 2018. That notice further stated that if you were qualified for a special enrollment period, you would be eligible to enroll in a qualified health plan at full cost, effective April 1, 2018.

On May 7, 2018, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. During the hearing, you gave the Hearing Officer permission to listen to recordings of your phone calls with NYSOH. The record was developed during the hearing and closed at the end of the hearing.

Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) On February 15, 2018 you submitted an application for health insurance.
- 2) You testified that you had been previously enrolled in a private insurance plan. You testified that your private insurer went out of business, and that your coverage ended on December 31, 2018.
- 3) You testified that you applied for health insurance through NYSOH on February 15, 2018, and selected a qualified health plan for enrollment on that date.
- 4) Your account reflects that NYSOH granted you a special enrollment period on February 15, 2018, based on the loss of your previous insurance coverage on December 31, 2017.

- 5) You testified that at the time of your application, you assumed that your coverage would be made effective for February 2018.
- 6) You testified that you contacted your qualified health plan insurer in March 2018, because you received a bill that included charges for monthly premiums for coverage in January and February 2018. You testified that this was when you learned that your enrollment start date was made effective January 1, 2018. You further testified that during this contact, your qualified health plan insurer instructed you to contact NYSOH to change the effective date of your coverage.
- You testified that you contacted NYSOH to change your effective date in March 2018.
- 8) You contacted NYSOH several times on March 5, 2018. During the calls placed on that date, you stated to NYSOH representatives that you had a coverage and billing issue with your qualified health plan insurer, and that you wanted your enrollment start date changed to March 1, 2018. At no point during these calls did you indicate that you were no longer seeking insurance through NYSOH.
- 9) Your account reflects that an application was submitted on your behalf on March 5, 2018, and indicated that you were not applying for health coverage.
- 10) Your account reflects that on March 15, 2018, you submitted an application for health insurance and attempted to reenroll in a qualified health plan, but were unable to select a plan for enrollment. That application indicates that you requested a special enrollment period, but were denied because you did not report a qualifying event within sixty days of the event.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

Applicable Law and Regulations

Enrollment in a Qualified Health Plan

NYSOH must provide annual open enrollment periods during which time qualified individuals may enroll in a QHP and enrollees may change QHPs (45 CFR § 155.410(a)(1)).

For the benefit year beginning on January 1, 2018, the national annual open enrollment period began on November 1, 2017 and extended through December

15, 2017 (45 CFR § 155.410(e)(3)). NY State extended this enrollment period through January 31, 2018 for applications processed through NYSOH (https://www.health.ny.gov/press/releases/2017/2017-09-07 open enrollment dates.htm).

Special Enrollment Periods

After each open enrollment period ends, NYSOH provides special enrollment periods to qualified individuals. During a special enrollment period, a qualified individual may enroll in a qualified health plan, and an enrollee may change their enrollment to another plan. This is generally permitted when one of the following triggering events occur:

- (1) The qualified individual or his or her dependent either:
 - (i) Loses minimum essential coverage.
 - (ii) Is enrolled in any non-calendar year group health plan or individual health insurance coverage, even if the qualified individual or his or her dependent has the option to renew such coverage.
 - (iii) Loses pregnancy-related coverage.
 - (iv) Loses medically needy coverage as described under section 1902(a)(10)(C) of the Social Security Act only once per calendar year.
- (2)(i) The qualified individual gains a dependent or becomes a dependent through marriage, birth, adoption, placement for adoption, or placement in foster care, or through a child support order or other court order.
 - (ii) the enrollee loses a dependent or is no longer considered a dependent through divorce or legal separation as defined by State law in the State in which the divorce or legal separation occurs, or if the enrollee, or his or her dependent, dies.
- (3) The qualified individual, or his or her dependent, becomes newly eligible for enrollment in a qualified health plan because he or she gains citizenship, status as a national, or lawful present or is no longer incarcerated.
- (4) The qualified individual's or his or her dependent's, enrollment or nonenrollment in a qualified health plan is unintentional, inadvertent, or erroneous and is the result of the error, misrepresentation, misconduct, or inaction of an officer, employee, or agent of NYSOH, its instrumentalities,

or a non-NYSOH entity providing enrollment assistance or conducting enrollment activities.

- (5) The enrollee or, his or her dependent adequately demonstrates to NYSOH that the qualified health plan in which he or she is enrolled substantially violated a material provision of its contract in relation to the enrollee;
- (6) The enrollee or enrollee's dependent is newly eligible or ineligible for advance payments of the premium tax credit, or change in eligibility for cost-sharing reductions.
- (7) The qualified individual or enrollee, or his or her dependent, gains access to new qualified health plan as a result of a permanent move and either—
 - (i) Had minimum essential coverage for one or more days during the 60 days preceding the date of the permanent move, or
 - (ii) Was living outside of the United States or in a United States territory at the time of the permanent move;
- (8) The qualified individual or dependent who gains or maintains status as an Indian may enroll in a qualified health plan or change from one plan to another, once per month.
- (9) The qualified individual or enrollee, or his or her dependent, demonstrates to the Exchange, in accordance with guidelines issued by HHS, that the individual meets other exceptional circumstances as the Exchange may provide;
- (10) A qualified individual or enrollee—
 - (i) Is a victim of domestic abuse or spousal abandonment, including a dependent or unmarried victim within a household, is enrolled in minimum essential coverage and seeks to enroll in coverage separate from the perpetrator of the abuse or abandonment; or
 - (ii) Is a dependent of a victim of domestic abuse or spousal abandonment, on the same application as the victim, may enroll in coverage at the same time as the victim;
- (11) A qualified individual or dependent—
 - (i) Applies for coverage through NYSOH during the annual open enrollment period or due to a qualifying event, is assessed as

potentially eligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus and is determined ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus either after open enrollment has ended or more than 60 days after the qualifying event; or

- (ii) Applies for coverage at their Local Department of Social Services or Human Resources Administration during the annual open enrollment period, and is determined ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus after open enrollment has ended;
- (12) The qualified individual or enrollee, or his or her dependent, adequately demonstrates to NYSOH that a material error related to plan benefits, service area, or premium influenced the qualified individual's or enrollee's decision to purchase a qualified health plan; or
- (13) At the option of NYSOH, the qualified individual provides satisfactory documentary evidence to verify his or her eligibility for an insurance affordability program or enrollment following termination of enrollment due to a failure to verify such status within 90 days.

(45 CFR § 155.420(d)).

Generally, if a triggering life event occurs, the qualified individual or enrollee has 60 days from the date of a triggering event to select a qualified health plan (45 CFR § 155.420(c)(1)).

Legal Analysis

The issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you do not qualify to enroll in a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period, effective April 1, 2018.

NYSOH provided an open enrollment period from November 1, 2017 until January 31, 2018. Once the annual open enrollment period ends, a health plan enrollee must qualify for a special enrollment period in order to enroll in, or change to another health plan offered in NYSOH. In order to qualify for a special enrollment period, a person must experience a triggering event.

On February 15, 2018 you submitted an application for health insurance and selected a qualified health plan for enrollment. Your account reflects that you were granted a special enrollment period, because you had lost previous coverage within the preceding sixty days. On February 16, 2018, NYSOH issued an enrollment confirmation notice stating that you were enrolled in your full cost qualified health plan with a start date of January 1, 2018.

You testified that at the time of your application, you assumed that your coverage would be made effective for February 2018. However, you then received a bill from your qualified health plan that included charges for monthly premiums for coverage in January and February 2018. You testified that you contacted your qualified health plan insurer and were instructed to contact NYSOH to change the effective date of your coverage.

Thereafter, you contacted NYSOH on March 5, 2018, to request a different enrollment start date. Your account reflects that on March 5, 2018, a NYSOH representative submitted an application on your behalf that stated you were not seeking health insurance. As a result, on March 6, 2018, NYSOH issued discontinuance and disenrollment notices stating that effective April 1, 2018, you were no longer eligible for health insurance through NYSOH because you no longer wanted to receive coverage, and the last day of your coverage under your qualified health plan would be March 31, 2018.

On March 15, 2018, you submitted an updated application for health insurance, and requested a special enrollment period. However, NYSOH denied your request to enroll into a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period and did not grant you an additional special enrollment period.

A special enrollment period can be granted if a qualified individual's enrollment or non-enrollment in a qualified health plan is unintentional, inadvertent, or erroneous and is the result of the error, misrepresentation, misconduct, or inaction of an officer, employee, or agent of NYSOH, its instrumentalities, or a non-NYSOH entity providing enrollment assistance or conducting enrollment activities.

Recordings of your calls with NYSOH on March 5, 2018 indicate that you only asked for your enrollment start date to be changed, and never stated that you were no longer seeking health insurance through NYSOH. Therefore, the March 5, 2018 application submitted on your behalf by a NYSOH representative, stating that you were no longer seeking insurance through NYSOH, was submitted in error. That error resulted in your disenrollment from your health plan, effective April 1, 2018.

Since the record indicates that your non-enrollment into a qualified health plan was the direct result of an error made by a representative of NYSOH on March 5, 2018, you should have been granted a special enrollment period as of your March 15, 2018 application.

Therefore, NYSOH's March 16, 2018 eligibility determination that you do not qualify to select a health plan outside of the open enrollment period for 2018 is MODIFIED to reflect that you are eligible for a special enrollment period as of the date of your March 15, 2018 application.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to assist you in enrolling into a qualified health plan. You may choose to enroll into a qualified health plan as of March1 5, 2018. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll into coverage within 60 days from the date of this decision.

Decision

The March 16, 2018 eligibility determination that you do not qualify to select a health plan outside of the open enrollment period for 2018 is MODIFIED to reflect that you are eligible for a special enrollment period as of the date of your March 15, 2018 application.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to assist you in enrolling into a qualified health plan. You may choose to enroll into a qualified health plan as of March 15, 2018, if so choose. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll into coverage within 60 days from the date of this decision. You will be responsible for premium payments for any months you are enrolled into coverage.

Effective Date of this Decision: May 23, 2018

How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

NYSOH improperly denied you a special enrollment period.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to allow you to enroll into coverage as of March 15, 2018, if you so choose. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll into coverage within 60 days from the date of this decision.

You will be responsible for any premium payments for any months you are enrolled into coverage.

If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

If applicable, if you think a portion of your appeal should not be dismissed, you can ask us to vacate, or cancel, this dismissal. You must ask us in writing within 30 days after the date on this notice, showing good cause as to why the dismissal should be vacated. NYSOH's Appeals Unit will review your request. If your request is approved, another hearing will be scheduled for you. If your request is denied, NYSOH will tell you in writing. If you do not respond to the dismissed portion of your appeal within 30 days, your appeal will remain dismissed, and NYSOH will take no further action on your appeal.

Insofar as your case was decided, the Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:

Health Insurance Marketplace Attn: Appeals 465 Industrial Blvd. London, KY 40750-0061

• By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:

NY State of Health Appeals P.O. Box 11729 Albany, NY 12211

• By fax: 1-855-900-5557

Summary

The March 16, 2018 eligibility determination that you do not qualify to select a health plan outside of the open enrollment period for 2018 is MODIFIED to reflect that you are eligible for a special enrollment period as of the date of your March 5, 2018 application.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to assist you in enrolling into a qualified health plan. You may choose to enroll into a qualified health plan as of March 15, 2018, if so choose. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll into coverage within 60 days from the date of this decision. You will be responsible for premium payments for any months you are enrolled into coverage.

NYSOH improperly denied you a special enrollment period.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to allow you to enroll into coverage as of March 5, 2018, if you so choose. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll into coverage within 60 days from the date of this decision.

You will be responsible for any premium payments for any months you are enrolled into coverage.

Legal Authority

We are issuing this determination in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:

Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

Español (Spanish)

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

<u>中文 (Traditional Chinese)</u>

這是重要的文件。 如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助,請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件,请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您免费提供相应语种的口译服务。

Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

<u>한국어 (Korean)</u>

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

(Arabic)العربية

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 5777-355-855-1. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجانًا.

বাংলা (Bengali)

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নিখি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কখা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक द्भाषिया निःश्ल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्त्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मद्दत चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई नि:शुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

Twi (Twi)

Krataa yi ye tow krataa a ho hia. Se wo hia eho nkyerekyeremu a, ye sre wo, fre 1-855-355-5777. yebetumi ama wo obi a okyere kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

اردو(Urdu)

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم5777-355-485-1 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

אידיש (Yiddish)

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.