



STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

Notice of Decision

Decision Date: May 30, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID: [REDACTED]
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000030507



Dear [REDACTED],

On May 18, 2018, you appeared by telephone at a hearing on your appeal of NY State of Health's December 15, 2017 disenrollment notice and March 23, 2018 eligibility determination notice.

The enclosed Decision, rendered after that hearing, is issued by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health.

If you have questions about your Decision, you can contact us by:

- Calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- Sending Mail to:
NY State of Health Appeals
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211
- Sending a Fax to 1-855-900-5557

When contacting NY State of Health about your appeal and/or the Decision, please refer to the Appeal Identification number and the Account ID at the top of this notice.

Legal Authority

We are sending you this notice in accordance with 45 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 155.545.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

This page intentionally left blank.



STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211

Decision

Decision Date: May 30, 2018

NY State of Health Account ID [REDACTED]
Appeal Identification Number: AP000000030507



Issues

The issues presented for review by the Appeals Unit of NY State of Health are:

Did NY State of Health (NYSOH) properly terminate your qualified health plan for non-payment of premium effective, January 1, 2018?

Did NYSOH properly determine that you do not qualify to enroll in a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period?

Procedural History

On January 20, 2017, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you were eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost, effective March 1, 2017.

On January 20, 2017, NYSOH issued a plan enrollment notice stating that you were enrolled in a qualified health plan, effective January 1, 2017.

On October 28, 2017, NYSOH issued a renewal notice stating that you were eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost, effective January 1, 2018.

On November 17, 2017, NYSOH issued a plan enrollment notice confirming your enrollment in your qualified health plan, beginning January 1, 2018.

On December 15, 2017, NYSOH issued a disenrollment notice stating that your enrollment in your qualified health plan was terminated, effective January 1, 2018, because a premium payment had not been received by the health plan.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

That notice further directed you to login to your NYSOH account to select a health plan in order for your coverage to begin.

On March 21, 2018, NYSOH received your application for financial assistance.

On March 22, 2018, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that, if you qualified for a Special Enrollment Period, you would be eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost, effective May 1, 2018.

Also on March 22, 2018, NYSOH received your updated application for financial assistance. That day, a preliminary eligibility determination was prepared stating that you did not qualify to select a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period for 2018.

Finally, on March 22, 2018, you spoke to NYSOH's Account Review Unit and appealed your inability to enroll into a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period.

On March 23, 2018, NYSOH issued an eligibility determination notice stating that you do not qualify to select a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period for 2018. It further stated that, if you did qualify for a Special Enrollment Period, you would be eligible to purchase a qualified health plan at full cost, effective May 1, 2018.

On May 18, 2018, you had a telephone hearing with a Hearing Officer from NYSOH's Appeals Unit. The record was developed during the hearing and closed at the end of the hearing.

Findings of Fact

A review of the record supports the following findings of fact:

- 1) You were enrolled into your qualified health plan on January 1, 2017.
- 2) You testified that you contacted your health plan who told you that you were disenrolled because you missed a payment in December 2017.
- 3) According to your NYSOH account, your qualified health plan initiated your disenrollment on December 14, 2017.
- 4) On December 15, 2017, NYSOH issued a disenrollment notice stating that your enrollment in your qualified health plan would end on January 1, 2018, because you did not pay your premium.

- 5) According to your NYSOH account and your testimony, you receive your notices from NYSOH by email.
- 6) You testified that you did not receive the December 15, 2017 notice disenrolling you from your qualified health plan and directing you to select a new plan for your coverage to begin.
- 7) You testified that you set up recurring payments of your monthly premium with your health plan, and you did not realize that you were disenrolled until March 2018.
- 8) On March 22, 2018, you contacted NYSOH to reenroll into a qualified health plan.
- 9) According to your NYSOH account and your testimony, you have been without health insurance since January 1, 2018.
- 10) NYSOH uploaded an evidence packet to your NYSOH account. Contained within that evidence packet under the heading of “electronic notice requirement” is a three-page memorandum dated August 21, 2017. The memorandum sets forth the federal requirements regarding use of electronic communications and asserts that NYSOH is in compliance with federal regulation and guidance on the use of electronic notices. The memorandum asserts that “the electronic notification rules do not require that exchanges track and monitor consumers actual receipt of electronic notices”.
- 11) NYSOH has submitted no evidence that an electronic alert was sent to you regarding the December 15, 2017 disenrollment notice.

Conflicting evidence, if any, was considered and found to be less credible than the evidence noted above.

Applicable Law and Regulations

Appealable Issues

An applicant has the right to appeal to NYSOH’s Appeals Unit: (1) an eligibility determination, including the amount of advance payments of the premium tax credit and level of cost-sharing reductions; (2) a redetermination of eligibility, including the amount of advance payments of the premium tax credit and level of cost-sharing reductions; (3) a failure by NYSOH to provide timely notice of an eligibility determination 45 CFR § 155.505; and (4) a denial of a request for a special enrollment period (45 CFR § 155.505(b)(1)(iii), 45 CFR § 155.305(b), and 45 CFR § 155.420(d)).

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Open Enrollment Period

NYSOH must provide annual open enrollment periods during which time qualified individuals may enroll in a health plan and enrollees may change health plans (45 CFR § 155.410(a)(1)). For the benefit year beginning on January 1, 2018, the national annual open enrollment period began on November 1, 2017 and extended through December 15, 2017 (45 CFR § 155.410(e)(3)). NY State extended this enrollment period through January 31, 2018 for applications processed through NYSOH (https://www.health.ny.gov/press/releases/2017/2017-09-07_open_enrollment_dates.htm).

Special Enrollment Periods

After each open enrollment period ends, NYSOH provides special enrollment periods to qualified individuals. During a special enrollment period, a qualified individual may enroll in a qualified health plan, and an enrollee may change their enrollment to another plan. This is generally permitted when one of the following triggering events occur:

- (1) The qualified individual or his or her dependent either:
 - (i) Loses minimum essential coverage.
 - (ii) Is enrolled in any non-calendar year group health plan or individual health insurance coverage, even if the qualified individual or his or her dependent has the option to renew such coverage.
 - (iii) Loses pregnancy-related coverage.
 - (iv) Loses medically needy coverage as described under section 1902(a)(10)(C) of the Social Security Act only once per calendar year.
- (2)(i) The qualified individual gains a dependent or becomes a dependent through marriage, birth, adoption, placement for adoption, or placement in foster care, or through a child support order or other court order.
 - (ii) the enrollee loses a dependent or is no longer considered a dependent through divorce or legal separation as defined by State law in the State in which the divorce or legal separation occurs, or if the enrollee, or his or her dependent, dies.
- (3) The qualified individual, or his or her dependent, becomes newly eligible for enrollment in a qualified health plan because he or she gains

citizenship, status as a national, or lawful present or is no longer incarcerated.

(4) The qualified individual's or his or her dependent's, enrollment or non-enrollment in a qualified health plan is unintentional, inadvertent, or erroneous and is the result of the error, misrepresentation, misconduct, or inaction of an officer, employee, or agent of NYSOH, its instrumentalities, or a non-NYSOH entity providing enrollment assistance or conducting enrollment activities.

(5) The enrollee or, his or her dependent adequately demonstrates to NYSOH that the qualified health plan in which he or she is enrolled substantially violated a material provision of its contract in relation to the enrollee;

(6) The enrollee or enrollee's dependent is newly eligible or ineligible for advance payments of the premium tax credit, or change in eligibility for cost-sharing reductions.

(7) The qualified individual or enrollee, or his or her dependent, gains access to new qualified health plan as a result of a permanent move and either—

(i) Had minimum essential coverage for one or more days during the 60 days preceding the date of the permanent move, or

(ii) Was living outside of the United States or in a United States territory at the time of the permanent move;

(8) The qualified individual or dependent who gains or maintains status as an Indian may enroll in a qualified health plan or change from one plan to another, once per month.

(9) The qualified individual or enrollee, or his or her dependent, demonstrates to the Exchange, in accordance with guidelines issued by HHS, that the individual meets other exceptional circumstances as the Exchange may provide;

(10) A qualified individual or enrollee—

(i) Is a victim of domestic abuse or spousal abandonment, including a dependent or unmarried victim within a household, is enrolled in minimum essential coverage and seeks to enroll in coverage separate from the perpetrator of the abuse or abandonment; or

(ii) Is a dependent of a victim of domestic abuse or spousal abandonment, on the same application as the victim, may enroll in coverage at the same time as the victim;

(11) A qualified individual or dependent—

(i) Applies for coverage through NYSOH during the annual open enrollment period or due to a qualifying event, is assessed as potentially eligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus and is determined ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus either after open enrollment has ended or more than 60 days after the qualifying event; or

(ii) Applies for coverage at their Local Department of Social Services or Human Resources Administration during the annual open enrollment period, and is determined ineligible for Medicaid or Child Health Plus after open enrollment has ended;

(12) The qualified individual or enrollee, or his or her dependent, adequately demonstrates to NYSOH that a material error related to plan benefits, service area, or premium influenced the qualified individual's or enrollee's decision to purchase a qualified health plan; or

(13) At the option of NYSOH, the qualified individual provides satisfactory documentary evidence to verify his or her eligibility for an insurance affordability program or enrollment following termination of enrollment due to a failure to verify such status within 90 days. NYSOH has not elected to adopt this subsection at this time.

(45 CFR § 155.420(d)).

Generally, if a triggering life event occurs, the qualified individual or enrollee has 60 days from the date of a triggering event to select a qualified health plan (45 CFR § 155.420(c)(1)).

Electronic Notices

Applicants may choose to receive notices and information from NYSOH either by electronic alerts or by regular mail. If the applicant elects to receive electronic notices, NYSOH must send an email or other electronic communication alerting the individual that a notice has been posted to the applicant's account (42 CFR § 600.330(e); 42 CFR § 435.918(b)(4)).

Additionally, if an electronic alert regarding a notice in an individual's NYSOH account fails, NYSOH must send out the notice by regular mail within three days of the failed alert (42 CFR § 435.918(b)(5)).

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY - Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Legal Analysis

The first issue under review is whether NYSOH properly terminated your qualified health plan for non-payment of premium effective, January 1, 2018.

You were enrolled into your qualified health plan on January 1, 2017. You testified that you contacted your health plan who told you that you were disenrolled because you missed a payment in December 2017.

On December 15, 2017, NYSOH issued a notice stating that you were disenrolled from your health plan for non-payment of the premium, effective January 1, 2018.

NYSOH Appeals Unit only has the authority to review issues related to the following: (1) an eligibility determination, including the amount of advance payments of the premium tax credit and level of cost-sharing reductions, (2) a redetermination of eligibility, including the amount of advance payments of the premium tax credit and level of cost-sharing reductions, (3) a failure to provide timely notice of an eligibility determination, and (4) a denial of a special enrollment period.

Since the Appeals Unit is not given the authority to review termination of enrollment due to non-payment of premiums, we cannot reach the merits as to whether you were properly terminated from your health plan for non-payment of premiums. Therefore, your appeal of the December 15, 2017 cancellation notice is DISMISSED as a non-appealable issue.

The second issue under review is whether NYSOH properly determined that you do not qualify to enroll in a qualified health plan outside of the open enrollment period.

NYSOH provided an open enrollment period from November 1, 2017 until January 31, 2018.

On March 22, 2018, after the open enrollment period ended, you submitted a request to reenroll in a qualified health plan.

Once the annual open enrollment period ends, a health plan enrollee must qualify for a special enrollment period in order to enroll in, or change to another health plan offered in NYSOH. To qualify for a special enrollment period, a person must experience a triggering event.

You testified that you did not receive the December 15, 2017 notice disenrolling you from your qualified health plan, effective January 1, 2018. You testified that you set up recurring payments of your monthly premium with your health plan, and you did not realize that you were disenrolled until March 2018.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

You testified, and your NYSOH account reflects, that you received your notices from NYSOH by electronic alert. Although NYSOH contends that it complied with federal mandates regarding electronic notices, there is no evidence in the file that NYSOH sent you an electronic alert notifying you of a new notice available in your account on December 15, 2017. You testified that you did not receive an electronic alert regarding the December 15, 2017 disenrollment notice, which stated that your enrollment with your qualified health plan ended on January 1, 2018, and directed you to select a plan in order for your enrollment to begin. There is also no evidence in your account documenting that any email alert was sent to you regarding the notice or that any such electronic alert failed, such that the notice was later sent to you by regular mail.

NYSOH is required to send applicants proper notice in order for applicants to take appropriate action. Since there is no evidence that NYSOH sent you an email alert, and you testified that you did not receive one, there is insufficient evidence in the record that NYSOH provided you by electronic means with proper notice that you needed to submit documentation of your household income.

Accordingly, the record indicates that your non-enrollment into a qualified health plan during the open enrollment period was the direct result of NYSOH's failure to provide you with proper notice, you should have been granted a special enrollment period as of your March 22, 2018 application.

Therefore, NYSOH's March 23, 2018 eligibility determination that you do not qualify to select a health plan outside of the open enrollment period for 2018 is MODIFIED to reflect that you are eligible for a special enrollment period as of the date of your March 23, 2018 application.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to assist you in enrolling into a qualified health plan. You may choose to enroll into a qualified health plan as of March 23, 2018, because NYSOH did not provide you with proper notice. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll into coverage within 60 days from the date of this decision.

Decision

Your appeal of the insurer's termination of your enrollment in your qualified health plan for non-payment of premiums, effective January 1, 2018, is DISMISSED as a non-appealable issue.

The March 23, 2018 eligibility determination stating you do not qualify to select a health plan outside of the open enrollment period for 2018 is MODIFIED to reflect

that you are eligible for a special enrollment period as of the date of your March 22, 2018 application.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to assist you in enrolling into a qualified health plan. You may choose to enroll into a qualified health plan as of March 22, 2018, because NYSOH did not provide you with proper notice. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll into coverage within 60 days from the date of this decision.

Effective Date of this Decision: May 30, 2018

How this Decision Affects Your Eligibility

NYSOH improperly denied you a special enrollment period.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to allow you to enroll into coverage as of March 22, 2018, if you so choose. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll into coverage within 60 days from the date of this decision.

You will be responsible for any premium payments for any months you are enrolled into coverage.

If You Disagree with this Decision (Appeal Rights)

If applicable, if you think a portion of your appeal should not be dismissed, you can ask us to vacate, or cancel, this dismissal. You must ask us in writing within 30 days after the date on this notice, showing good cause as to why the dismissal should be vacated. NYSOH's Appeals Unit will review your request. If your request is approved, another hearing will be scheduled for you. If your request is denied, NYSOH will tell you in writing. If you do not respond to the dismissed portion of your appeal within 30 days, your appeal will remain dismissed, and NYSOH will take no further action on your appeal.

Insofar as your case was decided, the Decision is final unless you submit an appeal request to the Federal Marketplace or bring a lawsuit under New York Civil Practice Law and Rules, Article 78.

You may bring a lawsuit on any Appeals Unit decision in New York State court in accordance with Article 78 of the New York Civil Practice Law and Rules. This must be done within four months of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision.

Additionally, Appeals Unit decisions on issues involving eligibility for qualified health plans, advance premium tax credits, and cost-sharing reductions may be appealed to the Federal Marketplace. This must be done within 30 days of the Decision Date, which appears on the first page of this Decision (45 CFR § 155.520(c)).

If you have questions about appealing to the Federal Marketplace, you can contact them in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-800-318-2596
- By mail at:
Health Insurance Marketplace
Attn: Appeals
465 Industrial Blvd.
London, KY 40750-0061
- By fax: 1-877-369-0129

If you wish to be represented by an attorney in bringing an outside appeal and do not know how to go about getting one, you may contact legal resources available to you. You may, for example, contact the local County Bar Association, Legal Aid, or Legal Services.

If You Have Questions about this Decision (Customer Service Resources):

You can contact us in any of the following ways:

- By calling the Customer Service Center at 1-855-355-5777
- By mail at:
NY State of Health Appeals
P.O. Box 11729
Albany, NY 12211
- By fax: 1-855-900-5557

Summary

Your appeal of the insurer's termination of your enrollment in your qualified health plan for non-payment of premiums, effective January 1, 2018, is **DISMISSED** as a non-appealable issue.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

The March 23, 2018 eligibility determination stating you do not qualify to select a health plan outside of the open enrollment period for 2018 is MODIFIED to reflect that you are eligible for a special enrollment period as of the date of your March 22, 2018 application.

Your case is RETURNED to NYSOH to assist you in enrolling into a qualified health plan. You may choose to enroll into a qualified health plan as of March 22, 2018, because NYSOH did not provide you with proper notice. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll into coverage within 60 days from the date of this decision.

NYSOH improperly denied you a special enrollment period.

Your case is being sent back to NYSOH to allow you to enroll into coverage as of March 22, 2018, if you so choose. In the alternative, you may elect to enroll into coverage within 60 days from the date of this decision.

You will be responsible for any premium payments for any months you are enrolled into coverage.

Legal Authority

We are issuing this determination in accordance with 45 CFR § 155.545.

A Copy of this Decision Has Been Provided To:



Getting Help in a Language Other than English

This is an important document. If you need help to understand it, please call 1-855-355-5777. We can give you an interpreter for free in the language you speak.

Español (Spanish)

Este es un documento importante. Si necesita ayuda para entenderlo, llame al 1-855-355-5777. Le proporcionaremos un intérprete sin ningún costo.

中文 (Traditional Chinese)

這是重要的文件。如果您需要獲得關於瞭解文件內容方面的協助，請致電 1-855-355-5777。我們可以為您免費提供您所使用語言的翻譯人員。

Kreyòl Ayisyen (Haitian Creole)

Sa a se yon dokiman ki enpòtan. Si ou bezwen èd pou konprann li, tanpri rele nimewo 1-855-355-5777. Nou kapab ba ou yon entèprèt gratis nan lang ou pale a.

中文 (Simplified Chinese)

这是一份重要的文件。如果您需要帮助理解此文件，请打电话至 1-855-355-5777。我们可以为您提供相应语种的口译服务。

Italiano (Italian)

Questo è un documento importante. Per qualsiasi chiarimento può chiamare il numero 1-855-355-5777. Possiamo metterle a disposizione un interprete nella sua lingua.

한국어 (Korean)

중요한 서류입니다. 이해하는 데 도움이 필요하시면 1-855-355-5777 번으로 연락해 주십시오. 귀하의 언어에 대한 무료 통역 서비스가 제공됩니다.

Русский (Russian)

Это важный документ. Если Вам нужна помощь для понимания этого документа, позвоните по телефону 1-855-355-5777. Мы можем бесплатно предоставить Вам переводчика Вашего языка.

العربية (Arabic)

هذه وثيقة مهمة. إذا كنت بحاجة إلى مساعدة لفهم محتواها، يُرجى الاتصال بالرقم 1-855-355-5777. يُمكننا توفير مترجم فوري لك باللغة التي تتحدثها مجاناً.

বাংলা (Bengali)

এটি এক গুরুত্বপূর্ণ নথি। এটি বুঝতে আপনার যদি সাহায্যের প্রয়োজন হয় তাহলে, অনুগ্রহ করে 1-855-355-5777 নম্বরে কল করুন। আপনি যে ভাষায় কথা বলেন বিনামূল্যে আমরা আপনাকে একজন দোভাষী দিতে পারি।

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).

Français (French)

Ceci est un document important. Si vous avez besoin d'aide pour en comprendre le contenu, appelez le 1-855-355-5777. Nous pouvons mettre gratuitement à votre disposition un interprète dans votre langue.

हिंदी (Hindi)

यह एक महत्वपूर्ण दस्तावेज़ है। अगर आपको इसे समझने में सहायता चाहिए, तो कृपया 1-855-355-5777 पर कॉल करें। हम आपकी भाषा बोलने वाला एक दुभाषिया निःशुल्क उपलब्ध करवा सकते हैं।

日本語 (Japanese)

これは重要な書類です。理解するために支援が必要な場合は、1-855-355-5777 にお電話ください。通訳を無料で提供いたします。

नेपाली (Nepali)

यो एउटा महत्वपूर्ण कागजात हो। यसलाई बुझ्न तपाईंलाई मदद चाहिन्छ भने, कृपया 1-855-355-5777 मा फोन गर्नुहोस्। हामीले तपाईंले बोल्ने भाषामा तपाईंलाई निःशुल्क दोभाषे उपलब्ध गराउन सक्छौं।

Polski (Polish)

To jest ważny dokument. W przypadku konieczności skorzystania z pomocy w celu zrozumienia jego treści należy zadzwonić pod numer 1-855-355-5777. Istnieje możliwość uzyskania bezpłatnej usługi tłumacza języka, którym się posługujesz.

Twi (Twi)

Krataa yi ye tow krataa a ho hia. Se wo hia eho nkyerekyeremu a, ye sre wo, fre 1-855-355-5777. y&b&tumi ama wo obi a okyer& kasa a woka no ase ama wo kwa a wontua hwee.

(Urdu) اردو

یہ ایک اہم دستاویز ہے۔ اگر آپ کو اسے سمجھنے کے لیے مدد کی ضرورت ہے تو براہ کرم 1-855-355-5777 پر کال کریں۔ ہم آپ کو آپ کی مادری زبان میں ایک مفت مترجم فراہم کر سکتے ہیں۔

Tiếng Việt (Vietnamese)

Đây là tài liệu quan trọng. Nếu quý vị cần trợ giúp để hiểu tài liệu này, vui lòng gọi 1-855-355-5777. Chúng tôi có thể cung cấp thông dịch viên miễn phí nói ngôn ngữ của quý vị.

אידיש (Yiddish)

דאס איז א וויכטיגער דאקומענט. אויב איר דארפט הילף עס צו פארשטיין, ביטע רופט 1-855-355-5777. מיר קענען אייך געבן א דאלמעטשער פריי פון אפצאל אין די שפראך וואס איר רעדט.

If you need this information in a language other than English or you need assistance reading this notice, we can help you. Call 1-855-355-5777 (TTY - English: 1-800-662-1220) (TTY – Spanish: 1-877-662-4886).